

Comment Reference	Element Goal/Policy/Program Reference	Comment	City Response
A. Saves The Bay/Greenbelt Alliance			
A1	HAZ-4.3 Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan	The City shall coordinate with Oakland, San Leandro, Alameda County, the Hayward Area Shoreline Planning Agency, the Bay Conservation and Development Commission, and other agencies to expand and restore wetland habitat and increase shoreline resilience through the implementation of the Hayward Regional Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan, and will align the Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan with BCDC guidelines when they are adopted.	Accept
A2	HAZ-4.6 Adaptation Atlas	The City shall partner with regional jurisdictions to incorporate the findings of the San Francisco Estuary Institute’s SF Bay Area Adaptation Atlas including commitments to nature-based measures, grey infrastructure, policy and regulatory measures, and financial measures. Nature-based measures will be considered before grey infrastructure in flood resilience projects.	Accept and revise to "Nature-based measures will be considered and prioritized if feasible from a constructability and cost standpoint" .
A3	HAZ-4.7 Adaptation Programs and Standards	Identifying the location, condition, material, age, and elevation of underground utilities to determine which assets will need to be upgraded to account for sea level and shallow groundwater rise, in collaboration with water, sewer, energy, solid waste, and telecommunication service providers. Creating an implementation plan to upgrade critical equipment and facilities including pump stations, generators, tide gates, stream gages, open channel, and culvert/pipeline infrastructure when needed and aligning the plan with the Capital Improvement Plan. Installing nature based and grey infrastructure around areas projected to be impacted by sea level rise, with priority given to nature-based infrastructure.	Accept partially. The investigation called for in this policy will include an evaluation of location, condition, material, age, and elevation of underground utilities. City accepts the added language "with priority given to nature-based infrastructure".
A4	HAZ-4.9 Groundwater Management Plan	The City shall coordinate with Alameda County Flood Control & Water Conservation District to develop a Shallow Groundwater Management Plan to identify feasible strategies for managing rising groundwater tables from sea level rise and storm surges. The plan will include a watershed-level model of groundwater rise, establish a Shallow Groundwater Overlay District, and implement related building standards within the overlay district to ensure that buildings are resilient to groundwater rise, saltwater intrusion, liquefaction, and toxic contaminants.	Accept and modify to "...and consider establishing a Shallow Groundwater Overlay District <u>that would</u> implement related building standards to ensure that buildings are resilient to groundwater rise, saltwater intrusion, liquefaction, and toxic contaminants.
A5	HAZ-4.10 Increase Flood Protection Standards for New Construction and Renovations	The City shall incorporate sea level rise into the municipal code and establish a Sea Level Rise Overlay District to require compliance with base floor elevation and flood-proofing requirement to mid-century sea levels. Update building codes to require new or significant construction in the Sea Level Rise Overlay District to build at least 4 feet of freeboard. Require new or significant construction within 100 feet of the shoreline to contribute to regional shoreline infrastructure (unless existing infrastructure protects against projected flooding) and to contribute to Bay Trail access. Consider unconventional design elements that may allow structures to accommodate a higher water table and higher liquefaction risks.	Accept proposed sentence. Full text of policy would be: The City shall incorporate sea level rise into the municipal code and establish a Sea Level Rise Overlay District to require compliance with base floor elevation and flood-proofing requirement to mid-century sea levels. Consider unconventional design elements that may allow structures to accommodate a higher water table and higher liquefaction risks. Consider establishing shoreline and creek buffer zones that are reserved for flood protection, habitat restoration, public access, and recreation.
A6	Goal HAZ-6 [Add new policy]	Plan for Long-Term Growth Management and Potential Strategic Relocation. As sea level rise and groundwater rise progress, consider zoning changes to reduce growth in the Industrial District and encourage land uses to move inland if necessary.	Reject proposed policy. As part of the Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan, Managed Retreat was evaluated. It was determined to not be an feasible adaptation strategy at this time. The Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan proposed adaptation strategies that will protect critical assets and the Industrial District from daily tidal inundation and future 100-year storm surge in a up to 4 feet of sea level rise scenario.

A7	HAZ-6.6 Transportation Corridors	The City shall improve the resiliency of transportation infrastructure by identifying highly trafficked active transportation and commute patterned streets and prioritizing the creation of “complete green streets”, including permeable pavement, shading, lighting, biodiversity, flood resilience, pedestrian and bike lane safety, and drinking water improvements.	Staff prefers to keep the term "complete streets" so that it remains consistent with the City's other policy documents. Staff recommends re-ordering the listed items and adding "green infrastructure such as". The revised policy would be: "The City shall improve the resiliency of transportation infrastructure by identifying highly trafficked active transportation and commute patterned streets and prioritizing the creation of “complete streets”, including pedestrian and bike lane safety, lighting, and green infrastructure such as permeable pavement, shading, biodiversity, flood resilience, and drinking water improvements."
A8	HAZ-6.7 Parks and Open Space Resilience	Protect open spaces, habitats, and parks impacted by sea level rise, floods, drought, extreme heat, and wildfire including: Protect existing floodplains, open space, and other natural features that provide flood storage by establishing minimum buffers, limiting new development in wetlands and buffers. Establishes buffer zones at least 100 ft from the Bay shoreline and at least 35 ft from the top of creek banks. If new development is allowed in these areas, require it to contribute to regional shoreline resilience infrastructure. Protect and expand large, continuous greenspaces such as parks, median strips and street trees wherever possible for greater cooling magnitude and extent. Include a mix of grass and trees for greatest cooling benefits. Prioritize greening in most vulnerable areas with high pollution, heat, and flood burden and engage frontline communities in the design and placement of green features.	Accept addition of "Prioritize greening in most vulnerable areas with high pollution, heat, and flood burden and engage frontline communities in the design and placement of green features" and reject other revisions. Specific thresholds should be evaluated as part of this program and based on the best available science at time of implementation.
A9	HAZ-6.9 Climate Overlay Zones	The City shall establish hazard overlay zones. Overlay designations shall be developed to address potential future at-risk areas, such as areas prone to wildfire, subsidence, future floodplain or area of temporary inundation, or area at risk for high wind/storm events due to future climate change impact models. Apply overlay zones to areas with the greatest current hazards and/or future climate impacts. Associate corresponding risk reduction, adaptation policies, and standards specific to the hazard or climate impact. Overlay zones should include development standards for appropriate risk mitigation measures. As much as possible, the City should prioritize building affordable housing near jobs and transit and outside of the Climate Overlay Zones.	Accept
A10	Goal HAZ-6 [Add new policy]	Require major development and redevelopment projects to construct and maintain urban greening projects in the adjacent public right of way.	Reject proposed policy. Private development projects are required to retain and treat stormwater on-site while improvements in the public right-of-way are typically constructed and maintained by the City of Hayward or Alameda County Flood District depending on jurisdiction and property ownership. See Policy Haz-6.6 for improvements to transportation corridors.
A11	Goal HAZ-6 [Add new policy]	New infrastructure projects (including bike/ped and traffic calming infrastructure, road upgrades, public plaza redevelopment, tree planting, or utility upgrades) will be reviewed for alignment with the City's GSI plan and feasibility of inclusion of green stormwater infrastructure elements.	Accept and change "GSI" to "Green Infrastructure".
A12	Goal HAZ-6 [Add new policy]	The City will identify areas at risk of flooding due to storms and will create a Storm Drain Master Plan that ensures the storm drain system has the capacity to function under future precipitation conditions. It will prioritize storm drain upgrade and green stormwater infrastructure projects based on flood risk and disadvantaged community status.	Reject proposed policy. The Alameda County Flood Control District is responsible for most flood protection systems in the City. The City maintains smaller stormwater systems, which are typically installed by developers with City oversight.
A13	Goal EJ-1 [Add new policy]	Evaluate and map areas with overlapping climate vulnerabilities, including income, pollution burden, heat burden, flood risk, and lack of greenspace.	Accept

A14	Policy EJ-1.2 Urban Greening	Develop urban greening initiatives along major arterials to protect sensitive receptors from traffic related pollution, especially Diesel Particulate Matter pollution. Prioritize greening in areas with the highest pollution burden.	Accept
A15	Program EJ-1.3:	Partner with and support Hayward Unified School District to install MERV-13 air filtration systems in all local schools to reduce the impacts from air pollution, especially Particulate Matter pollution. Prioritize updating HEPA air filtration systems in schools experiencing the highest pollution burden.	Accept
A16	Program EJ-1.5:	Prepare and publish an annual report identifying the location and status of local cleanup sites and hazardous waste facilities to keep residents informed about local polluting sources. Identify sites that are at risk of contaminant mobilization due to sea level or groundwater rise.	Accept
A17	Policy EJ-1.7 Targeted Health Monitoring	No line edits, but we appreciate the inclusion of this important policy.	Comment noted.
A18	Policy EJ-1.14 Cleanup Sites	Proactively monitor the progress of local cleanup sites to ensure that all site remediation efforts are being handled in a timely and effective manner. Determine which cleanup sites are most at risk of toxic substances being mobilized due to flooding from sea level and groundwater rise, according to the latest available science (including the DTSC Sea Level Rise Guidance for Cleanup Activities). In addition, new housing should not be approved or built on or near hazardous sites in flood-prone areas before cleanup has been completed. Cleanup standards should be developed in partnership with frontline communities, take into account cumulative pollution exposure, and require that contaminants are disposed of in the least harmful way possible.	Accept
A19	Policy EJ-1.16 Groundwater Contamination	Require that permeable reactive barriers (PRBs) or diversion walls are developed on or immediately adjacent to contaminated sites to protect the groundwater within Hayward. Identify and upgrade sewer pipes in areas at risk of Volatile Organic Compound (VOC) mobilization due to rising groundwater.	After further consideration and consultation with a Hydrogeologist, City staff has deleted Policy 1.16 from the draft EJ Element. Permeable reactive barriers (PRBs) are just one of many technical options and calling out PRBs prescribes a specific mitigation rather than the desired outcomes. More importantly, the City is not the entity that has authority on regulating contaminated sites. That authority rests with the state (i.e., Regional Board, DTSC, etc.).
A20	Policy EJ-1.18 Proximity to Pollution Sources	The City shall avoid locating new sensitive uses such as schools, childcare centers, and senior housing in proximity to sources of pollution, odors, or near existing businesses that handle toxic materials. Where such uses are located in proximity to sources of air pollution, odors, or toxic materials, the City shall require that building design, construction safeguards, and technological techniques to mitigate the negative impacts of hazardous materials and/or air pollution on indoor air quality. Explore the use of zoning ordinances and incentives to move polluting industries away from residential areas in the long term.	Reject change. This was already accomplished in 2019, when the City adopted a comprehensive update to the Zoning Ordinance to establish the Light Industrial District which allows for light industrial and commercial uses and prohibits establishment of new polluting industries from residentially zoned land.
A21	Policy EJ-2.2 Existing Park Quality	Work with HARD to improve the quality and safety of existing parks with a focus on areas with the lowest number of park acreage per capita. Incorporate green stormwater infrastructure designed to provide multiple benefits, such as flood prevention, trash capture, heat mitigation, and biodiversity.	Accept and modify to "Where feasible, incorporate green stormwater..."

