



**DATE:** February 27, 2018  
**TO:** Mayor and City Council  
**FROM:** Interim Director of Public Works  
**SUBJECT** Downtown Parking Management Plan

### **RECOMMENDATION**

That Council reviews and provides comments on the Recommended Parking Demand Management Strategies for Downtown Hayward.

### **SUMMARY**

The Downtown Parking Management Plan provides strategy recommendations to more efficiently utilize the existing parking supply in Downtown Hayward. These recommendations were developed after a study of the existing and near-term Downtown parking needs. This report also includes feedback and direction received from the January 24, 2018, Council Infrastructure Committee (CIC) meeting. Contingent upon additional feedback and approval from Council, a year-long pilot program is proposed in the study area to evaluate the recommendations.

### **BACKGROUND**

In fall of 2014, BART began the implementation of paid parking at the Hayward BART station. In response, pursuant to Council direction, staff implemented the following interim parking strategies to mitigate potential impacts to the Downtown parking supply:

- 4-hour parking restrictions in the City Hall parking structure and in the commercial and residential areas west of the BART station
- 2-hour on-street parking restrictions within a quarter mile radius of the Downtown Hayward BART station
- Enhanced enforcement to ensure adherence to time restrictions

In addition to the interim strategies, long-term, comprehensive parking policies were deemed critical to the growth and development of the Downtown area. The consulting firm, CDM Smith (CDM), was brought onboard and tasked with working with City staff to develop the Downtown Parking Management Plan with an objective to protect the valuable City-provided Downtown Parking resources from day-long use by BART patrons and other private park and ride users that will not contribute to the economic vitality of the

Downtown. The purpose of these resources is to support and enhance Downtown as a place where local employees, customers, residents and visitors can find convenient parking to suit their specific needs, while they are spending time in the Downtown.

The goal of the study was to ensure that existing parking regulations aligned with current demand, and to propose updates to those regulations and strategies to improve parking demand management in the Downtown area. CDM conducted a study that reviewed and expanded upon the initial 2015 report on parking space occupancy and utilization of both on-street and off-street public parking facilities owned and operated by the City in Downtown and the nearby BART station area. This study focused on both peak period occupancy and high demand areas during off-peak periods (See Page 3 of Attachment II). Some key findings include:

- The midday period (12:00 PM) consistently displayed the highest parking occupancy
- On-street parking occupancy was highest in the business core area along B Street, A Street, Watkins Street, and Main Street with peak occupancies exceeding practical capacity of 85%
- High demand was also observed in the residential areas to the west of the BART station
- Off-street parking facilities, such as City Hall Garage, has 60% and Cinema Place Garage has 72% parking occupancy during weekday peak periods. In addition, Muni lots, such as Lot 7, 11, 13, and Five Flags Lot has the highest occupancy during the weekday peak period.
- During weekends, off-street parking facilities, such as the Cinema Place Garage and Muni Lots in the core area, exceeded a practical capacity of 85%

This study developed a detailed set of comprehensive parking management strategies and policies, and is particularly timely because of upcoming residential and mixed-use projects that will increase the need for parking and will potentially impact parking in the Downtown.

## **DISCUSSION**

The findings and recommendations of the study are incorporated in the Hayward Downtown Area Parking Management Plan (Attachment II). It includes the following components:

### **1. Parking Time Restrictions**

Time restrictions are proposed as an efficient parking management policy to shift the parking demand from overutilized on-street facilities to off-street facilities, and increase turnover in high demand areas. The overarching objective of parking restrictions include: (1) discouraging long-term BART parking; (2) discouraging long-term employee parking in core areas; and (3) incentivizing employees to use Muni lots where unrestricted permit parking is allowed.

The following strategies and recommendations were developed for on-street and off-street facilities after extensive analysis of the existing parking behavior throughout the study area (See Page 7 of CDM Report's Executive Summary, Attachment II). Refer to the Permit Parking Policy section for further information on Residential and Business permits.

