



DATE: September 19, 2017

TO: Mayor and City Council

FROM: Director of Public Works

SUBJECT: Hayward Shuttle Study – Findings and Draft Final Recommendations

RECOMMENDATION

That the Council provides feedback on the following recommendations outlined in the Draft Transit Connector (Shuttle) Feasibility Study for Hayward.

1. Recommendation of Winton Loop Hybrid Route for near-term implementation
2. Recommendation for Shuttle Service Delivery Models
3. Measures for closing the funding gap for shuttle implementation.

SUMMARY

The Hayward Shuttle Study (Study) evaluated new shuttle transit service options providing improved first/last-mile connections for City residents and employers to regional transit at the Hayward BART stations. The study used an extensive screening process that involved technical analyses, input from key community stakeholders, a Technical Advisory Committee (TAC), and City staff to identify an initial list of eight concept routes. With input from Council during a February 2016 meeting, these eight route concepts were screened down to four. After further analysis of projected shuttle demand, available funding, and the needs based assessment of required shuttle service, one final hybrid route was developed. This hybrid route, referred to as Winton Hybrid Loop route, was developed by combining three of the four concept routes that were recommended by Council for further evaluation. Staff is recommending this route for near-term implementation.

BACKGROUND

During a series of community outreach meetings in 2013 and 2014, City staff received feedback from residents and employers expressing a desire for shuttle service to provide connections to BART. In response to the community feedback and in support of climate change goals, Council directed staff to develop a plan of action to address shuttle needs. Staff determined that a feasibility study was warranted, secured funding from Caltrans, and conducted the study. The study process included the review of existing transit services, peer review analyses, outreach, identification of likely corridors, and development of potential routes.

Existing conditions analysis, including a review of current transit service gaps and opportunities as well as input from the public, employer surveys and meetings identified four transportation corridors for potential shuttle service: Cannery Area to Hayward BART; West Industrial Area to Hayward BART; California State University, East Bay (CSUEB) to Hayward BART; and South Industrial Area to South Hayward BART. For these four transportation corridors, a total of eight shuttle route concepts were developed for evaluation. These are briefly described below.

1. **Tennyson Route** - Connect southern portion of West Industrial Area to South Hayward BART
2. **Winton Route** - Connect northern portion of West Industrial Area to Hayward BART
3. **Fairway Park to Downtown Route** - Connect southern Hayward residents to downtown Hayward and/or BART
 - **Alternative 1 – provide connection to South Hayward BART**
 - Alternative 2 – provide connection to downtown Hayward only
 - Alternative 3 – provide connection to downtown Hayward and Hayward BART
4. **South Industrial Loop Route** - Connect South Industrial Area to South Hayward BART
5. **CSUEB/Hills Route** - Connect CSUEB campus and nearby residential areas to downtown Hayward and BART
6. **Downtown Loop/Cannery Route** - Downtown circulator shuttle with connections to BART and Amtrak stations

The routes were screened for projected ridership, cost effectiveness and air quality benefits. Based on the results and input from the TAC, six of these routes (shown in bold text in the list above) were presented to City Council for review and direction concerning which to advance further in the study process.

DISCUSSION

During the [February 2, 2016 work session](#), Council reviewed the eight routes described above and approved four shuttle routes for advancement into the Financial and Implementation Planning Phase:

- Tennyson Route (Serving the Industrial area in the western part of Hayward through a connection to South Hayward BART Station)
- Winton Route (Serving the Industrial area in the western part of Hayward through a connection to Hayward BART Station)
- Downtown Loop Route (Serving downtown Hayward, the Amtrak station, and the Cannery Area development)
- South Industrial Route (Serving the Industrial area in the southern part of Hayward)

At the February 2016 work session, Council directed staff to evaluate the Jackson Triangle corridor for shuttle service. Preliminary analysis showed lack of transit services in the corridor and a need for first-mile connection to the transit station. However, given the size of

the corridor, significant additional outreach and evaluation would need to be conducted to understand the unique challenges in the Jackson Triangle area. At the time, staff was also working on a possible implementation route with an upcoming grant opportunity. This opportunity would require significant match from local sources. As a result, efforts were diverted to identify one competitive implementation route out of the four recommended by Council for a pilot project, as described in the next paragraph. Therefore, due to the resource constraints, the upcoming grant deadline for the pilot project, and the Caltrans grant funding deadline to complete the Shuttle Feasibility Study, staff was unable to complete a comprehensive analysis of the Jackson Triangle Corridor. However, after a successful implementation of shuttle service on the pilot corridor, if Council decides to expand the shuttle program to other parts of the City, staff recommends a standalone analysis for Jackson Triangle corridor shuttle service.

Following further discussion on cost and funding viability, staff combined portions of the Winton, Tennyson, and Downtown Loop routes into a single route that would serve key destinations, such as local employers, Chabot College, and public institutions, and have high ridership and funding potential. Specifically, the Alameda Superior Court was interested in additional transit service and was in the process of seeking grant funding through the Superior Court of California. Also, the developers of Maple & Main and Lincoln Landing projects were required to provide shuttle service as part of the project approval process. Using this opportunity to combine efforts, staff made minor adjustments to the route to serve the Hayward Hall of Justice to meet the needs of the Court. The result was the Winton Loop Hybrid Route, as shown in Attachment III. The South Industrial Route (Attachment IV) was identified as a second phase for potential longer-term implementation. Staff would like to request Council's feedback on Winton Loop Hybrid route for near term implementation.

The Winton Loop Hybrid Route makes a counter-clockwise loop around the Downtown Hayward area before proceeding west along Winton Avenue, serving the Hayward Hall of Justice and Southland Mall. The route then makes a loop in the northern part of the West Industrial area along Winton Avenue and Clawiter Road, Life Chiropractic College and Chabot College, before returning to Downtown Hayward. The shuttle would operate for ten hours daily during weekdays with 15-minute headways and is estimated to have 630 riders per day.

