



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, December 12, 2019, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA 94541**

MEETING

A regular meeting of the Hayward Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chair Bonilla.

CALL TO ORDER Pledge of Allegiance

Commissioner Andrews led the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Present: COMMISSIONERS: Andrews, Faria, Patton, Roche, Goldstein
CHAIRPERSON: Bonilla
Absent: COMMISSIONER: Stevens

Staff Members Present: Brick, Buizer, Chan, Grucky, Pearson

General Public Present: 1

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Mr. Jonathan Tonel with Climate Corps America is interested in how greenhouse gas emissions will be changing for the City.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: For agenda item No. 1, the decision of the Planning Commission may make a recommendation to the City Council.

1. Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Goals

Environmental Services Manager Pearson introduced the item and provided a history of the City of Hayward's 2009 Climate Action Plan which was incorporated into the General Plan in 2014. Mr. Pearson said because of the changes in State legislation that has occurred the past couple of years and the Mayor and Council's commitment to significantly reduce greenhouse gas emissions (GHG), staff felt it was appropriate to revisit the Climate Action Plan.

Sustainability Specialist Grucky provided a synopsis of the staff report and a PowerPoint presentation. Ms. Grucky spoke about the staff's recommendation provided in Version 2 of the General Plan Amendment, which shows the change from the 50% to 55% reduction in GHG by 2030.



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, December 12, 2019, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA 94541**

Commissioner Patton stated that the City's transition to all-electric can be accomplished and spoke about having requirements in the General Plan that addresses the requirements for all-electric developments and EV charging stations. Environmental Services Manager Pearson responded that the original Climate Action Plan suggested a community choice aggregation program which led to the formation of the East Bay Community Energy (EBCE) program which addresses one of the City's GHG emissions. Mr. Pearson said the City is currently developing a three-year guide Strategic Roadmap which Council will be utilizing as a guide for budget decisions in early 2020. The Strategic Roadmap contains priority projects relating to both electrifying the fleet as well as providing more EV charge stations for the City. Mr. Pearson said that staff is currently discussing with the Council Sustainability Committee a proposed reach code which will be the City's amendment to the State Building Code. The proposed reach code goes beyond the State's minimum development requirements and will set the requirements of all-electric for buildings three stories or less and for taller buildings there can be a gas option but then the developer will be required to include more energy efficiency measures. Planning Manager Buizer shared that the City convened the Council for Infill Builders and the outcome was recommendations to incentivize housing production and development in the City. This included all-electric developments as an option for developers to save on construction costs then the developers could offer more energy efficient elements.

Commissioner Andrews shared that when she asked a developer why they did not have all-electric utilities for a three story or less development, the developer's response was that future residents still want to have the gas option.

Environmental Services Manager Pearson said there is concern from residents about losing the gas option and said it is necessary to inform the public about the new technology for an all-electric home. He shared that staff is looking into a loaner program for residents to try out the new electric induction technology. Ms. Andrews commented about the decrease in State and Federal rebates for electric cars occurring while the City is implementing the reduction in GHG emission goals. Mr. Pearson said as the City adopts more aggressive GHG emission goals this will send a message to the State and other agencies. In response to Ms. Andrews' inquiry about a City sponsored shuttle program, Mr. Pearson said that the City has not been able to identify funding for a shuttle program and Planning Manager Buizer said the challenges has been in trying to identify both funding and interest. Ms. Buizer said staff will continue to work with transit partners, such as AC Transit, to find a solution rather than take away from AC Transit's revenue stream by trying to implement separate shuttle programs. Ms. Buizer said staff can work with developers to see how they can electrify their fleet in the industrial area and come up with creative methods of how to incentivize developers to work towards reducing GHG emissions.



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION**

Council Chambers

Thursday, December 12, 2019, 7:00 p.m.

777 B Street, Hayward, CA 94541

Commissioner Roche commented that the City needs to take an aggressive approach to get people out of their cars to help reach the reduction in GHG emissions goals and to continue looking at transit alternatives as grants can become available to assist with these endeavors.

