



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

The Planning Commission meeting was called to order at 7:03 p.m. by Acting Chair Lowe. The Planning Commission held a hybrid meeting in the Council Chambers and virtually via Zoom.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL

Present: COMMISSIONERS: Bonilla Jr., Garg, Goodbody, Patterson, Stevens
VICE CHAIRPERSON: Lowe
Absent: COMMISSIONER: None
CHAIRPERSON: Ali-Sullivan
CHAIRPERSON: None

Staff Members Present: Blanton, Claussen, Kowalski, Madhukansh, Ochinero, Parras, Richard, Tabari, Vigilia, Wright

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Peggy Guernsey, participated via Zoom and a Hayward resident, shared that she had written correspondence to the Planning Commissioners and had received a response from Commissioner Lowe; she was trying to find an answer to why it was a good thing to approve the increase sale and consumption of more alcohol in the downtown; had received a response from Mayor Salinas that the proposed increase was to align with State legislation; she did not see why the City needed to increase its alcohol sales to match the State's as this causes drunkenness, homelessness, DUIs, hit-and-run accidents, and creates other challenges. Ms. Guernsey stated that there were 29 establishments in downtown where alcohol can be bought and consumed, added that increasing the sale of alcohol would increase its consumption, and did not support changing the Hayward Municipal Code to a 50:50 ratio of food-to-alcohol sales.

PUBLIC HEARING

Agenda items continued from the January 12, 2023 Planning Commission meeting.

For agenda item No. 1 the Planning Commission may make a recommendation to the City Council.

1. Proposal to Amend Chapter 10, Article 1 (Zoning Ordinance) Section 10-1.2750 of the Hayward Municipal Code for Updates to the Alcoholic Beverage Outlets Ordinance and Related Regulations in the City of Hayward, Requiring Approval of a Zoning Text Amendment. **(PH 23-001)**



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

Associate Planner Kowalski provided a synopsis of the staff report and shared a PowerPoint presentation.

Commissioner Patterson asked what the patron safety information would look like and whether this would be consistent across all alcohol-serving establishments. Associate Planner Kowalski shared that Detective Wright from the Hayward Police Department's (HPD) Vice Unit was on the call and explained the police department would advise what the medium might be for this, noting that there may be a QR Code located at the bar that patrons could scan for an UBER, Lyft, or local taxi service. Detective Wright responded that this was still being determined, and that each restaurant or bar that sells alcohol for onsite consumption would have to provide alternatives to patrons for getting home safely as opposed to getting a DUI. Mr. Kowalski confirmed that this requirement would apply to all establishments through amendments to the ordinance.

Commissioner Patterson referenced Attachment I and requested further clarification on staff's comparison to neighboring city's ordinances as Hayward appeared to be less permissive than neighboring jurisdictions.

Associate Planner Kowalski responded that Hayward's ordinance was permissive in a way allowing restaurants to have a jazz band or mariachi band until midnight; noting most cities do not allow live music late at night. He underscored that most other jurisdictions fall back on the historic definition of the Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control's (ABC) regulations with a minimum of 50% proceeds from food sales and 50% from alcohol, and Hayward was stricter in that regard, and this could have been due to the previous City Council body viewing alcohol consumption as a community problem. This is now being revisited to make things more favorable for Hayward restaurants.

Commissioner Stevens referenced Page 8 of the staff report, under alcohol-related crime attributed to restaurants, and asked if the statistic of 397 alcohol-related arrests was per year. Associate Planner Kowalski answered it was per year. Detective Wright clarified the 2019 data was pre-pandemic and that the yearly figures had reduced since then, underscoring that current data showed it had reduced significantly. She shared that there were over 300 reporting districts in the City and there were approximately 190 total on-sale and off-sale alcohol establishments, and the figures could be stemming from a liquor store or residents drinking alcoholic beverages from home and stepping out drunk-in-public, or from a restaurant or bar establishment.

Commissioner Stevens mentioned the arrest number seemed statistically low given the size of the City. Detective Wright did not have comparisons for other cities and did not have data available on hand; however, she noted that drunk driving had decreased overall,



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

especially from the higher reporting districts which included the downtown and Tennyson areas.

Commissioner Bonilla Jr. asked how often the 50:50 requirements were expected to be achieved. Associate Planner Kowalski predicted it would be monthly, noting that the police department did not have the resources to review the books of all existing alcoholic beverage restaurants.