A22	Policy EJ-2.4 Green Space through Residential Development	Require future medium-density and high-density development to incorporate green space as part of the development review process to meet community need across the City. Design greenspace to provide multiple benefits when possible, including flood mitigation, pollution prevention, heat mitigation, and biodiversity. Prioritize building green space in DACs and low-income neighborhoods. Engage the community in the process of developing greenspace.	Partially accept. The Zoning Ordinance requires all new development to incorporate landscaping and open space. However the City cannot include the recommended change to "prioritize building green space in DACs and low income neighborhoods. Engage the community in the process of development greenspace" since the City does not develop residential projects. This is the responsibility of developers and as noted above is already required per the Zoning Ordinance unless granted a concession/waiver from such standards under Density Bonus Law.
A23	Policy EJ-2.7 Active Transportation	Support active transportation in Hayward by facilitating the timely and effective implementation of the programs and policies outlined within the Hayward Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan & Multimodal Intersection Implementation Plan and Nexus Study. Prioritize creating "complete green streets" and evaluate any road upgrade projects for inclusion of green stormwater features such as permeable pavement, planters, and bioswales.	Partially accept as follows: "Support active transportation in Hayward by facilitating the timely and effective implementation of the programs and policies outlined within the Hayward Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan & Multimodal Intersection Implementation Plan and Nexus Study. Prioritize creating "complete-green streets" and evaluate any road upgrade projects for inclusion of green stormwater features such as permeable pavement, planters, and bioswales."
A24	Policy EJ-4.2. Home Maintenance Programs	Promote home safety by developing public programs that subsidize home-maintenance projects for low-income residents and provide public resources for necessary home improvements. Include subsidies for residents to add green infrastructure like rain gardens and tree canopy to their homes.	Accept, but change "subsidies" to "incentives".
A25	Policy EJ-5.4 Tree Canopy	Support active transportation by preserving existing and increasing tree canopy through implementation of an expanded urban greening initiative. Prioritize preserving and increasing tree canopy in EJ communities. As part of urban greening initiatives, evaluate projects for inclusion of green stormwater components for flood resilience and pollution prevention.	Reject. Tree canopy is addressed in the Climate Action Plan Measures related to Carbon Sequestration (CS)-1. See also response to comment on Policy HAZ-6.6, Transportation Corridors.
A26	Policy EJ-6.2. Community Engagement	Host City led community engagement meetings at times and locations that are accessible to a diversity of community members including but not limited to hosting meetings at multiple timeslots, in varying locations and with translation services. Compensate community members for their time.	Accept and revise to "Develop incentives, including but not limited to financial compensation, for community members and organizations' participation."
B. Hayward Area Recreation District			
B1	Policy EJ-2.1 Park Connectivity Assessment	HARD requests that the Policy be expanded to include a City-wide connectivity assessment of all assets including parking, bike lanes, greenways, existing and planned trails among others.	City accepts proposed revision and will amend the policy to include preparation of a City-wide connectivity assessment of bike lanes, greenways, existing and planned trails as part of the City's future Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan update. City will include parking assessments as part of future parking studies.
B2	Policy EJ-2.2 & 2.3. Existing Park Quality & Increase Parks in Central Hayward	General comment that HARD relies on park impact fees to build facilities, and that due to constraints on land in central Hayward, the City and HARD should collaborate on identifying areas that could be converted to parks, pocket parks and greenways and other innovative solutions.	Accept comment. No specific changes to policies.
B3	Policy EJ-2.3 Increase Parks in Central Hayward	HARD requests that the area identified as central Hayward be better defined in the document.	City will amend Program EJ-2.3 to reference Environmental Justice Element Figure 4, Park Access in Hayward which shows park acres per 1,000 residents by census tract in order to more clearly define "central Hayward."
B4	EJ-2.5 Public Safety	HARD clarified that they already incorporate CPTED practices when designing parks and feel the policy as written is redundant. HARD recommends revising the policy to discuss collaboration between Hayward Police Department, HARD's Public Safety Division to ensure safety in parks.	City accepts proposed revision and will amend the policy to remove reference to CPTED, and will expand policy to support collaboration between Hayward Police Department and HARD Public Safety Division.

B5	Additional Comments	HARD recommends a policy be added for the city to coordinate between HUSD and HARD to identify multi-use facilities which would offer opportunities to increase park and recreation space in constrained and developed portions of the City.	City accepts proposed revision and will add new Policy to coordinate with HUSD and HARD to identify and open up joint facilities to increase park and recreation space on school owned properties.
C. Comment Letter from Tony Marks-Block			
C1	Hayward Airport	Commenter believes that the documents should include additional analysis of emissions (CO2, GHG, and particulate matter) from the Hayward Airport and include measures to reduce pollutants related to the Airport.	Staff is considering the possibility of adding airport emissions to the City's GHG inventory. When low-emission aviation fuels are available and approved by the FAA, staff will stive to make them available at the Hayward Airport.
C2	Fire Hazards	Commenter believes that the City should adopt prescribed fire as a fuel management tool to reduce fire hazards.	Hazards Element Goal 5, Urban Wildfire Hazards, provides goals and policies related to mitigating wildfire risk, the creation of defensible space and fuel reduction, regional coordination, fire resistance retrofits and evacuation planning.
C3	CAP/Environmental Justice Tribal Consultation	Commenter believes that the CAP and EJ Elements should discuss Ohlone people.	Tribal notification and consultation is incorporated as part of all development and environmental review processes. The City coordinates with the Native American Heritage Commission to identify and notify any impacted tribes about development projects and General Plan amendments pursuant to State Law.
D-P. Public Comments received via email			
D1 - Ben Schwang	Micromobility/CAP Measures T-1 and T-3	Commenter notes that Hayward has an order of magnitude higher rate of sidewalk bike riding than the rest of Alameda County, and bike riding is a measure of how unsafe bike riders feel about riding in the street.	Noted.
D2 - Ben Schwang	Micromobility/CAP Measures T-1 and T-3	Commenter recommends a Bicycle Pedestrian Advocacy Committee to help oversee all transportation projects, and ensure development of safe bicycling routes. Notes that Hayward is "probably the only city of its size in the greater Bay Area that does not have one"	Acknowledged. No changes made as the Alameda County Transportation Commission's Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Committee serves as Hayward's Bicycle & Pedestrian Advisory Committee.
D3 - Ben Schwang	CAP Measure T-3	Expressed support for discouraging single occupancy vehicle travel	Noted.
E - Dave Pryor	CAP	Commenter expressed uncertainty about integrity of climate data	Noted.
F - Diana Thornton	Building Electrification/CAP Measure BE-6	Concerned about grid capacity and ability to support electrification measures	Acknowledged comment, no changes need to be made. Provided commenter with resources and information about PG&E upgrade projects and shutdown FAQs
G - Ezna Khan	Building Electrification/CAP Measure BE-2	Old heaters in apartments should be checked for efficacy and safety (gas leaks)	Noted. (Hayward's rental inspection program includes checking for gas leaks.)
H1 - Jim Clark	Building Electrification/CAP Measures BE-1, BE-2, BE-3	Commenter concerned about burden of cost of building electrification on homeowners and renters	Noted.
H2 - Jim Clark	Electrification/CAP Measure BE-6	Commenter concerned about grid capacity and ability to support EVs and building electrification	Noted.
I - John Ostrello	CAP Measure CS-1	Commenter expressed interest in planting trees on residence, asked for guidance as to which trees are recommended by staff.	Recommended that commenter reach out to local nursery for more personalized guidance. Information is also available on the City's website at www.hayward-ca.gov/services/city-services/landscaping-classes
J - Kevin Athanacio	CAP Measure BE-3	Commenter is a multi-residential property owner concerned about cost of electrification and availability of energy; cites that building infrastructure is old and there is barely enough electricity to meet current demand. Asks what assistance will be provided to multi-residential property owners to decarbonize.	City is currently participating in a pilot project electrifying existing homes in hopes of finding solutions to this problem. Response also cited BE 3.4 (conducting feasibility studies to identify barriers to electrifying multi-residential properties) as a way to further address this concern.
K - Peter Reimer	CAP	Commenter asked for a comparison of Hayward GHG emissions to other cities in Alameda County, cities in other Bay Area counties, and cities around CA.	Provided commenter with GHG emissions and resources for further exploration. No changes needed.
M - Richard Reavis	CAP	Expressed dissent for need to reduce GHG emissions	Noted.