Commissioner Goldstein spoke about the other point of view regarding the amount of electricity generated by car batteries that will actually add to the GHG emissions and expressed concern about the impact to the environment as when these batteries are recycled this can create a huge dumping ground of hazardous waste in the United States. Mr. Goldstein asked what research has been conducted about the effectiveness of projects to reduce GHG emissions. Environmental Services Manager Pearson said the government will have to work with car manufacturers to recycle or dispose of the batteries correctly. Mr. Pearson said that the City Council has selected a 100% carbon free electricity product for the City and that EBCE will continue to provide cleaner electricity going into the future. Mr. Pearson said staff is always communicating with other agencies and regional partners and keeping an eye out for best practices. Mr. Goldstein would like to recommend that since the City will be electrifying the fleet, that the City should be mindful about the increase of hazardous waste derived from the disposal of the EV batteries. Mr. Pearson said once these targets are adopted by City Council, staff will be working on amendments to the General Plan and the Climate Action Plan to develop a roadmap to meet the 2030 GHG emissions goal and staff can incorporate additional policies.

Assistant City Attorney Brick said that Commissioner Goldstein can recommend to Council to have staff study the issue of additional hazardous waste and develop standards that can mitigate any problems that they find.

Commissioner Faria thanked staff for the information about solar rebates as this knowledge can help residents determine if they can afford the conversion to solar. Ms. Faria said the commute traffic is a major issue which adds to the GHG emissions. Ms. Faria asked if there have been any studies conducted on transportation alternatives to crossing the San Mateo Bridge. Environmental Services Manager Pearson responded that there have been discussions about extending a rail parallel to the Dumbarton Bridge. Sustainability Specialist Grucky noted that staff's GHG emissions data includes the commute traffic calculations.

Chair Bonilla said different cities have different reduction of GHG emissions goals and asked how the City is working regionally to address these issues, Sustainability Specialist Grucky said the City is working closely with Alameda County and StopWaste on both waste and energy related items. Mr. Bonilla said it's going to take a regional approach to reach these goals and asked what other methods are being used to help incentivize the reduction of GHG emissions in other communities. Environmental Services Manager Pearson shared



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, December 12, 2019, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA 94541**

that other communities have instituted regulations requiring improvements to existing buildings. Mr. Pearson said that a significant change will be to require the transition to all-electric appliances such as water heaters and stoves when the old appliances need to be replaced. In response to Mr. Bonilla's question about the aggressive goals for the reduction of the GHG emissions, Ms. Grucky said the City sets aggressive goals which provides staff with the leverage to create policies and programs to meet those goals.

Chair Bonilla opened and closed the public hearing at 7:41 p.m.

Commissioner Roche recommended to have the electricity provider be as carbon neutral as possible.

Environmental Services Manager Pearson pointed out that staff has provided the Commissioners with copies of General Plan Amendment that includes Version 2 for a change from 50% to 55% goal for the reduction in GHG emissions. Staff recommended the 55% reduction goal as this will align the City with State law which can help with the review of development projects.

Commissioner Goldstein made a motion to approve the staff recommendation for Version 2 for the higher 55% goal for the reduction in GHG emissions, have staff research the consequences of hazardous waste disposal of batteries for both home and EV and what other communities are doing to mitigate this risk.

Commissioner Roche seconded the motion and offered a friendly amendment that the City maintains the commitment that the City's energy provider be as carbon neutral as possible.

Commissioner Goldstein accepted the friendly amendment.

The motion carried with the following vote:

AYES:	Commissioners Andrews, Faria, Patton, Roche, Goldstein Chair Bonilla
NOES:	None
ABSENT:	Stevens
ABSTAIN:	None

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

2. Approval of the Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of November 14, 2019



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF HAYWARD PLANNING COMMISSION
Council Chambers
Thursday, December 12, 2019, 7:00 p.m.
777 B Street, Hayward, CA 94541**

Commissioner Andrews made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Faria, to approve the Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of November 14, 2019. The motion passed with the following votes:

- AYES: Commissioners Andrews, Faria, Patton, Roche, Goldstein
Chair Bonilla
NOES: None
ABSENT: Stevens
ABSTAIN: None

COMMISSION REPORTS

Oral Report on Planning and Zoning Matters:

Planning Manager Buizer reminded the Commissioners of the Mayor’s Boards and Commissions Reception on Friday, December 14, 2019.

Commissioners’ Announcements, Referrals:

None.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Bonilla adjourned the meeting at 7:52 p.m.

APPROVED:

Julie Roche, Secretary
Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Denise Chan, Senior Secretary
Office of the City Clerk