



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, April 11, 2024, 7:00 p.m.**

The Planning Commission meeting was called to order at 7:01 p.m. by Chair Lowe. The Planning Commission held a hybrid meeting in the Council Chambers and virtually via Zoom.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL

Present: COMMISSIONERS: Franco-Clausen, Goodbody, Meyers, Patterson, Stevens
CHAIRPERSON: Lowe
Absent: COMMISSIONER: None

Staff Members Present: Ameri, Ochinero, Parras, Schmidt, Tabari, Vigilia, Wolny

PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were none.

PUBLIC HEARING

For agenda item No. 1 the Planning Commission may make a recommendation to the City Council.

1. Recommended FY 2025 - FY 2034 Capital Improvement Program (PH 24-017)

Director of Public Works Ameri provided a synopsis of the staff report and introduced Management Analyst Wolny who presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Commissioner Patterson acknowledged the recommendation for an additional 25 million dollars for water system projects, noting that it was not initially outlined in the staff report and asked why these expenses were not anticipated, particularly concerning annual line replacements spanning from 2022 to 2025, and what factors led to the significant increase in costs. Director of Public Works Ameri explained that while the annual budget allocates 7 million dollars each for water and wastewater projects separately, a more effective strategy involves waiting to combine projects from multiple years into a single endeavor. Mr. Ameri emphasized that consolidating projects spanning two or three years into one enables them to gather savings from previous budgets as this consolidation facilitates unified design, construction management, and contracting, leading to enhanced efficiency, and potentially yielding overall cost savings.

In response to Planning Commissioner Patterson's inquiry about the implications of Policy NR-2.10 Zero-Emission and Low-Emission Vehicle Use, Public Works Director Ameri explained that they are collaborating with external entities to secure grant funding aimed at



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, April 11, 2024, 7:00 p.m.**

providing public charging stations for electric vehicles (EVs) in the City, and noted that private companies have already taken steps in this direction, citing examples such as Tesla charging stations in the parking lots of Safeway on Jackson Street and Target store on Hesperian Boulevard. He mentioned that the City is actively pursuing similar projects to install public charging stations in municipal lots such as lot 4, located off of 2nd Street between B Street & C Street.

In response to Planning Commissioner Meyers' request for clarification about the Capital Improvement Program (CIP) budget for FY 2025, the ten-year period and unfunded capital needs, Director of Public Works Ameri clarified that the total amount of projects for FY 2025 is \$161 million and added that when considering projects for subsequent years, such as pavement projects for FYs 2026 to 2028 and a significant project planned for the water resource and recovery facility, the total exceeds \$1 billion. He noted that this total might even surpass \$1 billion due to the inability to precisely predict project requirements and costs for FY 2033 and beyond. Mr. Ameri explained that there are fewer projects allocated for those distant years, while the total identified projects amount to around \$1 billion, there are numerous other projects that have been identified but lack funding. He provided examples, such as the need for a safety center with an estimated cost of over \$200 million and refurbishing the corporation yard at a cost exceeding \$50 million, which are among the unfunded projects, and when totaling these identified yet unfunded projects, it amounts to approximately \$690 million. He added that for some projects, they anticipate being successful in securing grant funding and with this funding in place, these projects would proceed at a total cost of \$1 billion or more. Commissioner Meyers mentioned that he noticed the substantial increase in airport funding for the current year, which rose from \$1 million to just under \$8 million. He requested further details on how the \$7.6 million would be allocated this year and whether similar funding levels are projected for future years. Mr. Ameri responded that they have certain projects they hope to undertake, and if successful in working with the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and Caltrans Aviation Division, these projects could total \$8 million or more. He indicated that a significant portion of this cost is reimbursable by the FAA and Caltrans.