N - Sandra Nevala-Lee	Synthetic Turf	SB 676 was signed on Oct 8 and allows local municipalities to ban residents from installing fake grass as drought-tolerant landscape. Resident would like to know if city will be supporting this ban	Staff will present a report on artificial turf to the Sustainability Committee in 2024. (The City offers a Lawn Conversion Program that provides rebates to residents to convert their lawns to water-efficient landscapes. Rebates are not provided for synthetic turf.)
O - Bill Crader	CAP	Concerned about seemingly conflicting objectives between CAP and Hayward's plans for future development.	The CAP is designed to reduce the emissions of new development that is required by the state of California. Implementation of CAP actions are projected to result in lower per capita emissions.
P - Miki Hong, Mills College/Northwestern University	Environmental Justice Element	Expand Policy EJ-1.20 & Program EJ-1.9 related to smoke free multi-family housing to provide additional detail and monitoring. Amend Program EJ-1.9 as follows: "Adopt an Ordinance related to smoke free multi-family housing and track implementation and monitor community health outcomes. Partner with Alameda County Health Department, community-based organizations and academic researchers and others to evaluate local tobacco control and identify trends in population health in response to smoke-free multi-family ordinance passage."	Accept change to Program EJ-1.9
Draft CAP Workshop Comments (10/30/2023)			
Q	Micromobility/CAP Measures T-1	Regarding measures that encourage micro-mobility, the City should consider providing public bike locking areas, specifically around busy areas such as shopping centers.	The City is implementing the Bike and Pedestrian Master Plan and is pursuing grant funding specifically for this
R	CAP/GHG inventory	Commenter asked if Russell City Energy Center are incorporated in GHG inventory.	The electricity emissions factor is accounted for in the inventory, but the power plant itself is regulated by the California Air Resources Board and the Bay Area Air Quality Management District.
S	CAP Measure CS-1	Commenter asked which trees will be planted and which streets and areas will be getting new trees	City has a list of trees they generally choose from and the location of trees will be addressed in the upcoming Urban Forest Master Plan.
T	Equity	Commenter asked if the CAP specifically addressed gentrification	Equity guardrails were applied to electrification measures to help avoid displacement. Equity guardrails are included in section 6.4 of the draft CAP. While the CAP does not explicitly address gentrification, the Housing Element does.
U		Commenter asked if there is a plan to clean up local creeks	There are actions in the CAP that encourage green infrastructure, which will help filter stormwater. Regional Water Board is also installing filtration devices in the city to keep creeks clean.
V		Commenter asked if there has been collaboration between the City and Cal State East Bay and Chabot College to create the CAP.	Yes, the City has been working directly with Chabot and CSU EB to conduct interviews and get feedback on EJ and CAP policies. City staff also participates in CSUEB Sustainability team meetings.
W	CAP Measure CS-1	Commenter expressed concern over the removal of old trees for new developments in the City, and if City development is in direct opposition with CAP actions.	The City attempts to strike a balance between accommodating new population growth and minimizing impacts of development. By increasing development within Hayward, we reduce development (sprawl) in sensitive areas. Housing Element and State require development and a certain amounts of housing units every year.
X	Equity	Commenter asked how CAP outreach is conducted, and what future outreach will look like.	The City conducted significant outreach as part of the project and will continue through implementation. We intend to continue outreach efforts and build upon existing community and educational partnerships to expand outreach.
Y		Commenter expressed concern about companies purchasing carbon offsets and then not maintaining their trees after their obligations are complete.	City is focusing on tree planting and applying compost, and is not currently pursuing carbon offset markets.
Z	Equity/Airport	Commenter asked how airport emissions are addressed in the CAP. Concerned about fumes impacting surrounding neighborhoods which are typically BIPOC.	When low-emission aviation fuels are available and approved by the FAA, staff will stive to make them available at the Hayward Airport.
AA	Micromobility/CAP Measures T-1 and T-3	Commenter asked if the Hayward Loop will be modified to make it safer for bikes and scooter.	City was recently awarded a grant to consider safety improvements and re-evaluate the Loop.

			Section 11 of the CAP includes several actions related to water and wastewater, with an emphasis on conservation. Flood hazards are addressed in section 3 of the Hazards Element. To promote water conservation/use efficiency, the City has a water waste prohibition Ordinance in place that prohibits the use of potable water for non-essential purposes. In addition, the City's water system is fully metered and includes Advanced Metering Infrastructure (AMI), volumetric water rate pricing, conservation assistance and rebate programs, as well as public education and outreach efforts. The City and EBMUD, as Groundwater Sustainability Agencies for the East Bay Plain Subbasin, prepared a Groundwater Sustainability Plan to sustainably manage the groundwater in the basin.
AB	HAZ-4, HAZ-6.7	Commenter asked if the CAP addresses preparations for flooding and measures to make the City more drought-resilient	
AC	Synthetic Turf	Commenter asked how City will address synthetic turf. How will it be 'recycled' when it breaks down? Commenter asked if the speed of planting trees could be increased to provide more shade and make the City more walkable.	The City encourages native plants over synthetic turf lawns, and will explore possible regulation of synthetic turf. The City offers a Lawn Conversion Program that provides rebates to residents to convert their lawns to water-efficient landscapes. Rebates are not provided for synthetic turf. City tree planting is currently limited by staff capacity to maintain existing trees.
AD		Commenter asked how the CAP actions will be funded, cited cost of Shoreline Master Plan as a concern	Most Shoreline Master Plan projects will be grant funded. There are currently approximately five projects underway with the benefit of grant funding.
AE	CAP Measure CS-1	Commenter asked if CAP will declare protections or sanctuary areas for old trees in Hayward.	City recently received grant funding to inventory trees on public properties, which should help inform best management practices.
AF	Electrification	Commenter asked if there is a plan to increase reliability on the grid in tandem with increased reliance on it. Cited concerns about power outages.	Grid reliability is addressed by the California Energy Commission. Batteries, electric vehicles, and heat pump water heaters all have energy storage and scheduling capabilities that will help ease demands on the grid.
AG	CAP Measure CS-1	Trees should be planted near airport to address pollution and EJ issues.	City is working with a consultant to update tree preservation ordinance and develop guidelines for landscaping around the airport. City will put commenter in touch with City staff working on those projects and conducting outreach.
Planning Commission Comments (December 14, 2023)			
Commissioner Goodbody	CAP BE-1.7, BE-2.12, BE-3.9, T-4.10, T-4.8, T-4.2	Would like to see a roadmap of how CAP actions will be prioritized. Expressed that finding electrification incentives is critical and suggested prioritizing strengthening partnerships with Ava and utilizing their programs.	CAP actions will be prioritized in terms of timing and, to a lesser extent, GHG reduction potential. All actions will be needed to meet the GHG reduction goals. Timing for each action is indicated in Table 29 in the CAP. Annual reports to the City Council will document the implementation of the CAP.
Commissioner Goodbody	General CAP	Expressed concern about cost of electrification, suggested a tax on largest polluters in the city where 100% of proceeds could go to helping residents electrify.	Staff will investigate feasibility.
Commissioner Meyers	CAP T-1.2	Noted that CAP looks to reduce vehicle miles traveled, but vehicle minutes traveled may be an effective metric to measure idling. Asked staff if there is any plan in the future to include this metric, and how we can work on traffic management system to reduce idling time	Staff is looking into measuring vehicle minutes traveled and/or time spent idling. Furthermore, increased adoption of electric vehicles will reduce idling-related emissions.

			Solar is required by the state building code for certain building types. The City's Reach Code focuses on requiring appliance that do not use natural gas, preparing commercial buildings for future electrification, and installation of EV charging.
Commissioner Franco-Claussen	CAP/Equity	Asked if all new developments are required to have solar panels due to city reach requirement	
Commissioner Franco-Claussen	CAP/Equity	Asked how we can help low-income families get EVs.	The City will promote programs targeted to low income households, including the Air District's Clean Cars for All program.
Commissioner Franco-Claussen	CAP/Equity	Expressed concern that due to cost and language barriers, large population of Hayward will be excluded in the transition to cleaner transportation and buildings. Pollution isn't a choice but a necessity for low income families, how will we help them not get left behind?	The City will partner with community organizations to target communications to low income families.
Commissioner Franco-Claussen	CAP T-4.5	Partnerships should be prioritized, especially to help residents get EVs and hybrids.	Noted.
Commissioner Franco-Claussen	Outreach/Equity	Expressed need for outreach that meets residents at their homes, in their language, at the times they are home.	Noted.
Commissioner Stevens	HA2/EJ (find IDs)	Expressed concern over "where feasible" language in actions. Unclear as to who determines what is feasible and who assumes liability if nature-based solutions fail.	Feasibility and liability will be determined on a case by case basis.
Commissioner Stevens	CAP/Equity	Expressed concern over cost of CAP measures, asked who will be paying for program implementation	Funding sources will vary. Some costs will be borne by residents and homeowners, some by utilities, and others by grants.
Chair Lowe	CAP BE-1.1, 1.2, 2.11	Asked if 2030 is the year we would turn off natural gas	CAP actions are designed to gradually phase out the use of gas by 2045. Electrification efforts will focus on time of replacement, time of sale, and time of retrofit.
	CAP T-3	Asked how city is getting word out to everyone that single person vehicles are being disincentivized and natural gas will be turned off.	Communication methods will vary, but the City will partner with community organizations to target communications to low income families.
Commissioner Stevens	CAP/Natural Gas	Asked if natural gas appliances could be run on propane tanks in the event that natural gas lines are capped.	Generally, no.
Commissioner Stevens	CAP/Natural Gas	Asked if state or local agencies have done calculations of GHG reductions from transitioning from gas appliances to electric appliances and what the material impacts of this transition are.	There are studies that consider full lifecycle emissions, but the City focuses on the direct emissions of the appliance.
Commissioner Stevens	CAP/Natural Gas	Noted that a 100-year-old product that is maintained well is less energy intensive than replacing it, even if it runs on natural gas. Asked if there is any evidence that changing to electric appliances is more environmentally sustainable than maintaining our current appliances.	Electrification efforts will focus on time of replacement, time of sale, and time of retrofit.
Commissioner Franco-Claussen	CAP/Equity	Asked how families are going to afford cost of electrification	Most appliances will be transitioned to electric when existing equipment is ready for replacement. Incentives are available from BayREN and Ava Community Energy.
Commissioner Franco-Claussen	CAP/Outreach/Equity	Concerned about speed at which residents need to move to meet 2030 and 2045 targets. Expressed the need for opportunities, outreach, and programs for disadvantaged community members who will not be able to reach targets on proposed timeline	Noted.
Commissioner Stevens	CAP/Cost	Expressed concern about practicality and cost of actions.	Noted
Commissioner Patterson	CAP/Equity	Acknowledges that CoH is a leader in sustainability and has made positive progress, wants to see that continue, however is concerned about burden to residents, public outreach, cost of electrification without solar panels, and expressed need to see plans for how outreach will be conducted	Noted.
Chair Lowe	CAP/Equity	Concerned about cost of electrification, burden to the grid, how we will find the experts and staff needed to conduct more outreach	Noted.
Chair Lowe	CAP/Outreach/Equity	Still would like to continue being a leader in sustainability and meet goals for 2045, but expressed need to make actions equitable.	Noted.
Chair Lowe	CAP	Expressed overall support of CAP and work to perfect is over time as we gather more knowledge and resources.	Noted.