The Study considered several shuttle service delivery models, which are described in detail in the Shuttle Feasibility Report. Staff recommends the use of the Fully-Contracted model to implement shuttle service. Under a Fully-Contracted shuttle delivery model, the City would be responsible to secure funding, procuring, and managing a contract shuttle operator. The contracted shuttle operator would be responsible for operation and maintenance of the shuttle service as well as hiring and managing the necessary support staff. The Fully-Contracted model is lower cost compared to the Owner-Operator model due to the use of operations contracts for items such as vehicles, operators, fuel, insurance and dispatchers. This model provides the benefit of a larger pool of resources with transit operation expertise than would likely not be available if the City were to act in an Owner-Operator capacity.

After evaluating several traditional shuttle service models, staff recognized that the overall projected demand for shuttle service would not support the operational cost of approximately

\$1million that was estimated for traditional shuttle delivery services. With input from the City Manager’s office, staff decided to review newer On-Demand and Flexible Shuttle Service (also referred to as “micro transit”) models that were recently introduced in the marketplace to identify a suitable low cost alternative that would be appropriate for unique conditions in Hayward. Flexible shuttle services are offered through private companies, such as Chariot and Via. The shuttle service is set up as a fixed-route that is adjusted over time based on online feedback from users (i.e., routes/stops are crowdsourced online or via a smartphone application). This model would also be managed similar to a fully-contracted model, in which the City would need to establish and monitor an agreement with the provider. Due to the start-up nature of these providers, this flexible shuttle model would be cheaper than the traditional methods discussed above. Staff had preliminary discussion with a micro transit provider that provided an informal quote, which was roughly one-third of the cost of traditional shuttle service. Staff also requests Council feedback on Shuttle Service Delivery models appropriate for Hayward community, more specifically the recommendation to use the flexible shuttle service model.

STRATEGIC PRIORITIES

This agenda item supports the Complete Streets Strategic Initiative. The purpose of the Complete Streets Strategic Initiative is to build streets that are safe, comfortable, and convenient for travel for everyone, regardless of age or ability, including motorists, pedestrians, bicyclists, and public transportation riders. This item supports the following goal and objective:

Goal 2: Provide Complete Streets that balance the diverse needs of users of the public right-of-way.

Objective 1: Increase walking, biking, transit usage, carpooling and other sustainable modes of transportation by designing and retrofitting streets to accommodate all modes.

ECONOMIC IMPACT

Implementation of a shuttle would have a positive economic impact on the Hayward community. However, the purpose of this study was to identify if a shuttle is feasible in the City. Therefore, an economic impact analysis of a shuttle on the community was not performed.

FISCAL IMPACT

Depending on the specific contracting method chosen, annual operating costs are estimated to be approximately \$1.1 million using a traditional shuttle contractor for the Winton Hybrid Loop Route. The City has been awarded a \$500,000 grant from the Alameda County Transportation Commission (Alameda CTC) to cover a portion of the annual costs over five years. Staff also worked with the Alameda County Superior Court to apply for a separate

grant through the Superior Court of California, but the application was not selected. This leaves a funding gap to pay for the service of up to \$900,000 annually.

This funding gap could be significantly lower if lower cost service delivery options are utilized. As discussed earlier, staff received an informal quote from a micro transit provider that was approximately one third the cost of a traditional operator (approximately \$350,000), which would result in roughly a \$250,000 annual funding gap (as compared to \$900,000 annually for traditional shuttle delivery model) during the first two years of pilot operations. To bridge this funding gap, the following alternatives can be evaluated:

- Pursue additional Measure BB funds,
- Work with local businesses to provide funding,
- Work with specific developers adjacent to the route (similar to Lincoln Landing, Maple and Main) to provide funding,
- Reduce service hours (i.e. peak period only), and
- Explore shuttle fare options.

Staff is currently exploring the possibility of collaborating with the Alameda County Shuttle to expand their route and open it up for public use. Alameda County's existing shuttle serves a portion of the Winton Hybrid Loop route and is currently not available to the public. Additionally, staff is exploring service expansion options with Cal State University East Bay (CSUEB) shuttle that could provide cost efficiencies for the City's recommended shuttle route.

Council input is sought on approaches for bridging the funding shortfall.

SUSTAINABILITY FEATURES

Providing the first mile/last mile connection to and from the BART station will provide a vital transportation link for Hayward residents and employers, Chabot College, and other public institutions and encourage the use of public transit. The resulting reduction in single occupancy vehicles will reduce vehicle miles of travel and greenhouse gases.

PUBLIC CONTACT

Staff led extensive outreach activities with local businesses, employees and residents during the summer of 2015. This included an online survey that received over 500 responses, four open houses, and five employer interviews. Results of the outreach were incorporated in the evaluation of the draft concept routes.

In addition to public outreach, a Technical Advisory Committee (TAC), made up of agency partners, such as AC Transit, BART, CSU-East Bay, Caltrans and representatives from Industrial district businesses, was established to provide input on the study process and technical results. The first TAC meeting was held in July 2016 and provided input on developing a public outreach plan. The second TAC meeting was held in December 2016 and provided feedback on the results of the public outreach effort, existing conditions analysis,

and draft route concepts. The third and final TAC meeting was held in March 2017 and provided input on the final route alignment, stop locations, and contracting method.

NEXT STEPS

Finalize Route Funding Plan	Fall 2017
Procurement	Spring 2018

Prepared by: Abhishek Parikh, Senior Transportation Engineer

Recommended by: Morad Fakhrai, Director of Public Works

Approved by:



Kelly McAadoo, City Manager