



Attachment IV

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, June 23, 2016, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA94541**

MEETING

A regular meeting of the Hayward Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chair Parso-York.

ROLL CALL

Present: COMMISSIONERS: Willis Jr., Goldstein, McDermott, Faria
CHAIRPERSON: Parso-York
Absent: COMMISSIONER: Enders, Schott

SALUTE TO FLAG

Commissioner Faria led in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Staff Members Present: Ajello, Alvarado Jr., Camire, Chan, Hamilton, Rizk,

General Public Present: 9

PUBLIC COMMENT:

There were none.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: For agenda item No. 1 and agenda Item No. 2, the Planning Commission may make a recommendation to the City Council. For agenda item No. 3, the decision of the Planning Commission is final unless appealed. The appeal period is 10 days from the date of the decision. If appealed, a public hearing will be scheduled before the City Council for final decision

1. Recommended approval and necessary actions of proposed project at 25906 Gading Road for twenty detached single-family homes on a 1.75-acre site, including for a Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program; Tony Dutra, Gading Ventures, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Senior Planner Ajello provided a synopsis of the staff report and a presentation.

Chair Parso-York opened and closed the public hearing at 7:08 p.m.

Commissioner Faria commented on a correction to the language for recommended condition #91 regarding CO² detectors to have the word 'shall' instead of 'should' and expressed concern as to whether or not there would be sufficient clearance for pedestrians



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, June 23, 2016, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA94541**

to safely walk past the driveways when vehicles are parked in the shorter driveways that extend into the street. Senior Planner Ajello responded that the concern could be addressed in the Homeowners' Association's CC&Rs and also noted that the City's traffic engineers reviewed the plans and did not indicate any traffic or pedestrian concerns. Senior Planner Ajello further added that there would be a sidewalk on the south side of the private street to provide pedestrian connectivity to the sidewalk along Gading Road.

Commissioner Willis asked if the roofs on the homes would be oriented to maximize solar access and if there would be a location within the development where the HOA could hold its meetings. Mr. Tony Dutra with Gading Ventures LLC and Jill Williams with KTGy said the orientation of the development is well suited for the use of solar panels as the rooflines orient to the south. Mr. Dutra confirmed that the units would all be pre-wired to accommodate electric vehicle charging units and that there would be a homeowners' association. Mr. Dutra went on to note that, in addition to the private and common open space within the development, there were several park facilities and a community center in close proximity to the site that could be used for HOA meetings if desired.

Mr. Dutra thanked staff for their efforts, hard work and their assistance on this project and thanked the Commission.

Commissioner McDermott spoke highly of the Dutra family and how she has known them for a long time. Ms. McDermott commented that the Dutra family has made a positive impact to the communities in which it has developed. Ms. McDermott said it was vital to have open greenspace for children and families and was glad that Mr. Dutra is putting in a park since the yards are small. Ms. McDermott went on to state that she was in support of the project.

Commissioner Willis Jr. made a motion to approve the staff recommendation. Commissioner McDermott seconded the motion. The motion passed with the following vote:

AYES:	Commissioners Willis Jr., Goldstein, McDermott, Faria Chair Parso-York
NOES:	None
ABSENT:	Enders, Schott
ABSTAIN:	

2. Recommended approval and necessary actions of proposed Zone Change from Single-Family Residential to Medium Density Residential at 619 Shepherd Avenue to allow the potential for up to two additional dwelling units on a 0.21 acre site; Thinh Duc Nguyen (Owner/Applicant)



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, June 23, 2016, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA94541**

Associate Planner Hamilton provided a synopsis of the staff report.

Chair Parso-York opened and closed the public hearing at 7:21 p.m.

Associate Planner Hamilton responded to Commissioner Faria that staff had not received any feedback from the community in response to the Public Hearing Notices that had been mailed out.

Associate Planner Hamilton responded to Commissioner Goldstein that tonight's action is only for the zone change and that any future development of the property will be subject to a site plan review and confirmed that additional Public Hearing Notices will be sent out at that point.

Associate Planner Hamilton responded to Commissioner McDermott that if the owner decides to build additional structures on the site, then as per the City's parking requirement there would have to be additional parking provided.

Commissioner McDermott made a motion to approve per the staff recommendation. Commissioner Willis Jr. seconded the motion.

The motion passed with the following vote:

AYES:	Commissioners Willis Jr., Goldstein, McDermott, Faria Chair Parso-York
NOES:	None
ABSENT:	Enders, Schott
ABSTAIN:	None

3. Recommended approval of a self-service automated car wash at an existing automobile service station located at 391 West A Street; Daljit Singh for New Rasa Enterprises (Owner/Applicant)

Associate Planner Camire provided a synopsis of the staff report and a presentation.