Commissioner Patterson	Outreach	Concerned about outreach conducted thus far. Did not see metrics of how many people were reached and what outreach targets were. No evidence that diverse groups of residents were engaged. Asked who has done the outreach and if metrics exist	Detailed outreach metrics were not recorded. Staff has noted this concern and will endeavor to collect this information going forward.
Commissioner Patterson	Outreach/Equity	Expressed concern that residents need to know about this upfront before it becomes a requirement.	Noted.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP/Equity	Asked how CAP aligns with Climate Crisis Emergency passed by City Council which encourages inclusive community engagement and diverse participation	The CAP update identified programs that will respond to the climate crisis emergency.
Commissioner Patterson	Outreach/Equity	Asked who community partners are and how City can strengthen those partnerships to help conduct outreach	The City does and will continue to partner with a variety of organizations include, school, higher education, and community based organizations.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP/Equity	Concerned about cost of electrification and heavier burden on lower income/disadvantaged residents	Noted.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP	Asked if there is a timeline or roadmap for achieving equitable electrification	This will be addressed in the existing home electrification roadmap.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP	Asked if seismic retrofitting would be included in electric-ready or electrification retrofits.	Staff will investigate feasibility.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP BE-1.8, 1.9	Asked if promoting the use of low carbon concrete will create an extra expense to builders and discourage development in the city	The extra cost of low carbon concrete is expected to decrease over time. The extra cost is one reason the City does not require it at this time.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-1.4	Why would micro-mobility devices be promoted “especially among lower income community members?” Is there research or other evidence suggesting that these are most useful, or more desirable for people with lower incomes? Or is there a problem that this would solve that is specific to lower income residents?	Micromobility will be promoted across all demographics as it helps to make public transportation more accessible. Financial incentives will be focused on lower income community members.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-1.7, 1.8, 1.9, T-2.3	The recommendations in Actions 1.7, 1.8, 1.9 and 2.3 regarding permanent street closures, traffic closures, removing traffic lanes, and designating some streets as “transit only,” all seem like they would increase traffic and idling, which seems to be in conflict with stated goals to reduce GHG emissions	Traffic congestion and idling will be considered before implementing any street closures.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-2.7	While well meaning, would this action discourage businesses from starting or continuing to operate in Hayward? Could we encourage this instead of requiring it? If not, would the cost of potentially losing businesses be worth what may be a small gain for the environment?	Staff will investigate feasibility of encouraging rather than requiring TDM plans. .
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-2.12	How is a congestion charge equitable? This is also mentioned in action T3.5.	Equitability will be assessed during the feasibility study phase of this program.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-3.1	Are any of the strategies stated in this action within the control of the City of Hayward? What incentives would be provided to residents or to employers outside of the City to make these changes?	The City has tools that may be used to disincentivize single passenger vehicles. Parking regulation or pricing is one example.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-3.3, 3.4	Actions 3.3 and 3.4 - I am concerned that charging for public parking in Downtown Hayward and near other businesses throughout the City could result in Hayward businesses losing customers	Noted.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-3.5	Penalizing the residents of Hayward with a “congestion charge” when people from all over the Bay Area contribute to the traffic in the city seems completely unfair and will only cause more hardship for Hayward’s residents. I also feel that this is in direct conflict with the stated goals of the Environmental Justice Element. I am not in favor of the strategy of disincentive-based policies and prefer all the EV actions that are listed in the Transportation Sector section of the CAP as an alternative way to drastically reduce GHG emissions in Hayward.	Noted.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-3.9	Wouldn’t this discourage the use of ride share services and conflict with stated goals that encourage less single passenger vehicle usage?	This would be studied during the feasibility study phase of the program.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-3.10	How would both parts of this action be implemented? Would the car registration tax be added to every car registered to an address in the City of Hayward? If so, couldn’t residents simply register their car to an address outside of the city? How would the exemption for low-income residents be managed?	Details of a possible registration tax would be determined at a later date and will consider these concerns.
Commissioner Patterson	CAP T-6.1	I imagine that this action would increase costs for the impacted business owners in Hayward. This cost would likely be passed along to residents, which might lead residents to hire businesses outside of the City that still use equipment that does not meet the zero emission standards.	This action focuses on providing information/education about state-wide regulations that prohibit the sale of new gasoline powered small engines.



November 14, 2023

Hayward City Council
777 B Street
Hayward, California 94541

Subject: Comments on the City of Hayward Environmental Justice Element, Hazard Element, and Climate Action Plan Drafts

Dear Hayward City Councilmembers and General Plan Team,

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments on the Hayward Environmental Justice (EJ) Element, Hazard Element, and Climate Action Plan (CAP) drafts. We are pleased to see that the drafts address climate impacts like sea level rise, urban heat, flood risk, and community health and encourage urban greening. Hayward's Regional Shoreline Resilience Master Plan (Shoreline Plan) makes it a leader in sea level rise and flood resilience planning, and we're glad that the General Plan draft commits to implementing the Shoreline Plan and coordinating with local and regional entities to adapt to sea level rise. We also appreciate the inclusion of strong policies to protect vulnerable communities from pollution, including pollution from toxic sites and groundwater.

In subsequent drafts of the Hazard and EJ Elements, we encourage you to provide more specificity in the sea level rise, flood resilience, and equity policies. In order to realize the following priorities, **we encourage you to include the specific line-edit suggestions at the bottom of this document to more comprehensively incorporate climate resilience, nature-based solutions, and equity into the Environmental Justice and Hazard Elements.**

- **Protect homes and facilities from current and future flood risk due to climate change.**
Update zoning and building codes to ensure new or significant construction and public infrastructure in flood risk zones can withstand future climate conditions. Understand and address flood risk due to stormwater.
- **Prioritize multi-benefit green solutions to address sea level rise, flooding, urban heat, air pollution, and water pollution. Integrate climate resilience into all stages of planning and project design.**

As Hayward faces more severe climate change, green stormwater infrastructure (such as urban greening and wetland restoration) can improve local water quality, minimize flooding by absorbing and filtering stormwater, increase shoreline resiliency, mitigate urban heat, and improve air quality. Incorporate nature-based resilience into all relevant policies, including those regarding transportation upgrades, shoreline resilience, and park access. Prioritize multi-benefit green solutions in communities with overlapping vulnerabilities.

- **Co-develop solutions with community groups, community members, and the Ohlone people, such that all people of Hayward feel ownership of the city and solutions reflect the lived experience of frontline communities.**

Prioritize climate resilience solutions within historically underrepresented communities and communities most vulnerable to climate impacts. Compensate community members and community groups for their involvement and expertise.

- **Protect Environmental Justice (EJ) communities from exposure to air pollution and toxics.**

Environmental Justice communities are disproportionately exposed to air pollution and toxics. We appreciate that the draft EJ Element includes policies to use nature-based solutions to buffer communities from air pollution, monitor the cleanup of toxic sites, and provide health monitoring to vulnerable communities. In subsequent drafts, the City should explore moving polluting industries away from residential zones, incorporate climate change projections into toxic risk assessments, and require full cleanup of toxic sites before allowing housing to be built nearby.

- **Update the Climate Action Plan to include climate adaptation measures.**

We applaud Hayward for creating a Climate Action Plan and committing to ambitious greenhouse gas emissions reductions. In future iterations of the CAP, we strongly urge the City to include climate adaptation measures in addition to mitigation measures. Including climate adaptation in the CAP can allow the City to develop its climate resilience policies beyond what is in the Hazard Element, including creating a funding plan and timeline, assigning department/staff roles, and providing more policy details¹.

The following specific recommendations draw on reports and guidance created by regional agencies and nonprofits. These include Save The Bay's Position Paper on [San Francisco Bay Sea Level Rise & Flood Strategy](#), Greenbelt Alliance's [Resilience Playbook](#), the San Francisco Estuary Institute's [SF Bay Shoreline Adaptation Atlas](#), and the San Mateo County Flood & Sea Level Rise Resiliency District's (OneShoreline) [Planning Policy Guidance](#).

Sincerely,

David Lewis
Executive Director
Save The Bay

Victor Flores
East Bay Resilience Manager
Greenbelt Alliance

¹ Climate Resolve. "Ounce of Prevention: Advancing Equitable Climate Resilience Planning in California"
<https://www.climateresolve.org/ounce-of-prevention/>

Hazard Element Line Edits

Line Edits <i>Current General Plan draft language is in black.</i> <i>Our line edits are in red.</i>	Additional Explanation/Feedback
HAZ-4.3 Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan The City shall coordinate with Oakland, San Leandro, Alameda County, the Hayward Area Shoreline Planning Agency, the Bay Conservation and Development Commission, and other agencies to expand and restore wetland habitat and increase shoreline resilience through the implementation of the Hayward Regional Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan, and will align the Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan with BCDC guidelines when they are adopted.	We congratulate Hayward on being a leader in the Bay Area on shoreline resilience planning with its Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan. With the passage of SB 272, the Bay Conservation and Development Commission is required to establish guidelines by December 31, 2024 to guide local sea level rise plans. Hayward’s Regional Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan should be updated if needed to align with these guidelines.
HAZ-4.6 Adaptation Atlas The City shall partner with regional jurisdictions to incorporate the findings of the San Francisco Estuary Institute’s SF Bay Area Adaptation Atlas including commitments to nature-based measures, grey infrastructure, policy and regulatory measures, and financial measures. Nature-based measures will be considered before grey infrastructure in flood resilience projects.	We appreciate Hayward’s commitment to implementing Adaptation Atlas recommendations, and we urge the City to prioritize the nature-based adaptation measures described in the Adaptation Atlas before considering grey infrastructure. Nature-based measures provide a host of benefits beyond flood protection including biodiversity, recreational, and climate mitigation benefits.
HAZ-4.7 Adaptation Programs and Standards <i>[Add two bullet points and revise one bullet point:]</i> - Identifying the location, condition, material, age, and elevation of underground utilities to determine which assets will need to be upgraded to account for sea level and shallow groundwater rise, in collaboration with water, sewer, energy, solid waste, and telecommunication service providers. - Creating an implementation plan to upgrade critical equipment and facilities including pump stations, generators, tide gates, stream gages, open channel, and culvert/pipeline	The need to upgrade underground utilities was identified in SFEI’s “Shallow Groundwater Response to Sea-Level Rise” report as a necessary step in preparing city infrastructure for groundwater rise.

infrastructure when needed and aligning the plan with the Capital Improvement Plan. Installing nature based and grey infrastructure around areas projected to be impacted by sea level rise, with priority given to nature-based infrastructure.	
HAZ-4.9 Groundwater Management Plan The City shall coordinate with Alameda County Flood Control & Water Conservation District to develop a Shallow Groundwater Management Plan to identify feasible strategies for managing rising groundwater tables from sea level rise and storm surges. The plan will include a watershed-level model of groundwater rise, establish a Shallow Groundwater Overlay District, and implement related building standards within the overlay district to ensure that buildings are resilient to groundwater rise, saltwater intrusion, liquefaction, and toxic contaminants.	Establishing a Shallow Groundwater Rise Overlay District is consistent with HAZ-6.9 which commits to establishing climate overlay zones. OneShoreline’s Planning Policy Guidance offers model language for establishing a Shallow Groundwater Rise Overlay district and related standards. The recommended area for the overlay district is the area that may experience shallow (water table between 1-2m depth) to emergent (water table at surface) groundwater with 6.6 feet of sea level rise. We recommend updating the groundwater rise map on Page 3-148 to include groundwater risk at 6.9 ft of sea level rise.
HAZ-4.10 Increase Flood Protection Standards for New Construction and Renovations The City shall incorporate sea level rise into the municipal code and establish a Sea Level Rise Overlay District to require compliance with base floor elevation and flood-proofing requirement to mid-century sea levels. Update building codes to require new or significant construction in the Sea Level Rise Overlay District to build at least 4 feet of freeboard. Require new or significant construction within 100 feet of the shoreline to contribute to regional shoreline infrastructure (unless existing infrastructure protects against projected flooding) and to contribute to Bay Trail access. Consider unconventional design elements that may allow structures to accommodate a higher water table and higher liquefaction risks.	Establishing a sea level rise overlay district is consistent with HAZ-6.9 which commits to establishing climate overlay zones. The building standard suggestions are drawn from OneShoreline’s Planning Policy Guidance. They are also consistent with Haywards Regional Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan Policy Recommendations, which include increasing standards for new construction and considering an amount of freeboard applied in flood zones. We support the consideration of unconventional design elements. This video by Dr. Kristina Hill describes a floating house concept, a possible innovative design to protect housing from floods and earthquakes.