Commissioner Bonilla Jr. inquired about auditing and enforcement mechanisms and Associate Planner Kowalski answered it would be complaint-based indicating that if there were challenges with alcohol-related crimes at a particular establishment, then HPD may open an investigation. Detective Wright stated that if a restaurant with a Type 47 license was operating like a bar, this would be evaluated with HPD having a discussion with the alcohol licensee informing them of the City's ordinance in order to gain compliance. If the licensee continued to be out of compliance, then HPD would work with ABC and the establishment owner to come to a resolution.

Commissioner Bonilla Jr. asked why staff was suggesting restricting happy hour times when neighboring jurisdictions did not have such a requirement. Associate Planner Kowalski recalled the previous Council was concerned about alcohol-related crimes and suggested restricting happy hour timing and pointed out that none of the stakeholders Mr. Kowalski interviewed suggested removing the happy hour restriction. Only one establishment had suggested making happy hour earlier to attract patrons who get off from work earlier and that staff did not consider eliminating it altogether.

Commissioner Garg did not feel that Hayward's regulations were more permissive than surrounding cities, emphasizing that the proposed regulations would make Hayward's Alcoholic Beverage Outlets Ordinance more restrictive than neighboring cities as there would be restrictions on happy hour timeframes.

Planner Kowalski stated it was very progressive to have a business arrangement where there was an owner of the bar who then leased the kitchen out to a different entity. The other cities he explored did not consider this concept yet as it was still a relatively new idea. This option would make Hayward more permissive in this regard, but other than this, he concurred with Commissioner Garg that the City was not more permissive. He noted for Commissioner Garg that as this was a new concept, other cities do not necessarily preclude this option, it just takes cities a while to update an ordinance as Council support is required.

Commissioner Garg asked if staff discussed not having a food to beverage ratio. Associate Planner Kowalski confirmed the current regulation was that at least 60 percent of the sales at full-service restaurants must come from food and only 40 percent could come from



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

alcoholic beverage sales. The proposal was to change that to a 50:50 ratio. He predicted the police department would not support removing the ratio altogether because some restaurants would then likely become more like bars and patrons might become intoxicated more quickly due to not having food in their system.

Commissioner Garg wanted to know if it was easier for the HPD to enforce a ratio if it were in an ordinance as opposed to just having the State regulations. Senior Planner Blanton answered the City's Code Enforcement division can only enforce City ordinances and so having it in the Hayward Municipal Code provided them with an enforcement mechanism. She noted the police department and ABC would be the entities to enforce the ratio whether it was in a City ordinance or not.

Commissioner Goodbody asked how the licensing worked if a secondary business was within an existing establishment. Associate Planner Kowalski explained the holder of the ABC license would be selling the alcohol. Detective Wright added that both entities would have to be on the ABC license, and that ABC would have to know about the partnership as well as the police department. Staff confirmed for Commissioner Goodbody that both operators would be subject to County Public Health Food Inspector training.

Commissioner Goodbody found 2:00 p.m. to be a rather early happy hour and a 7:00 p.m. end time seemed too early for people who commute. She recommended a happy hour timespan from 3:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. Associate Planner Kowalski concurred the Planning Commission could recommend a change. He noted the proposed happy hour times were not staff's suggestion but rather came from a local restaurateur who owns several establishments in the City.

Commissioner Goodbody wanted an incremental approach and suggested that a pilot program take place first allowing two entities to work out of one restaurant before permitting freestanding kitchens. Associate Planner Kowalski shared there was one concept that the City Council had already endorsed and approved financial assistance for which was located at a vacant lot on B Street that would have a freestanding kitchen, this was an Oakland-based company called Arthur Mac's Tap and Shack. The project was going to have two shipping containers, retrofitted to have one be a bar and one a kitchen, and the establishment would include picnic tables for dining and families would be welcome. Senior Planner Blanton commented that the City's Economic Development Division was trying to invite new uses to the city and "pop up" style locations were more attractive and a more feasible entry-point for smaller start-up businesses.

Acting Chair Lowe asked if there were any statistics regarding intoxication arrests during happy hour. Detective Wright said she did not have this specific data available, noting the data in the staff report ranged from 2019 to 2022. This data indicated that alcohol arrests



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

and DUIs were previously higher and had declined currently. She expressed that in order to find detailed level of data as was being inquired, would require the review of every police report.