### ***On-Street Restrictions***

#### **One-hour parking**

One-hour parking restrictions are recommended on B Street and Main Street where parking is in high demand.

These restrictions will increase prime location turnover in the in the commercial area to accommodate short-term customers/visitors.

#### **Two-hour parking along with permits to allow unrestricted parking to residents**

Two-hour parking restrictions are recommended on the streets along A Street, Watkins Street, C Street, and Montgomery Avenue.

The mixed residential and commercial land uses in this area create a high demand for parking. Residents with permits would not be subjected to time restrictions.

#### **Two-hour parking along with permits to allow unrestricted parking to residents and employees**

Two-hour parking restrictions are also recommended on B Street and Grand Street west of the BART station.

This area has mixed residential and commercial land uses and consistently attracts BART patrons due to its proximity to the station. Because the Muni lots are not in accessible distance, residents and employees with permits would not be subjected to on-street time restrictions.

#### **Four-hour parking along with permits to allow unrestricted parking to residents**

Four-hour parking restrictions are recommended in the residential area west of Grand Street.

BART patrons heavily impact this residential area. Residents with permits would not be subjected to time restrictions.

The CIC agreed with the proposed on-street time restrictions.

## ***Off-Street Restrictions***

### **Four-hour parking along with permits to allow unrestricted parking to employees**

Four-hour parking restrictions are recommended in all the Muni lots. Business employees with permits would not be subjected to time restriction in these lots. A limited number of spaces would be reserved for employees in the Cinema garage.

This recommendation simplifies the complex time restrictions currently in place in these facilities. Additionally, providing business permits would provide viable parking options for employees and incentivize them to not use high demand on-street parking.

The CIC agreed with and recommended approval of the proposed off-street time restrictions.

## **2. Permit Parking Policy**

Permit parking programs are effective parking demand management tools that ensure efficient use of the City's limited public parking resources. Parking permits can be used to manage this demand by directing user groups, such as employees and residents, into the spaces most appropriate for their needs. Two types of permits are proposed: a) residential permits, and b) business or employee permits.

These strategies were developed after benchmarking and discussions with many cities that have successfully implemented parking permit programs in the Bay Area, such as Oakland, Berkeley, Emeryville, San Leandro, Union City, San Francisco, San Jose, Palo Alto, and Sacramento. In all cases, the proposed pricing policies are staff's recommendations.

The CIC recommended a lower, simplified rate structure discussed at the end of this section on Page 5.

### **Residential Parking Permits**

A Residential Preferential Parking (RPP) permit program will protect on-street parking from intrusion by BART patrons and Downtown Hayward employees. The program is designed to discourage residents from using street parking for more than one car per household.

Pricing Policy:

- First permit free, second permit \$150 per year
- Limit of two permits per household
- Guest permits – 5-day limit - \$5.00 per permit

Because the City has taken the initiative to implement this RPP zone, unlike other zones where residents initiate the request, the first permit is proposed to be free of charge. Other

Bay Area cities charge anywhere from \$20 to \$160 for second permits. Staff's proposed pricing of \$150 for second permits reflects the unique need to balance parking requirements in areas of diverse land use, and to discourage multiple vehicle ownership in Downtown Hayward, which is a transit-oriented zone.

### **Business Parking Permits**

A new Business Parking Permit program is proposed to accommodate Downtown Hayward business employees in off-street parking facilities and designated zones to the west of the BART station. These permits will shift long-term employee parking away from highly utilized on-street parking facilities.

#### **Pricing Policy:**

- 0-5 permits - \$25 per year per permit
- 5-10 permits - \$40 per year per permit
- 10-20 permits - \$60 per year per permit
- Limit of 20 permits per business

The proposed permit prices are relatively inexpensive to encourage participation by businesses. The charges increase with the number of employees per business to more equitably distribute permits amongst all Downtown businesses. The limit of 20 permits is proposed since, currently, out of seventy-one Downtown employers, only eleven have more than 20 employees, and these employers typically have their own off-street parking.