Goal HAZ-6 [Add new policy] Plan for Long-Term Growth Management and Potential Strategic Relocation As sea level rise and groundwater rise progress, consider zoning changes to reduce growth in the Industrial District and encourage land uses to move inland if necessary.	This policy is consistent with policy recommendation 6 in the Hayward Regional Shoreline Adaptation Master Plan. The plan states, “Over the long-term, higher levels of sea level rise may create groundwater conditions that can no longer be managed through stormwater management strategies and will require land to either be significantly elevated or land uses to move inland...Over the long-term, it may be necessary to limit additional growth and investment in the industrial district to develop a longer-term plan for more substantial changes in built form, or relocating to a safer, more viable location. To promote reduced growth in this area in the future, zoning could be changed to other districts that allow for lower intensity of uses like Flood Plain Districts or Open Space/Parks and Recreation Districts.”
HAZ-6.6 Transportation Corridors The City shall improve the resiliency of transportation infrastructure by identifying highly trafficked active transportation and commute patterned streets and prioritizing the creation of “complete green streets”, including permeable pavement, shading, lighting, biodiversity, flood resilience, pedestrian and bike lane safety, and drinking water improvements.	This aligns with Goal 3 (Complete Streets) in the City’s Mobility Element which defines “complete streets” as “streets designed and constructed to serve all users of streets, roads, and highways, regardless of their age or ability, or whether they are driving, walking, bicycling, or taking transit.”
HAZ-6.7 Parks and Open Space Resilience Protect open spaces, habitats, and parks impacted by sea level rise, floods, drought, extreme heat, and wildfire including: • Protect existing floodplains, open space, and other natural features that provide flood storage by establishing minimum buffers, limiting new development in wetlands and buffers. Establishes buffer zones at least 100 ft from the Bay shoreline and at least 35 ft from the top of creek banks. If new development is allowed in these areas,	The first suggestion is from OneShoreline’s Planning Policy Guidance recommended policies, and the second is a priority described in Greenbelt Alliance’s Resilience Playbook and is consistent with Goal EJ-2 to “ensure that residents in Hayward have access to a diverse range of public facilities to promote community wellbeing and resource access”. To prioritize greening in vulnerable areas the City can use its existing pollution burden map from the EJ Element and urban heat island

require it to contribute to regional shoreline resilience infrastructure. • Protect and expand large, continuous greenspaces such as parks, median strips and street trees wherever possible for greater cooling magnitude and extent. Include a mix of grass and trees for greatest cooling benefits. Prioritize greening in most vulnerable areas with high pollution, heat, and flood burden and engage frontline communities in the design and placement of green features.	maps from CalEPA. It may need to do additional flood modeling to identify areas that are at highest risk of flooding under future flood conditions.
HAZ-6.9 Climate Overlay Zones The City shall establish hazard overlay zones. Overlay designations shall be developed to address potential future at-risk areas, such as areas prone to wildfire, subsidence, future floodplain or area of temporary inundation, or area at risk for high wind/storm events due to future climate change impact models. Apply overlay zones to areas with the greatest current hazards and/or future climate impacts. Associate corresponding risk reduction, adaptation policies, and standards specific to the hazard or climate impact. Overlay zones should include development standards for appropriate risk mitigation measures. As much as possible, the City should prioritize building affordable housing near jobs and transit and outside of the Climate Overlay Zones.	This is consistent with the City’s Housing Element site simulation recommendation to “limit residential development near...areas located near the shore because of climate change-induced sea level rise” and is a priority described in Greenbelt Alliance’s Resilience Playbook.
Goal HAZ-6 <i>[Add new policy]</i> Require major development and redevelopment projects to construct and maintain urban greening projects in the adjacent public right of way.	This policy is recommended in Greenbelt Alliance’s Resilience Playbook.
Goal HAZ-6 <i>[Add new policy]</i> New infrastructure projects (including bike/ped and traffic calming infrastructure, road upgrades, public plaza redevelopment, tree planting, or utility upgrades) will be reviewed for alignment with the	This will ensure that there are no missed opportunities in implementing the GSI plan, as per section C.3 of the Municipal Regional Stormwater Permit.

City's GSI plan and feasibility of inclusion of green stormwater infrastructure elements.	
Goal HAZ-6 <i>[Add new policy]</i> The City will identify areas at risk of flooding due to storms and will create a Storm Drain Master Plan that ensures the storm drain system has the capacity to function under future precipitation conditions. It will prioritize storm drain upgrade and green stormwater infrastructure projects based on flood risk and disadvantaged community status.	The Hazard Element draft includes maps of areas exposed to flood risk due to sea level rise and groundwater rise. However, the City currently lacks a comprehensive understanding of inland flood risk and areas prone to flooding due to storms, which will only become more extreme as climate change advances.

Environmental Justice Element Line Edits

Line Edits <i>Current General Plan draft language is in black.</i> <i>Our line edits are in red.</i>	Additional Explanation/Feedback
Goal EJ-1 <i>[Add new policy]</i> Evaluate and map areas with overlapping climate vulnerabilities, including income, pollution burden, heat burden, flood risk, and lack of greenspace.	This analysis will help Hayward prioritize its EJ programs and projects in the most vulnerable communities. In order to do this analysis, Hayward may need to do additional flood modeling to identify areas that are at highest risk of flooding under future flood conditions.
Policy EJ-1.2 Urban Greening Develop urban greening initiatives along major arterials to protect sensitive receptors from traffic related pollution, especially Diesel Particulate Matter pollution. Prioritize greening in areas with the highest pollution burden.	
Program EJ-1.3: Partner with and support Hayward Unified School District to install MERV-13 air filtration systems in all local schools to reduce the impacts from air pollution, especially Particulate Matter pollution. Prioritize updating HEPA air filtration systems in schools experiencing the highest pollution burden.	
Program EJ-1.5: Prepare and publish an annual report identifying the location and status of local cleanup sites and hazardous waste facilities to keep residents informed about local polluting sources. Identify sites that are at risk of contaminant mobilization due to sea level or groundwater rise.	There are hundreds of hazardous sites in the Bay Area that will be exposed to sea level rise by 2100, over 20 of which are in Hayward. Identifying which are at highest risk of inundation may require watershed scale groundwater rise modeling, which we recommend including as a line edit in policy HAZ-4.9.
Policy EJ-1.7 Targeted Health Monitoring Coordinate with the Alameda County Public Health Department to actively monitor and actively support the health of residents living in-proximity to hazardous waste facilities and cleanup sites.	No line edits, but we appreciate the inclusion of this important policy.

• Program EJ-1.6: Develop a community protection program that offers health resources, monitoring, and additional supports to residents living within a one half-mile radius of a hazardous waste facility or cleanup site.	
Policy EJ-1.14 Cleanup Sites Proactively monitor the progress of local cleanup sites to ensure that all site remediation efforts are being handled in a timely and effective manner. Determine which cleanup sites are most at risk of toxic substances being mobilized due to flooding from sea level and groundwater rise, according to the latest available science (including the DTSC Sea Level Rise Guidance for Cleanup Activities). In addition, new housing should not be approved or built on or near hazardous sites in flood-prone areas before cleanup has been completed. Cleanup standards should be developed in partnership with frontline communities, take into account cumulative pollution exposure, and require that contaminants are disposed of in the least harmful way possible.	DTSC's home page for updating their cleanup guidance is found here Frontline communities and community organizations such as the SF Bay Shoreline Contamination Cleanup Coalition have advocated for decades for toxic sites to be fully cleaned to community standards before any housing is built on or near the site.
Policy EJ-1.16 Groundwater Contamination Require that permeable reactive barriers (PRBs) or diversion walls are developed on or immediately adjacent to contaminated sites to protect the groundwater within Hayward. Identify and upgrade sewer pipes in areas at risk of Volatile Organic Compound (VOC) mobilization due to rising groundwater.	Use watershed-level groundwater modeling to map which areas are at highest risk. Upgrading sewer lines at risk of VOC exposure is necessary to prevent harmful vapor intrusion into homes and buildings.
Policy EJ-1.18 Proximity to Pollution Sources The City shall avoid locating new sensitive uses such as schools, childcare centers, and senior housing in proximity to sources of pollution, odors, or near existing businesses that handle toxic materials. Where such uses are located in proximity to sources of air pollution, odors, or toxic materials, the City shall require that building design, construction safeguards, and technological techniques to mitigate the negative impacts of hazardous materials	

and/or air pollution on indoor air quality. Explore the use of zoning ordinances and incentives to move polluting industries away from residential areas in the long term.	
Policy EJ-2.2 Existing Park Quality Work with HARD to improve the quality and safety of existing parks with a focus on areas with the lowest number of park acreage per capita. Incorporate green stormwater infrastructure designed to provide multiple benefits, such as flood prevention, trash capture, heat mitigation, and biodiversity.	This aligns with the City’s Public Facilities and Services Element Goal 5.4 (Green Stormwater Infrastructure) priority.
Policy EJ-2.4 Green Space through Residential Development Require future medium-density and high-density development to incorporate green space as part of the development review process to meet community need across the City. Design greenspace to provide multiple benefits when possible, including flood mitigation, pollution prevention, heat mitigation, and biodiversity. Prioritize building green space in DACs and low-income neighborhoods. Engage the community in the process of developing greenspace.	
Policy EJ-2.7 Active Transportation Support active transportation in Hayward by facilitating the timely and effective implementation of the programs and policies outlined within the Hayward Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan & Multimodal Intersection Implementation Plan and Nexus Study. Prioritize creating “complete green streets” and evaluate any road upgrade projects for inclusion of green stormwater features such as permeable pavement, planters, and bioswales.	This aligns with Goal 3 (Complete Streets) in the City’s Mobility Element which defines “complete streets” as “streets designed and constructed to serve all users of streets, roads, and highways, regardless of their age or ability, or whether they are driving, walking, bicycling, or taking transit.” Flood resilience is an important part of street safety and usability.
Policy EJ-4.2. Home Maintenance Programs Promote home safety by developing public programs that subsidize home-maintenance projects for low-income residents and provide public resources for necessary home improvements. Include subsidies for residents to add green	These projects can protect homes from flooding and excessive heat.

infrastructure like rain gardens and tree canopy to their homes.	
Policy EJ-5.4 Tree Canopy Support active transportation by preserving existing and increasing tree canopy through implementation of an expanded urban greening initiative. Prioritize preserving and increasing tree canopy in EJ communities. As part of urban greening initiatives, evaluate projects for inclusion of green stormwater components for flood resilience and pollution prevention.	This aligns with Goal 8 (Urban Forest) in the City's Community Health Element. We also recommend that the EJ Element include a map of existing tree canopy and plans to increase it in order to identify areas that have low tree canopy or suffer from high urban heat.
Policy EJ-6.2. Community Engagement Host City led community engagement meetings at times and locations that are accessible to a diversity of community members including but not limited to hosting meetings at multiple timeslots, in varying locations and with translation services. Compensate community members for their time.	