Acting Chair Lowe expressed concern as she wanted to ensure that bars would not pretend to operate as restaurants. She asked if the proposed changes bypass any rules, regulations, licenses, that are required to be obtained. Associate Planner Kowalski explained there were three different liquor licenses available from ABC and that the amendments would require any establishment utilizing a partnership format be subject to this. Any establishment having one of the three liquor licenses is required to have full meal service up to 30 minutes before closing. Mr. Kowalski explained there are built-in checks and balances to ensure businesses are following the rules and regulations.

Acting Chair Lowe asked what type of food was considered to be “enough food”. Associate Planner Kowalski answered it could not just be bar snacks and finger foods and that customers must be able to order an entrée, appetizer, or a side dish. Senior Planner Blanton added that the costs of items could also be evaluated, exemplifying that at a bar the alcoholic beverage could easily cost more than the food item, thus resulting in the 50/50 ratio not being met, whereas at a sit-down restaurant the cost of the food items and beverages would be more on par with each other. Ms. Blanton added that there were no regulations on the types of food that must be served, theoretically all of the food items could be finger foods, but the distinction was that the restaurant must serve enough food to meet the total sales ratio.

Acting Chair Lowe inquired if there were statistics that showed having an equal food-to-beverage sales ratio would promote restaurant growth. Associate Planner Kowalski remarked there were no such statistics that he was aware of, but the changes would relax the rules and provide more flexibility to restaurants.

Acting Chair Lowe wanted to know what happened if a microbrewery or bar opened but it was unable to form a partnership for food service. Associate Planner Kowalski responded that the establishment would in this case have violated its liquor license and there would be repercussions for continued noncompliance. Detective Wright added that ABC had a protocol in place to address situations where one partner falls off, noting that in this case the operator may have to change their license type.

Acting Chair Lowe asked what alcohol trends the police department was experiencing over the last six months. Detective Wright could not recall there being any trends at the current time but would have to evaluate the data, she emphasized that officers were good at notifying their units on behaviors they were seeing such as cases of drunk-in-public or alcohol contributing to crime in an area.



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

Acting Chair Lowe inquired if the police department was immediately supportive of the proposal or did they feel it was a compromise. Detective Wright stated the proposed amendments were aligned with the State's laws, they would not increase overconsumption, and codifying the ratio would help the police department maintain establishments that wanted to be restaurants. She commented changing the happy hours reflected a true happy hour and the regulations required establishments to offer specials on nonalcoholic beverages as well. Ms. Wright mentioned ABC already allowed freestanding kitchens and adopting the change would bring the ordinance into alignment with current state regulations.

Acting Chair Lowe asked if changing the happy hour hours would affect staffing in the police department. Detective Wright did not foresee this occurring, adding that if there was an increase in alcohol consumption due to happy hours at a specific establishment, HPD would work to resolve the challenges with that establishment.

With regards to freestanding kitchens and the allowance for different providers for food and alcohol, Commissioner Garg asked for clarification on the permitting process and whether there would be immediate approval or if there would be a review of the application for a successful partnership. Senior Planner Blanton explained that with the adoption of the proposed amendments, the City would review applications similar to the application of a restaurant which was a permitted use in many zoning areas, adding that freestanding kitchens would be required to have all the documents and licenses showing they will need a beverage and food operation component.

Acting Chair Lowe expressed concern about a restaurant application not receiving the same scrutiny that a bar application would. Senior Planner Blanton commented that what Acting Chair Lowe described could happen now, and in the future, even with the change to the definition of restaurant as there was no planning staff review. She emphasized there are many checks and balances to ensure compliance with ABC's and the City's regulations.

Commissioner Patterson mentioned the staff report said that happy hour would be extended but the proposal was to have an earlier start time. Associate Planner Kowalski restated a local restaurant owner was interested in an earlier start time and indicated that the proposed ordinance only included a timeframe and did not state it was an extension. Staff and the owner reached a compromise and that was what was being presented to the Commission.

Commissioner Patterson commented the staff report did use the word "extend" and suggested that be revised to "modify" instead in order to indicate the true intent of the amendment.



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

Acting Chair Lowe opened the public hearing at 8:11 p.m.