The CIC recognized the need to implement the permit parking policy. However, the Committee recommended a consistent and simplified cost structure irrespective of the type of permit - \$50 per year per permit for both residential and commercial uses. Additionally, the Committee recommended charging for the first residential permit after the pilot year.

### **3. Enforcement**

Enforcement is a necessary component of a successful parking management system. Field observations and analysis of citations indicate that enhanced enforcement efforts aided by available technology and adequate staffing would help achieve good levels of parking access for all users.

#### **Technology**

The purchase and utilization of enforcement vehicles equipped with License Plate Recognition (LPR) equipment would greatly enhance enforcement efforts. The LPR system aids enforcement by replacing the conventional "chalking" method.

## **Staffing**

Currently, parking enforcement efforts citywide are conducted primarily by a contract employee who is tasked with enforcing the existing eight RPP areas, the Downtown area, and the South Hayward BART RPP area. This lone contract employee cannot adequately enforce parking regulations in all these areas. Additionally, the upcoming two major developments near Downtown Hayward (Lincoln Landing and Maple Main) would require expansion of the planned RPP or new RPP zones. Staff recommends adding additional enforcement personnel if Council would desire the implementation of the Downtown RPP and Business Parking Permit programs.

## **Finances**

A detailed financial analysis of the existing parking administration costs, citation revenues, and enforcement expenditures was conducted to understand current revenues and costs. This was used in concert with historic information on parking revenues and expenses, a proposed staffing plan, and an assessment of enforcement requirements to create a five-year projection of the Parking Management Program budget. Key findings include:

- The analysis of current parking administration, citation processing, and enforcement data showed a net revenue loss of \$47,495 for FY 2017-2018
- The purchase and use of a more efficient LPR equipped enforcement vehicle was projected to increase citation revenues in FY 2018-2019
- However, due to the capital expenditure requirements, a net revenue loss of \$38,571 was projected
- The proposed addition of a second enforcement employee would increase net revenues to \$141,000 per year in future years
- A positive net revenue of approximately \$81,000 has been projected for future years with the use of one LPR equipped enforcement vehicle.
- If Council chooses to add a second enforcement employee and a LPR equipped vehicle, positive net revenues of approximately \$200,000 has been projected for future years.

The CIC recommended purchasing one LPR equipped vehicle or retrofitting an existing vehicle with LPR equipment during the initial year. Additionally, the Committee recommended evaluating the efficiency of the new equipment before further consideration of hiring additional personnel or purchasing a second enforcement vehicle.

## **4. Wayfinding**

A coordinated wayfinding system, better directional signage, and signs identifying parking lots and structures would improve the use of the off-street parking. Ideally, this program would be implemented when the Downtown Hayward parking restrictions, the RPP, and Business Parking Permit programs begin.

The CIC recommended prioritizing and funding the installation of wayfinding signs. The CIC also recommended that staff explore the possibility of showing the City's municipal parking lots on Google Maps. That work has been completed and Google Maps now shows the parking lots.

## **STRATEGIC INITIATIVES**

This agenda item supports the Complete Streets Strategic Initiative. The purpose of the Complete Streets strategy is to build streets that are safe, comfortable, and convenient for everyone regardless of age or ability, including motorists, pedestrians, bicyclists and public transportation riders. This item supports the following goal and objectives:

Goal 2: Provide Complete Streets that balance the diverse needs of users of the public right-of-way.

Objective 1: Increase walking, biking, transit usage, carpooling, and other sustainable modes of transportation by designing and retrofitting streets to accommodate all modes.

This agenda item also supports the Complete Communities Strategic Initiative. The purpose of the Complete Communities strategy is to create and support structures, services, and amenities to provide inclusive and equitable access with the goal of becoming a thriving and promising place to live, work and play for all. This item supports the following goal and objectives:

Goal 1: Improve quality of life for residents, business owners, and community members in all Hayward neighborhoods.