Hayward Area Recreation and Park District

Board of Directors

Louis M. Andrade
Rick J. Hatcher
Paul W. Hodges, Jr.
Sara Lamnin
Peter Rosen

General Manager

James Wheeler

November 2, 2023

City of Hayward
777 B Street
Hayward, CA 94541

Re: Environmental Justice Element of the General Plan

Dear City of Hayward,

We are writing to you on behalf of the Hayward Area Recreation and Park District (H.A.R.D. or District). Recently, H.A.R.D. renewed the lease agreement to be the Park and Recreation provider for the City of Hayward and currently manages and operates over 30 City of Hayward Parks. As such, collaboration and communication are key to achieving the goals of the Environmental Justice Element and providing the highest quality parks for all residents regardless of where you live or what you have. Therefore, the District is writing to support the Environmental Justice Element of the General Plan but wants to provide some feedback to ensure the efforts are consistent and to highlight the current initiatives and projects. H.A.R.D. staff can come during a meeting to discuss these items and provide context if necessary.

We are writing on behalf of our organization to provide feedback on the Environmental Justice Element of the General Plan. We have several points we would like to discuss:

1. Policy EJ 2-1 – Park Connectivity Assessment:

The District continuously looks for ways to improve connectivity between parks throughout the City of Hayward and the District Boundaries. As such, the District would favor a City-wide connectivity assessment of all assets, including parks. This report could give insight into the planning of bike lanes, greenways, and other possibilities to increase connectivity.

- Additionally, the District is working on the San Lorenzo Creek trail, which will connect the Bay Trail to the Ridge Trail, incorporating the first such connection in the East Bay. This, in conjunction with the Eden Greenway and other pathways, has begun to connect different sections of the city to ensure that everyone has equal access to all parks and recreational opportunities.
- The Foothill Trail is another connectivity investment, by developing a trail along the Foothill Corridor in Hayward. The Trail will provide a route for travel and recreation linking the Industrial Parkway in the South and Union City to open spaces, parks, downtown Hayward, and Cal State East Bay.



Hayward Area Recreation and Park District

Board of Directors

Louis M. Andrade
Rick J. Hatcher
Paul W. Hodges, Jr.
Sara Lamnin
Peter Rosen

General Manager

James Wheeler

2. Policy EJ 2.2/2.3 – Existing Park Quality/Increase Parks in Central Hayward:

The District fully supports increasing park access and availability in Central Hayward. Over the past few years, the City of Hayward has increased the number of units in Central Hayward through large-scale developments such as So Hay, with additional developments coming online as well. These new developments in conjunction with an already dense community, and the City's commitment to transit-oriented development, have exasperated the need for new parks. As the City's Nexus study states: "Park impact fees are paid by new development to help pay a portion of the costs required to build capital facilities needed to serve the new development." The District believes that these impact fees are critical for developing new parks and facilities in areas that currently have less than 3 acres of park space per 1,000 residents. It is, therefore, the desire of the District for the City to provide these fees to H.A.R.D. to achieve this goal.

- Additionally, due to the current restraints on available land in Central Hayward, additional care and collaboration are needed to identify areas that could be converted into parks, pocket parks, or greenways. This could be an opportunity to achieve the stated goals in smaller versions. Also, there may be a need for more innovative solutions that use other types of areas to develop parks. Lastly, to increase park "access," the City and H.A.R.D. should look at connectivity for all parks to improve access to a wide variety of parks through safe corridors and greenways.

3. Policy EJ 2.3 – Increase Parks In Central Hayward:

The District would want to see this area more firmly defined in the document. To achieve this goal, the District needs to understand the need better. Particularly as it relates to new developments in the pipeline and identifying sources of funds to build parks in these communities.

- Additionally, like the above statement, the District will need to receive the Impact Fees from the City to have a funding stream to support the expansion of parks in this part of the City.

4. EJ. 2.5 Public Safety:

The District already considers CPTED when designing and building new parks. Therefore, the requirement for H.A.R.D. to consider it may be redundant. Additionally, the District may be interested in expanding CPTED beyond the park boundaries but view it for the sidewalks, streets, and surrounding area.

- Another area of possible collaboration is for H.A.R.D.'s Public Safety Division and Hayward Police Department to collaborate better. The public safety team's goal is to ensure the safety of our patrons, though they are



Hayward Area Recreation and Park District

Board of Directors

Louis M. Andrade
Rick J. Hatcher
Paul W. Hodges, Jr.
Sara Lamnin
Peter Rosen

General Manager

James Wheeler

not equipped or trained to apprehend or arrest anyone for violations. Better communication and collaboration between the two organizations should improve feelings of safety at the park.

- Additionally, propping up Hayward initiatives, such as the HEART program, is another way to improve security. These issues in parks are complex and require cross-department and cross-organizational collaboration.

5. Additional Comments:

Within the technical report and the Health and Physical Activity Policies and Program section, staff and consultants have identified the need to increase the number of available multi-use facilities. This is a goal that the District has also heard throughout meetings with residents and other advisory groups. The element should incorporate Hayward Unified School District as they hold many available multi-use facilities. HUSD also has access to public greenspace and outdoor facilities for recreation and leisure. By opening up some of these sites, the City may have a better opportunity to reach the Park Standards mentioned in EJ Policy 2.10 and EJ Policy 2.2.

We support the Environmental Justice Element in principle, but we also have reservations about whether all items included can be accomplished given current resources and constraints. We look forward to further discussion on these matters and how we can work together to achieve these goals and find ways to leverage existing resources so they have the most significant impact in improving the health and wellness of all Hayward residents.

Best regards,

James Wheeler
General Manager
Hayward Area Recreation and Park District

From: [Tony Marks-Block](#)
To: [Environment](#)
Subject: Draft CAP comments
Date: Wednesday, November 15, 2023 6:55:42 AM

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Greetings,

Thank you all for your efforts on the Draft CAP - I think it is an ambitious and important document.

There are a few critical omissions that I believe should be addressed to ensure Hayward leads in de-carbonization and environmental justice.

There is no analysis of the Hayward airport as an important source of CO2 emissions and contributor to human health harms. There should minimally be an analysis of the contributions to GHGs and pollutants (e.g., particulate matter). Private jet and plane travel should be drastically reduced, just as other emission sources are planned to be reduced in Hayward.

I also believe the City of Hayward should adopt prescribed fire as a management tool to reduce hazards associated with wildfire. The City's of Orinda and Moraga have adopted this strategy successfully. The best way to reduce the risk of wildfire is to apply fire to the landscape when conditions are safe. Otherwise, the City of Hayward is delaying the inevitable.

Lastly, the Draft CAP and environmental justice supplement makes no mention of Ohlone people's. Their erasure from these documents is, in and of itself, an environmental and social justice issue. They should be consulted and included in such a document, particularly because of their longstanding stewardship of Hayward, preceding the City's urban development.

Thank you for your time, and please let me know if you have any questions.

Dr. Tony Marks-Block
 Assistant Professor of Environmental Studies
 Campus Sustainability Committee
 CSU East Bay

From: [Environment](#)
To: ["Ben Schweng"](#)
Subject: RE: climate action plant workshop comments
Date: Thursday, October 26, 2023 4:55:28 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Thank you for your comments, Ben.

The Environmental Services Team will take your comments into consideration.

Best,
Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist

Public Works & Utilities Department

City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541

☎ Phone: 510.583.4727 | ✉ Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov



From: Ben Schweng <ben@cyclepathhayward.com>

Sent: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 2:51 PM

To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>

Subject: climate action plant workshop comments

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Hi,

I cannot attend the meeting but I have a few comments for the Monday October 30th workshop:

1. Encouraging drivers to get out of their single occupancy vehicles is essential to combating climate change.
2. Hayward has an order of magnitude higher rate of sidewalk bike riding than the rest of Alameda County. Sidewalk bike riding is largely a measure of how unsafe bike riders feel about the street.
3. Hayward needs a Bicycle Pedestrian Advocacy Committee to help oversee all transportation projects, and ensure development of safe bicycling routes. Hayward is probably the only city of its size in the greater Bay Area that does not have one. Without safe INFRASTRUCTURE, we are never going to get the mode shift required to reduce greenhouse gases.

--

Ben Schweng
Cyclepath Hayward
22510 Foothill Blvd
Hayward CA 94541
510.881.5177

From: [Environment](#)
To: [Dave Pryor](#)
Subject: RE:
Date: Thursday, October 26, 2023 5:08:00 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Dave,

Thank you for your comments, they have been noted.

Best,
Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist

Public Works & Utilities Department

City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541

☎ Phone: 510.583.4727 | ✉ Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov



From: Dave Pryor <mrmarklin@aol.com>
Sent: Thursday, October 26, 2023 12:47 PM
To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject:

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

You all realize that the so called climate "problem" is based on manipulated computer models and faulty data collection, Right???

In other words: nonsense.

David Pryor, CPA

(650) 697-2727

1650 Borel Place

Suite 120

San Mateo, CA 94402

(650) 697-2727 ph

(650) 239-5055 fx

<http://www.cpfcpas.com/>

DISCLAIMER

Any accounting, business or tax advice contained in this communication, including attachments and enclosures, is not intended as a thorough, in-depth analysis of specific issues, nor a substitute for a formal opinion, nor is it sufficient to avoid tax-related penalties. If desired, Crisafi, Pryor & Farquhar, Inc. would be pleased to perform the requisite research and provide you with a detailed written analysis. Such an engagement may be the subject of a separate engagement letter that would define the scope and limits of the desired consultation services.

PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL

This communication and any accompanying documents are confidential and privileged. They are intended for the sole use of the addressee. If you receive this transmission in error, you are advised that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or the taking of any action in reliance upon this communication is strictly prohibited. Moreover, any such disclosure shall not compromise or waive the attorney-client, accountant-client, or other privileges as to this communication or otherwise. If you have received this communication in error, please contact me at the above email address. Thank you.

From: [Environment](#)
To: dt745kitty@icloud.com
Subject: RE: Question
Date: Monday, October 30, 2023 4:21:00 PM

Hi Diana,

This is a very valid concern and important question. There are a few key ways grid reliability is being improved. As a City, it is not within our power to physically upgrade power lines as they belong to and are serviced by Pacific Gas & Electric (PG&E) and the California Public Utilities Commissions (CPUC). However, when the situation arises, Hayward works with PG&E to upgrade transformers in our area and improve energy reliability. As a customer of PG&E, it is well within your rights to ask your provider what they are doing to avoid shutdowns. PG&E has some information about this readily available here: https://www.pge.com/en_US/residential/outages/public-safety-power-shutoff/why-psps-events-occur.page.

In particular, it is PG&E's responsibility to ensure that the transmission lines are upgraded to handle increased demand. The CPUC and PG&E entered an agreement in 2019 that required PG&E to procure at least 716 megawatts (MW) of system reliability to come online between 2021-2023. They currently have six projects within their service area upgrading transmission lines that will total more than 1,000 MW. As electricity demand increases, PG&E will be expected to continue to identify transmission areas to upgrade. Information about their ongoing transmission projects can be found here: https://www.pge.com/en_US/safety/electrical-safety/safety-initiatives/transmission-project-overview.page

Electrification will be a gradual process. There are checks and balances in place that won't allow for massive electrification without enough energy to supply it. But I urge you to continue to ask this question, especially of our utility providers.

Thank you!
Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist
Public Works & Utilities Department
City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541
C Phone: 510.583.4727 | Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: Diana Thornton <dt745kitty@icloud.com>
Sent: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 11:35 PM
To: HousingElementUpdate <HousingElementUpdate@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Question

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

What are you doing NOW to prepare a power grid to handle the increased electric need? We have blackouts now!

Diana Thornton

From: [Environment](#)
To: [dil se](#)
Subject: RE: Climate
Date: Thursday, October 26, 2023 4:52:00 PM

Thank you for your comment Ezna, the Environmental Services Team has it noted.

Thanks,
Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist
Public Works & Utilities Department
City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541
C Phone: 510.583.4727 | Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: dil se <ezna_khan@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 10:22 AM
To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Climate

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Please make sure that all the people in south hayward renting apartments. Owners should check their old heaters before winter. For gas leak. Would really appreciate it Thank you city of Hayward doing such a great job.
Ezna khan
Sent from my iPhone

From: [Nicole Grucky](#)
To: jim@jimclark.net
Subject: RE: NO on mis-guided Climate Agenda
Date: Monday, October 30, 2023 2:51:30 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Jim,

Thank you for providing your comments, our team has noted them.

Best,
 Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist

Public Works & Utilities Department

City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541

☎ Phone: 510.583.4727 | ✉ Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov



From: Jim Clark <jim@jimclark.net>
Sent: Thursday, October 26, 2023 4:32 PM
To: HousingElementUpdate <HousingElementUpdate@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: NO on mis-guided Climate Agenda

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

I am writing to advise that you not implement this anti-consumer climate agenda.

Hayward residents and Californians in general are going broke faster every day due to the crazy policies you are coming up with. Your policies cost us money, and this latest one may actually cost lives as the forced reduction in standard of living will necessitate. Forcing homeowners to transition to electric power for everything is horribly mis-guided. Our utility cannot keep up with the new demand for power required by EV's. Now you want to pile on home heating and cooking? The answer is clear, we don't think you care at all. Not about us and certainly not about environment.

Please STOP!!

 Jim Clark <><
jim@jimclark.net
 408-781-1425

From: [Environment](#)
To: [John Ostarello](#)
Subject: RE: Trees
Date: Monday, October 30, 2023 2:47:00 PM
Attachments: [Suggested Nurseries by BFL.pdf](#)

Hi John,

I reached out to our landscaping team, and the City is not able to provide a list given that there are so many factors that need to be considered when planting a tree, including soil, shade, etc. Our recommendation is to consult a local nursery to give you the best advice for your specific needs. I've included an attachment of recommended nurseries from ReScape, formerly the Bay Friendly Coalition.

Thanks,
Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist
Public Works & Utilities Department
City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541
C Phone: 510.583.4727 | Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: John Ostarello <john.ostarello@csueastbay.edu>
Sent: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 2:24 PM
To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Trees

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

I see that the plan is suggesting that more trees be planted. I happen to be exploring the purchase of some trees to replace the ones that I have lost in last year's storms. Consequently, I have encountered a number of problems and have not been able to find suitable answers. eg, What type of tree should I plant that doesn't use much water, doesn't get too tall, doesn't require a lot of maintenance, likes a south facing slope, will hold the earth when extreme rainy weather hits. and doesn't cost too much. A lot of "experts" toss out the standard answers that can be found in an abundance of sources. How about some concrete offerings - even to the point of "we recommend these trees..."

From: [Environment](#)
To: [Kevin Athanacio](#)
Subject: RE: Draft plan input/question - apartment specific
Date: Thursday, October 26, 2023 5:04:00 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Thank you for your comments, Kevin. And you are correct, you are the not the first person to voice these concerns.

Currently the City is working with Habitat for Humanity with grant funding to pilot electrification home repairs at no-cost to low-income homeowner occupied properties in Hayward to identify solutions. The City is also working with Local Clean Energy Alliance with grant funding on electrification outreach, especially targeting our Spanish speaking population.

Additionally, one of the actions in the draft CAP is:

BE 3.4 – Conduct feasibility studies to identify commercial and multi-family building decarbonization barriers and develop a commercial and multi-family building decarbonization strategy with analysis supporting future adoption of a commercial and multi-family decarbonization ordinance.

When that CAP action is implemented, the City would conduct further outreach and research on how the City could implement electrification/decarbonization in an equitable way for our multi-family complexes before adopting any required policies.

Thanks,
Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist

Public Works & Utilities Department

City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541

☎ Phone: 510.583.4727 | ✉ Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov



From: Kevin Athanacio <kevin@calpreferred.com>
Sent: Thursday, October 26, 2023 6:23 AM
To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Draft plan input/question - apartment specific

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Good day –

I will be out of town and not available for the meeting but thank you for the opportunity to ask

questions.

Simply as an owner/operator of apartment buildings in the City of Hayward that are older and more reliant on gas (water heaters, wall heaters, ranges, etc.) – what can we do or what assistance might be provided. Just switching to electric is not an option as the electricity provided to the building/units is insufficient (can barely keep up with modern demands) and adding service requires a major overhaul certainly out of the scope of our budgets. I am certain you have heard this raised before & it has been a stall point in other cities.

Thank you for your time – would be great to have some options that make sense.

Kevin Athanacio

650-454-0932

From: [Environment](#)
To: [Peter Reimer](#)
Subject: RE: Question(s)
Date: Monday, October 30, 2023 11:52:00 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Hi Peter,

Great questions!

Most cities have Climate Action Plans (CAPs) which will usually include an inventory of annual greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, or they will have a standalone GHG inventory. These documents are publicly available and are usually on city websites. GHG inventories typically do not measure individual gas emissions like CO₂, but combine all greenhouse gasses including carbon, methane, nitrous oxide, and fluorinated gases in Metric Tons of Carbon Dioxide Equivalent (MT CO₂e). CO₂e is used because different GHGs have different intensities (called warming potentials); in this measurement each gas is converted to be quantified at the intensity of CO₂. In our most recent GHG inventory for 2021, Hayward's GHG emissions totaled 609,918 MT CO₂e, a breakdown of emissions by sector and full report can be found [here](#). Below are a few GHG emission totals I found listed in other cities' Climate Action Plans (a quick Google search of "(city name) climate action plan" did the trick). Totals are greatly dependent on city population, among other factors. Unincorporated areas are not calculated in city GHG inventories because they are under county jurisdiction.

1. According to most recently available inventories that I found through other cities' websites, here's how other cities in Alameda County stack up:
 - a. Oakland (2019): 2,627,604 MT CO₂e
 - b. Fremont (2018): 1,242,786 MT CO₂e
 - c. **Hayward (2021): 609,918 MT CO₂e**
 - d. Pleasanton (2017): 588,553 MT CO₂e
 - e. San Leandro (2017): 573,300 MT CO₂e
 - f. Livermore (2017): 535,566 MT CO₂e
 - g. Berkeley (2022): ~500,000 MT CO₂e
 - h. Albany (2017): 55,485 MT CO₂e
2. Here are a few totals from other cities in the Bay Area:
 - a. SF: 4,600,000 MT CO₂e
 - b. Marin: 380,318 MT CO₂e
 - c. San Jose: 4,957,644 MT CO₂e
 - d. San Mateo: 541,960 MT CO₂e
3. I would recommend visiting city websites if you're interested in seeing emissions from a certain region, but here some other CA cities:
 - a. Salinas (2019): 599,900
 - b. Oxnard (2018): 876,140
 - c. Humboldt (2015): 1,446,844 (includes unincorporated areas since this is a county wide CAP, however the county overall population is less than City of Hayward)
 - d. San Diego (2019): 10,532,000 MT CO₂e
 - e. Beverly Hills (2019): 418,271 MT CO₂e (for comparison the population of BH is 10,480; Hayward population is 162,950).

I want to emphasize that these numbers do not tell the whole story - the history of individual cities, socioeconomics, affluence, population density, and access to resources can greatly affect cities' GHG emissions. They also do not reflect how much progress has been made in recent years to reduce emissions. Trends show that per capita GHG emissions are much larger in suburbs compared to cities. Please let me know if you have any more questions.

Thank you.

Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist

Public Works & Utilities Department

City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541

☎ Phone: 510.583.4727 | ✉ Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov



From: Peter Reimer <peterreimer@sbcglobal.net>

Sent: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 10:33 AM

To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>; Peter Reimer <peterreimer@sbcglobal.net>

Subject: Question(s)

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

How does Hayward's production of carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gasses compare with that of other 1) Alameda Co. cities

and un-incorporated areas? 2) Bay Area Counties, 3) expanding further outward from the Bay Area?