Mr. Eric Yeveerino, a restaurant owner, explained the earlier happy hour was proposed to include teachers and other professionals that ended their workday at an earlier hour. He noted serving individuals drinks to the point of intoxication was an establishment issue, not a happy hour issue. Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic, many establishments were moving to a partnership business model. Many bars that operated under a Type 48 liquor license were struggling and sales projections were not being met if food was not being provided. He supported the proposed amendments and found them to be a great step forward for the City.

Ms. Peggy Guernsey, Zoom participant, stated that based on her conversations with staff, the 60/40 ratio would still allow new restaurants to establish in the city. Concerning happy hour, she mentioned there are five schools located around the downtown area that were still in session at 2:00 p.m. This early happy hour start time was a safety concern for those students leaving school. Ms. Guernsey was concerned that intoxicated customers would not be capable of reading a small safety card about how to get home safely. She strongly encouraged the Commission to keep Hayward at a higher standard and to reevaluate the proposed amendments in a year.

Acting Chair Lowe closed the public hearing at 8:18 p.m.

Commissioner Stevens made a motion to approve the item per staff recommendation, seconded by Commissioner Bonilla Jr.

Commissioner Goodbody proposed an amendment that Chapter 10, Article 1, Section I (4) be modified to "a full-service restaurant may offer reduced priced alcoholic beverages served on the premises between the hours of 3:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m." Commissioner Stevens accepted the amendment.

Commissioner Bonilla Jr. requested more information on the rationale for the amendment from Commissioner Goodbody, as he believed that staff had done their due diligence on what was being proposed.

Commissioner Goodbody explained it was to accommodate and represent the residents in Hayward who worked outside of the city. Commissioner Bonilla Jr. accepted the amendment.

Acting Chair Lowe appreciated the comment by the public speaker that the decrease in the crime trend may have been caused by the COVID-19 Pandemic. She supported the recommendation to wait a year on adopting the proposed amendments to ensure that the trend was really decreasing but could support the motion to move the proposed amendments



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

forward. Ms. Lowe recalled there being a lot of problems coming from bars in the downtown area years ago and was unclear if that was still the trend now, and she appreciated hearing Detective Wright's perspective on the matter.

A motion was made by Commissioner Stevens, seconded by Commissioner Bonilla Jr., per staff recommendation and with a friendly amendment to modify the proposed earlier happy hour time to from 3:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m.

The motion passed with the following roll call votes:

AYES:	Commissioners Bonilla Jr., Garg, Goodbody, Patterson, Stevens Acting Chair Lowe
NOES:	None
ABSENT:	Chair Ali-Sullivan
ABSTAIN:	None

Item 2 was heard before Item 1.

2. Parking Analysis for Hayward Residential Design Study **(WS 23-001)**

1:41

Senior Planner Blanton and Assistant Planner Richard provided a synopsis of the staff report, Ms. Blanton noted that Transportation Consultant Josh Pilachowski with DKS Associates was also available to address any questions.

Acting Chair Lowe commented that the Hayward Municipal Code currently did not allow for unbundling of parking unless it is stated in the conditions of approval, and asked if developers have requested unbundled parking. Senior Planner Blanton responded that developers don't often ask for unbundled parking as it may not be a priority for them; however, she noted that this has been an ask of community members and decisionmakers in order to help with the parking management demand, adding that developers are usually not opposed to the idea of unbundled parking. She indicated for Acting Chair Lowe that at least two recent projects have included provisions recently that have included unbundled parking, noting that a lot of these projects are still in construction and that Planning staff typically did not monitor projects at this stage. Ms. Blanton stated that the consultant has looked into studies on the efficacy of unbundled parking across other jurisdictions and staff could bring more data to the Planning Commission on this at a later time.

Mr. Pilachowski stated that per a 2018 study from Arlington, Virginia, it was found that where parking is bundled, auto ownership is higher and single occupancy vehicle use is 12.5%



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

higher for commute trips and 40% higher for non-commute trips; as for buildings with unbundled parking, they have 6% fewer vehicles per unit and have 13% fewer vehicles per adult resident. He added that the studies included sites that had available on-street parking available nearby.