Chair Parso-York opened the public hearing at 7:34 p.m.

Project architect, Mr. James Chao noted that the orientation of the project to Arbor Avenue was done to eliminate the need for car wash customers to turn around who want to go across Arbor Avenue to the future auto detailing center. Mr. Chao said the applicant accepts all the conditions except for two and requested the removal of Conditions of Approval #11 regarding the closing of the entrance and exit doors and #15 regarding the monument sign. Mr. Chao



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, June 23, 2016, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA94541**

said at a similar project the acoustical engineer conducted a noise study which revealed that with eight foot high wall and eight inch thick concrete walls there would not be any sound impacts to the surrounding neighborhood, noting that these sound mitigation features are included in the proposed project. Mr. Chao said his main concern is safety and it would not be safe to close the entrance and exit doors while the car wash is in operation, which could cause a panic situation for a distracted driver. He also does not want to consistently open and close the doors because of the wear and tear on the doors. Mr. Chao said for Condition #15 regarding removing the monument sign, the applicant wanted to have a monument sign to advertise the car wash prices. Planning Manager Buizer point out that the conditions numbers referred to by Mr. Chao reflect a previous draft version and that he was actually referring to recommended Condition of Approval #10 and #14.

The applicant Mr. Daljit Singh thanked the Commission and staff for their help.

Associate Planner Camire pointed out that the last recommended condition of approval requires a noise analysis be done after the car wash operation begins and that if the ambient noise exceeded 75 decibels, then the car wash entrance and exit doors would need to be closed. Ms. Camire said that staff agrees to remove Condition of Approval #10 –closing of entrance and exit doors, due to the last recommended condition of approval. Ms. Camire said Condition of Approval #14 was recommended to be retained as there were already two monument signs.

Chair Parso-York closed the public hearing at 7:42 p.m.

Commissioner Willis Jr. said this was a good project for the area but was concerned about the noise level created by the dryers. Mr. Chao confirmed that the project includes eight foot high and eight inches thick concrete sound walls which would serve as a noise mitigation measure. Associate Planner Camire said based on increased insulation and information based on the sound study by the manufacturer, staff felt there would not be noise impacts that would be above the ambient noise level of 75 decibels. Ms. Camire reiterated the recommended condition requiring a noise study to be conducted after the car wash operation begins.

Associate Planner Camire responded to Commissioner Faria that staff had not received any feedback from the community in the form of emails or phone calls. Ms. Camire noted that while at the site earlier in the day, she spoke to neighbors who said they welcome the car wash and they would utilize the service.

Mr. Chao responded to Commissioner McDermott that the operation is called a roll over car wash and is an automated operation. Mr. Chao described the car wash operation and purchasing options. Mr. Chao said 80% of the water is recycled and described the recycling operation indicating that there is no run off or pollution to the Bay. Ms. McDermott wanted to



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, June 23, 2016, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA94541**

retain the condition of approval about the hours of operation and the 9:00 p.m. closing time was reasonable because of the surrounding residential neighborhood and also wants to retain the condition for the noise study.

Associate Planner Camire reminded the Commission to remove Condition of Approval #10 regarding the closing of the car wash entrance and exit doors.

Mr. Singh explained to Commissioner McDermott the option of how to pay for a car wash without getting out of your car and that one could drive over to the future auto detail center for additional services.

Commissioner Willis Jr. made a motion to approve the staff recommendation with revised Conditions of Approval by removing Condition of Approval #10, pertaining to the closing of entrance and exit doors during car wash operations.

Commissioner Faria seconded the motion

The motion passed with the following vote:

AYES:	Commissioners Willis Jr., Goldstein, McDermott, Faria Chair Parso-York
NOES:	None
ABSENT:	Enders, Schott
ABSTAIN:	None

COMMISSION REPORTS

4. Oral Report on Planning and Zoning Matters
There were no staff announcements on such matters.

Assistant City Attorney Alvarado thanked the Planning Commission for allowing him to participate in Planning Commission meetings and that he had enjoyed working with the Commission. Mr. Alvarado announced that this will be his last Planning Commission meeting as he will be taking the position of City Attorney for the City of East Palo Alto. Mr. Alvarado said that Assistant City Attorney Brick will be taking over the Planning Commission duties for the City Attorney's Office.

5. Commissioners' Announcements, Referrals
There were none.



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, June 23, 2016, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA94541**

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

6. Approval of Minutes of the Planning Commission Meeting on May 26, 2016
**Faria Jr. Approves (AYES: Willis Jr., Goldstein, Parso-York, McDermott, Faria;
ABSENT: Enders, Schott)**

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Parso-York adjourned the meeting at 8:02 p.m.

APPROVED:

Brian Schott, Secretary
Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Denise Chan, Senior Secretary
Office of the City Clerk