Peter D. Reimer
Hayward

From: [Environment](#)
To: ["Richard Reavis"](#)
Subject: RE: Climate action program workshop
Date: Thursday, October 26, 2023 5:13:00 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Hi Richard,

Thank you for providing your comments, our team has noted them.

Best,
Nicole

Nicole Grucky | Senior Sustainability Specialist

Public Works & Utilities Department

City of Hayward | 777 B Street | Hayward, CA 94541

☎ Phone: 510.583.4727 | ✉ Email: nicole.grucky@hayward-ca.gov



From: Richard Reavis <richard.reavis@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, October 26, 2023 1:52 PM
To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Climate action program workshop

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

No changes are needed besides living within our budget. Air is already clean. Water is already clean. CO2 is not a pollutant and barely a greenhouse gas; others are far more contributory. If you feel otherwise, see how long you can go without emitting. Air is only DIRTY when we have an outside influence such as wildfire smoke. Tell Sacramento/CARB/enviro-wackos to pound sand.

From: [Erik Pearson](#)
To: [s.nevalalee](#)
Cc: [Environment](#)
Subject: RE: Draft climate action plan
Date: Monday, October 30, 2023 11:53:37 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Hi Sandra,

The draft Climate Action Plan does not address a potential ban on the installation of artificial turf. This is not something that came up while we were preparing the draft over the last couple years. This is, however, something we can mention to the City Council Sustainability Committee at their meeting on November 13. At this meeting, we will provide the Committee with a summary of the comments we have received on the draft CAP.

Thank you.



Erik Pearson, AICP
Environmental Services Manager
Public Works & Utilities Department
City of Hayward | 777 B Street, Hayward, CA 94541
📞: (510) 583-4770 | **Email:** erik.pearson@hayward-ca.gov

From: s.nevalalee <s.nevalalee@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 30, 2023 9:08 AM
To: Environment <Environment@hayward-ca.gov>; Erik Pearson <Erik.Pearson@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Draft climate action plan

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Good morning Erik and team,

I am unable to attend the public workshop tonight. I would like to submit a comment regarding Senate Bill 676.

Governor Gavin Newsom signed [Senate Bill 676](#), October 8, that allows local municipalities to ban residents from installing fake grass as drought-tolerant landscape – it has to be real plants.

Will the City of Hayward be supporting the ban of installing fake grass within the scope of the new climate action plan?

With Kind regards,

Sandra Nevala-Lee

510-502-0992

greenthumbworks.net

Eden Garden Club

100K Trees for Humanity/100K Trees Hayward

From: [Bill Crader](#)
To: [Environment](#)
Subject: Climate Action Plan Question
Date: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 12:09:51 PM

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Attn: Project team,

Hayward's Climate Action Plan to reduce carbon emissions by 55% by the year 2030 seems to conflict with the Planning Division's objective for increasing the size of our population by seeking of new residential developments throughout the city of Hayward.

How is it possible to expect reductions in carbon emissions, water, and electricity usage to take place if we're promoting new residential developments that will increase our population?

Regards,

Bill Crader

From: [Hong, Miki](#)
To: [Leigha Schmidt](#)
Cc: [Hazen, Katherine](#)
Subject: Comment on the Draft EJ Element.
Date: Sunday, November 12, 2023 5:23:09 PM

CAUTION: This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Dear Leigha Schmidt,

My name is Miki Hong and I am an assistant adjunct professor at Mills College at Northeastern University in Oakland, California. I have been in the field of public health for 22 years. My research currently examines strategies for communities to solve systemic problems related to both public health and urbanism. I am investigating tobacco control recommendations in general plans.

I support the adoption of smoke-free multi-unit housing language in the City of Hayward's general plan.

Research shows that smoke-free policies in the home reduce second-hand and thirdhand exposure for all residents, also enables cessation for current smokers, and can help prevent relapse in former smokers (American Heart Association, 2021). There is much inequity with multi-unit housing as place-based limits are less common among smoking families with older children, in households located in predominantly Black and Hispanic neighborhoods, and in households in states where there is a higher smoking prevalence (American Heart Association, 2021). I support the following language for inclusion in the Environmental Justice Element:

Adopt an Ordinance related to smoke free multifamily housing and track implementation and monitor community health outcomes. Partner with Alameda County Health Department, community-based organizations and academic researchers and others to evaluate local tobacco control and identify trends in population health in response to smoke-free multi-family ordinance passage.

Funded by grants I will receive, my research team proposes to provide evaluation consultation and planning to your community to track important health metrics over time after adoption of the general plan to assess public health. These efforts at Northeastern University could involve designing and conducting the evaluation to track implementation and technical assistance in analyzing and reporting data.

I encourage adoption of this proposed language, and our Northeastern University research team looks forward to working with other Hayward organizations to help promote the city's health.

Sincerely,

Miki Hong

Mi-Kyung (Miki) Hong M.P.H., M.H.S.A (she/her/hers)
Assistant Adjunct Professor of Public Health and Health Equity
NSB 122 | Mills at Northeastern 5000 MacArthur Blvd Oakland, CA 94613 | 415.505.6734

Hayward Draft Climate Action Plan Public Meeting

October 30, 2023 at 6:30pm (via Zoom)

Public Comments

Q: As we move forward with the Plan the Council has made regarding the micro-transportation elements, is there consideration for public bike locking areas. Often times, places like shopping centers, there are no safe places to lock bikes.

- o City Staff response – The City is implementing the Bike and Pedestrian Master Plan and is pursuing grant funding specifically for this.

R: Russel City Energy Center and if NG emissions are associated with this CAP and inventory analysis.

- o City Staff response - The emission factor is accounted for the inventory, but Cap and Trade regulates the power plant specifically.

S: How and where will the streets be getting new trees?

- o City Staff response – City staff has a list of trees that they generally choose from and the City is revisiting in an upcoming Urban Forest Master Plan.

T: She didn't see anything in the Plan to address gentrification. Is this being considered as part of the Climate Action Plan?

- o City Staff response - On electrification measures, an equity lens was applied to make sure there will not be displacement. An equity guardrails analysis was developed as part of the CAP. The Housing Element was focusing on addressing gentrification so you can look at that too.

U: Is there a plan to clean up local creeks?

- o City Staff response - There are actions in the CAP around green infrastructure, which will help filter stormwater. The City is working to comply with the regional water board. They are installing filtration devices in the City to try to keep the creeks clean

V: I was wondering how closely you have been working with Cal State East Bay and Cabot in crafting this CAP? There are clearly going to be synergies between East Bay and Chabot's own CAP and responsibilities under state law - how are these reflected in the City of Hayward planning?

- o City Staff response – The City has been working directly with Chabot and CSU East Bay, to do interviews and get feedback on the EJ and CAP policies. Chabot did interviews as part of the Housing Element and part of the CAP. City staff participates in CSU East Bay Sustainability team meetings and meets with them regularly to coordinate initiatives.

W: How can the City of Hayward address climate change when it continues to develop and participate in extraction activities? The City is developing so that mature trees get taken out. The City is interfering with the natural world through building infrastructure and energy.

- o City Staff response -There is a balance that the City needs to strike between accommodating new population growth and not developing. By increasing development in Hayward, we are reducing development in other sensitive areas. The Housing Element and State require development and a certain amount of housing units every year. The City is focusing on going with the cleanest options they can find.

X: Is there any outreach plan to get the CAP out?

- o City Staff response - City is focused right now on official meetings with City council and they have conducted outreach as part of the project and will continue through implementation. The City is interested in making presentations or making more flyers. They are looking to the community to figure out how to get more involved.

Y: Carbon sequestration – the nature-based solution market, you can get into a contract where you can buy credits on a 40-year lease. Is there a performance factor or model that is included in the calculations?

- o City Staff response - City is focusing on tree planting and applying compost. The City is not involved in the carbon offset markets right now. 20-year life span for the trees calcs assume that with new trees, that the existing trees will be maintained.

Z: Does the CAP address GHG emissions associated with the airport. It is a problem with the fumes surrounding the airport. These surrounding neighborhoods are typically BIPOC (EJ issues).

- o City Staff -The City has talked recently with airport staff and fuels are getting cleaner. Every time City gets a cleaner fuel it is a slow process. The City will address this as they can over time.

AA: Is there intent to make adjustments to the Hayward Loop to make it a safer path to travel using micro mobility (ebikes, scooters, etc.)?

- o City Staff response - City found out that it was awarded a grant to make safety updates to the circulation system. They will be looking to implement safety improvements and the re-evaluation of the loop is part of this grant.

AB: This isn't related to GHG emissions, but are there any plans to make the city more drought-resilient? And are there preparations being made for extreme rainfall and flooding?

- o City Staff response - On drought resilience, Hayward has been partnering with EBMUD to have a sustainable source of groundwater, which is primarily used in emergency situations. The City has a water metering program to promote water conservation. Hayward has a portal where residents can track the use of water, but Hayward already has a very low per capita rate. Policies and programs in the Hazards element address extreme precipitation and flooding concerns for new and existing development.

AC: A number of residents are replacing their lawns with synthetic turf. How will this material be 'recycled' when it eventually breaks down? Since trees help sequester carbon, why don't we increase tree planting exponentially? If the city wants to make our streets more pedestrian friendly, replacing missing street trees immediately would help since they shade paths and cause drivers to reduce their speed, which will make walking more enjoyable.

- o City Staff response - City encourages native planting over synthetic turf and the City is aggressive with tree planting. They are working with City maintenance team to maintain trees. The City will look to include a reference to synthetic turf in the CAP. This can be

included in the CAP as it is brought to governing bodies. The City has received funding to implement urban forest strategies and an Urban Forest Master Plan.

AD: He heard restoration at the shoreline is going to billions of dollars, can the City get grant funding? What is the plan for funding this?

- o City Staff response - The City has adopted a shoreline adaptation master plan. It is estimated to be about a billion dollars. The City has 4-5 projects underway that have grant funding. They are pursuing additional grant funding, but it is a big undertaking.

AE: There are very few areas in Hayward you can map trees going back far. Will Hayward declare areas as sanctuary areas to preserve old trees.

- o City Staff response - City did receive grant funding to inventory trees on public properties. This should help inform best management practices

AF: Is there a plan to increase the reliability of the power grid in tandem with the increase in our reliance on it, in light of the recent rolling power outages?

- o City Staff response - Yes, the City is addressing this with building energy measures in the CAP. The Hazards Element addresses resilience concerns and power outages as well.

AG: New trees should be planted near the airport.

- o City Staff response - City is working with a consultant to update the tree preservation ordinance and develop guidelines for landscaping around the airport. City staff will put her in touch with those on the City working on these related projects.