Acting Chair Lowe asked if the City can dictate how unbundled spaces will be rented out, as she is concerned of the following occurring: a family with two individuals owning four cars and the ability to afford to purchase four spaces is able to acquire available parking spaces while another family of five is unable to purchase one space due to it being unavailable. She asked if there was a way to place a maximum so that a unit cannot buy out all available spaces and other units cannot purchase one due to unavailability. Senior Planner Blanton responded that staff had not looked into this as they were not at the draft standards stage yet and staff could conduct more research on other unbundled policies in an effort to include language to say there was not unlimited availability to purchase spaces, perhaps including a limit in ratio to the unit size. Ms. Blanton stated that it was apparent based on responses from the community and decisionmakers that the projects that might have unbundled parking in the downtown and along Mission Blvd, there was a concern about spillover parking and they would not want to give the parking to another use that is not a resident, and want to structure the unbundled parking program in a way that people who do not need the parking space are paying for something they don't need but any unused spaces from these residents are used by other residents in the same facility. Mr. Pilachowski added that the extra spaces could be used as carshare spaces to benefits residents and less vehicle ownership.

Acting Chair Lowe asked about recommendation No. 5 which was a regulation about the two uncovered spaces that cannot be directly behind the two covered spaces for the single-family units, and staff was recommending changing this, she asked if there was a length requirement for these spaces as some were very short. Senior Planner Blanton responded that the City's Code requirement was there be a 20' long driveway, and these driveway spaces could count as two extra spaces. Assistant Planner Richard noted for reference that the standard parking lot length is 19' but for driveways it is 20' to ensure that vehicles do not overhang into the sidewalk to accommodate vehicles comfortably.

To follow up on the point if there were any other parking design issues, Commissioner Stevens commented that the analysis should include designs for tuck-under parking and not parking in the frontage of buildings. Senior Planner Blanton noted that although there are differences between Zoning Districts, there are more standards in the Downtown Code area and the Mission Blvd Code area related to parking design. She noted that Design Standards will be presented to the Planning Commission next month and may be addressed.

Commissioner Patterson was concerned that unbundled parking would create a conflict for low-income families who would have to choose to between pay renting or being able to afford



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

pay for rent and for a parking space, and the impact this may have on the community. Although there were conversations that developers pass savings along, she wondered if there will be a guarantee that the rent will be lower. Senior Planner Blanton mentioned that the same concern was raised by Council and it was suggested exploring the option that residents who opted to have no parking pay a lower rent or be provided free transit passes, in order to provide assistance with transportation. Staff would evaluate more strategies when they return to the Commission with a draft recommendation.

Commissioner Patterson referenced the staff report which mentioned SB 9, stating that in single-family residential zones lot splits could be done for up to two units per parcel, with two dwellings per parcel, resulting in a total of four units. She asked if this would qualify under the single-family or multifamily dwelling unit and would the parking spaces be based on the number of bedrooms as was the case for multifamily dwellings. Assistant Planner Richard responded that the State dictates the parking requirements for SB 9 projects so it would be one parking space per dwelling unit unless the property is located in a high-transit areas such as near BART or the Amtrak stations. She added that the SB 9 projects could provide more parking, noting that she had just processed a SB 9 application which provided two car garages with every unit.

Commissioner Patterson referenced the section of the staff report that stated staff would monitor the parking supply and occupancy of recent multifamily dwellings to see if a reduction from current standards is needed, asked what the monitoring would consist of. Senior Planner Blanton remarked that was a recommendation from the transportation consultant DKS with the overall recommendation to maintain the parking levels; however, since there was a discrepancy between the ITE rates and if there was desire to explore an option of lowering parking standards further, they recommended conducting a study to monitor how the parking was going in existing developments.

Commissioner Garg asked what options were there for residents who worked outside of the peak transit demand times and lived in an area that was a major transit area. Senior Planner Blanton responded that even though the City does not have minimum parking standards along Mission Boulevard or other similar areas, they were not seeing no parking. In speaking with members of the community who do shift work and work outside of prime commuting hours, or parents with young children, it was recognized that parking was going to be a need for some residents due to their life situations, and while it was not being suggested to completely eliminate parking in areas the City has control over. In order to accommodate families in situations where they have one parking spot and have multiple cars with needs at odd hours, staff was exploring last-mile strategies that may be required or incentivized for specific developments. Mr. Pilachowski stated that the recommendations would not change the current parking minimums; adding that the TDM was dependent on the types of transit provided, for instance if BART was in operation but the wait-time for a bus was a long time



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

then this would still pose a challenge. He shared the following options for first or last mile off-hour or off-peak solutions: bikeshare or scooter-share; underscored the most successful services were on-demand transit services at high demand locations such as BART where there will be a push button to trigger a call for a shuttle; other options could include UBER subsidies to support alternative transportation options. Mr. Pillachowski added that there was also a daytime off-peak as well where bikeshare and scooter share would be more reasonable, with there being more solutions during the day. He commented that the City ultimately working with AC Transit or alternative transportation providers will be the best way forward.