Commissioner Goodbody questioned the National Resources section of the General Plan Element in the CIP report, noting the absence of any discussion about natural gas and wondered if there were any considerations regarding this aspect when developing the CIP, particularly given the anticipated increase in electricity use and electrification, coupled with a decrease in natural gas usage over the lifespan of the next improvement plan. Director of Public Works Ameri explained that there have been considerations and discussions regarding the use of natural gas in the City and efforts have been made to discourage its use, particularly in new construction. He mentioned a building code update adopted a couple of years ago aimed at banning the use of natural gas in certain developments, although its implementation has been paused due to a court case, the City was actively seeking opportunities to reduce the



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, April 11, 2024, 7:00 p.m.**

use of natural gas whenever possible. He gave an example of a new building at the water resource recovery facility being designed without any natural gas usage, opting for full electrification instead adding that whenever the City undertakes a project, measures are implemented to minimize natural gas usage. He said regarding existing developments and homes, which account for the majority of natural gas use in the City, efforts are being made to encourage or subsidize the conversion to electrification and one approach is to promote the replacement of natural gas-powered appliances, such as hot water heaters, with more energy-efficient electric models as various rebates are also available to help offset the cost of these conversions. Commissioner Goodbody questioned how commercial businesses would factor into the planning regarding natural gas. Mr. Ameri responded that to the extent it is practical for them, commercial businesses could consider converting their operations to electric and noted that there are incentives available for businesses to take advantage of such conversions.

Commissioner Franco-Clausen inquired about the decision-making process for selecting neighborhoods to initiate livable neighborhoods projects. Ms. Franco-Clausen expressed admiration for the efforts seen in areas like Mission Boulevard, where aesthetics are being improved to complement new developments; however, she noted disparities in her own neighborhood, particularly in Sleepy Hollow and Hesperian Boulevard, where streets and sidewalks are in poor condition, trees cause uneven pavements, and there is lack of maintenance. She sought clarification on how decisions are made regarding project prioritization and design based on community needs. Director of Public Works Ameri responded that the condition of the streets and sidewalks is the primary factor assessed by the City when determining project priorities and for sidewalk work, the City divides areas into different districts and implements a plan to address them incrementally over time. Similarly, pavement projects involve hiring experts to evaluate street conditions across various areas of the City. He explained that resident feedback also plays a significant role in project design and scheduling, adding that equity is an essential consideration in the decision-making process. He said staff prioritize areas that have not received adequate improvements in the past, such as certain locations in South Hayward and Jackson Triangle, to ensure equitable distribution of resources. Mr. Ameri noted that social equity is explicitly discussed in staff reports for projects like sidewalk and pavement improvements. While considerations like equity are paramount for visible projects, such as sidewalks, trees, and pavement, they are less influential for utility projects like water and wastewater, which are typically addressed based on network needs. He emphasized that equity remains a key factor in decision making for visible infrastructure improvements.

In response to Planning Commissioner Franco-Clausen inquiry about the individual responsible for driving around the neighborhood to assess its condition, Public Works Director Ameri responded that the individual is an outside consultant and their role is to evaluate pavements and identify areas in need of improvement and it is up to City staff to decide which pavements to prioritize and how to allocate funds effectively to maximize



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, April 11, 2024, 7:00 p.m.**

returns with the limited resources available and in terms of project location selection, social equity is one of the factors considered by the City in determining which projects to include. Commissioner Franco-Clausen questioned whether the installation of charging stations, would be implemented in other spaces around Hayward emphasizing the importance of ensuring the equity process extends beyond certain neighborhoods with greater investment. Director Ameri responded that the installation of charging stations is primarily driven by private sector companies such as Tesla, that prioritize locations based on maximizing returns on investment and identifying areas suitable for dedicating parking spaces for charging stations; and mentioned that the public projects led by the City involve identifying suitable locations for charging stations in municipal parking lots. He acknowledged some pushback from businesses concerned about allocating a significant number of parking spaces for EV charging, as it may impact their business operations.