Objective 4: Create resilient and sustainable neighborhoods.

## **FISCAL IMPACT**

The City currently receives revenue from parking citations, RPP permit sales, and income from the South Hayward BART Station JPA parking. The Maintenance Services Department is responsible for the administration and enforcement of these programs. The Finance Department, Public Works Department, and Police Department also have certain areas of responsibility.

Over the five-year period, beginning 2019, and depending if the second vehicle is purchased, there will be an estimated capital expense of \$200,000, which includes Downtown Hayward RPP implementation costs (\$25,000), two LPR equipped vehicles (\$80,000 per one LPR equipped vehicle), and a Wayfinding Signage program (\$15,000).

As proposed, the RPP implementation, wayfinding signage installation, and purchase of one LPR vehicle with related technology would occur in FY 2018-2019. Staff recommends adding a second LPR equipped vehicle after obtaining sufficient data from the purchase and use of the first LPR.

The table on page 11 of Attachment II shows both the historic revenues/costs of the parking program, a five-year projection based on the purchase of the LPR vehicle, equipment in FY 2017-2018, and the addition of a second enforcement employee in FY 2019-2020.

## **ECONOMIC IMPACT**

The Downtown Parking Management Plan, if approved, will provide an opportunity for residents and businesses in the Downtown to purchase permits allowing unrestricted parking in designated zones. Based on the initial recommendations, the first residential permit will be free while the second permit will cost \$150 per year. For businesses, the cost will vary based on the number of employees and ranges from \$25 to \$60 per year, per permit. Per CIC's recommendation, the cost will be \$50 per year, per permit for both residents and businesses

## **SUSTAINABILITY FEATURES**

The Downtown Parking Management Plan if adopted, will support the mobility goals related to parking identified in the City's 2040 General Plan (Goal M-9) "Provide and manage a balanced approach to parking that meets economic development and sustainability goals". The plan particularly supports the Policy M-9.5 "Identify Parking Deficiencies and Conflicts" by analyzing the existing and near-term parking supply and demand, identifying deficiencies, and recommending policies to efficiently manage the public parking areas in the Downtown. The recommended Residential and Business Permit Parking Program would minimize the adverse effects of spill over parking from BART patrons. If approved, the proposed policies would discourage multiple vehicle ownership in Downtown which is a transit-oriented zone. Transit-oriented development is a key strategy for reducing greenhouse gas emissions in Hayward.

## **PUBLIC CONTACT**

Staff presented results of the preliminary parking analysis to the Council Economic Development Committee (CEDC) on April 6, 2015. The CEDC commented on the need to balance the needs of Downtown merchants, employees, and patrons while providing flexibility to meet parking needs.

In October 2016, staff solicited comments from visitors to the Downtown Hayward area via surveys; 134 surveys were completed. To compliment this effort, a more detailed survey was posted on-line on the City's website, Facebook page, the social network Nextdoor, and disseminated via e-mail. Approximately 840 completed on-line surveys were submitted.



During the summer of 2017, staff also conducted interviews of merchants in the Downtown Hayward area, and residents in and around the Hayward BART station.

Staff presented the recommendations to the Chamber's Government Relations Council (GRC) on Friday, February 2, 2018. The Chamber GRC did not make a recommendation as a group; however, several merchants indicated they were satisfied with the existing parking management strategies in the Downtown.

## **NEXT STEPS**

Following receipt of feedback from Council, staff will prepare a report with the recommendations for Council's approval in April 2018.

Staff's recommendation will likely include a year-long pilot program be implemented in the study area. At the conclusion of the pilot program, the impacts of the proposed recommendations will be evaluated and brought before Council for further consideration to determine whether to:

- Sunset the program and adopt potential alternative management strategies; and/or
- Extend the program indefinitely by adopting it into City code

*Prepared by:* Fred Kelley, Transportation Manager

*Recommended by:* Alex Ameri, Interim Director of Public Works

Approved by:



---

Kelly McAdoo, City Manager