Commissioner Garg appreciated that staff was exploring last mile options, but suggested staff seriously consider what the impacts of State law are as the City's mass transit locations are different from neighboring jurisdictions and recognize the impact this has on residents. She emphasized that Hayward had a broader variety of jobs and economic status, and this created different needs.

Commissioner Goodbody suggested the TDM strategies that staff was considering should include wayfinding and communication tools, especially for multi-family developments.

Acting Chair Lowe opened and closed the public comment period at 9:08 p.m.

Commissioner Stevens encouraged staff to explore the designs for downtown parking and apply these to other districts in the City. He was concerned about who would fund the work of studying a TDM and expressed that he felt uncomfortable about unbundled parking, noting that the actual practice of this was not easy. He commented that if density comes and the downtown core is filled, then there will be an economic incentive to have different types of mass transit that will work, emphasizing that it will take time accomplish this. Mr. Stevens stated that consistent with good urban design, the downtown did not have surface parking lots, as these were under building or covered; parking lots don't front major streets and were situated behind buildings; noting that the Downtown Specific Plan provides good guidance for this and could be applied to other zoning districts throughout the City.

Commissioner Bonilla Jr. supported the recommendation of maintaining parking requirements and the housing coming up along Mission Boulevard. He agreed with comments expressed that Hayward does not have the most transit friendly community, there were challenges with buses and BART, he liked the notion of having a TDM plan in place, the idea of having a walkable transit-oriented community especially in reference to downtown Hayward; more broadly the priorities of Hayward call for a community that is more walkable and less reliant on cars, and bringing this vision into play will take a lot of creativity. Although he felt that unbundled parking was a wise idea, he understood how hard this was going to be to enforce, appreciated the comments about over-buying parking if one has the financial means to do this, and concerns about the burden this may have on



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

those who cannot afford it. He appreciated that if there was a significant financial incentive for people to get out cars, such as significant reductions in rent by hundreds of dollars. Mr. Bonilla Jr. supported not increasing the parking requirements for multi-family developments outside of Mission Boulevard and the downtown area. He supported the recommendations around the TDM but suggested the City be more pragmatic about what the last mile solutions will be and how to make those solutions safe, such as having a City that is more well-lit, has complete streets, have sidewalks to encourage people to get out of cars. While unbundled parking was a good concept, but he would like to better understand how this would be implemented and enforced. Also, he generally supported revising the parking requirements for single-family dwellings and encouraged staff to consider exploring incentives and how these tied into the City's other priorities to get to a City that is less dependent on parking.

Acting Chair Lowe supported the idea of having the two spaces count for single-family residences; felt there was more to think about with unbundled parking and appreciated the concerns raised by Commissioner Patterson related to unbundled parking; and appreciated staff's creativity with coming up with solutions and hoped that Hayward could be at the forefront of addressing parking.

COMMISSION REPORTS

Oral Report on Planning and Zoning Matters

Senior Planner Blanton stated that the next Planning Commission meeting will be held on February 23, 2023 and will include the General Plan Annual Report and a tentative map application along Mission Boulevard.

Commissioners' Announcements, Referrals

There were none.

ADJOURNMENT

Acting Chair Lowe shared the unfortunate news that Alameda County Board Supervisor Richard Valle had passed away on February 8, 2023 yesterday, stated that he was instrumental in making the community better and she was grateful for his service to Alameda County.

Acting Chair Lowe adjourned the meeting in his memory at 9:19 p.m.



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, February 9, 2023, 7:00 p.m.**

APPROVED:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Anika Patterson", written over a horizontal line.

Anika Patterson, Secretary
Planning Commission

ATTEST:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Avinta Madhukansh-Singh", written over a horizontal line.

Avinta Madhukansh-Singh
Interim Planning Commission Secretary
Office of the City Clerk