Chair Lowe questioned why around \$3 million of the total FY 2025 General Fund transfers are 8% lower than the FY 2024 transfers. Ms. Lowe asked whether this decrease is due to the completion of some projects or because of reimbursements from state, federal funds, or grants. Public Works Director Ameri responded that the decrease in General Fund transfers for FY25 compared to FY24 is partly due to some purchases recommended for the upcoming year being at a lower level than those made in 2024 or 2023. He gave an example, if the City needed to purchase a vehicle for street sweeping or a fire truck in one year, the expenditure might be higher than in subsequent years; as this year's efforts were made to minimize the impact on the General Fund and working with various departments, staff identified projects with slightly less financial impact on the General Fund.

There being no public comment, Chair Lowe opened and closed the public comment hearing at 7:52 p.m.

Commissioner Patterson expressed gratitude to the staff for their hard work; praised the CIP website for its design, content, readability, and ease of navigation, finding it excellent overall; shared some challenges she encountered while reviewing the staff report, noting that the structure seemed disjointed, with random examples of projects selected that may not align clearly with the project categories in the CIP; and expressed excitement about learning more about the La Vista Park Project.

Commissioner Franco-Clausen commended staff and the user-friendly nature of the online portal and website; appreciated the clarity provided by staff, especially when dealing with complex topics that may seem simple to others; emphasized the importance of community outreach and engagement in decision-making processes, advocating for tapping into the knowledge and insights of residents to ensure that projects and initiatives reflect the desires and needs of Hayward residents; and offered her assistance in this effort.



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, April 11, 2024, 7:00 p.m.**

Commissioner Goodbody commented on the functionality of the website, emphasizing the importance of storytelling, particularly for topics that may be technical or lack excitement, such as new sewer lines; suggested that presenting large documents like the CIP in a narrative format could help engage residents, especially visual learners, and tie together various projects into a cohesive story; proposed linking presentations of documents like the CIP to the resident satisfaction survey; and suggested aligning the projects and initiatives outlined in such documents with the priorities and feedback gathered from residents through the satisfaction survey.

Commissioner Stevens expressed gratitude for the excellent work done by City staff, acknowledging that while projects like bike lanes, parks, and libraries often receive excitement and attention, the maintenance of essential infrastructure such as sewers, water lines, and streets requires significant effort and dedication.

Chair Lowe expressed appreciation for the ease of navigation on the website, particularly the CIP website; praised the organization of the site, including the summaries provided for each section, which helped explain the content clearly; commended the use of drop-down menus for each subcategory; and thanked City staff for their efforts in designing and executing the website, acknowledging the thoughtfulness and effectiveness of its layout.

A motion to approve the staff recommendation was made by Commissioner Patterson, seconded by Commissioner Goodbody.

The motion carried with the following roll call votes:

AYES:	Commissioners Franco-Clausen, Goodbody, Meyers, Patterson, Stevens Chair Lowe
NOES:	None
ABSENT:	None
ABSTAIN:	None

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

2. Minutes of the Planning Commission Meeting on October 12, 2023 (MIN 24-045)

A motion was made by Commissioner Franco-Clausen, seconded by Commissioner Goodbody, to approve the meeting minutes of October 12, 2023.

The motion passed with the following roll call votes:

AYES:	Commissioners Franco-Clausen, Goodbody, Meyers, Patterson, Stevens
-------	--



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, April 11, 2024, 7:00 p.m.**

	Chair Lowe
NOES:	None
ABSENT:	None
ABSTAIN:	None

COMMISSION REPORTS

Oral Report on Planning and Zoning Matters

Principal Planner Schmidt indicated there were no items scheduled for the upcoming meeting or for the first half of May.

Commissioners' Announcements, Referrals

3. 2024 Planning Commission Meeting Schedule (Updated) (RPT 24-029)

Principal Planner Schmidt announced that the meeting schedule had been adjusted to align with the City Council recess; noted the updated schedule extends the recess to cover the entire month of July and the first half of August; and added that the last meeting would take place at the end of June with regular meetings resuming at the end of August.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Lowe adjourned the meeting at 8:03 p.m.



**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND VIRTUAL (ZOOM)
PARTICIPATION
Thursday, April 11, 2024, 7:00 p.m.**

APPROVED:

Karla Goodbody, Secretary
Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Amber Parras
Planning Commission Secretary
Office of the City Clerk