



DATE: January 24, 2023

TO: Mayor and City Council

FROM: Acting Development Services Director

SUBJECT: Hayward Residential Design Study: Parking Analysis for Hayward Residential Design Study

RECOMMENDATION

That the City Council provides feedback on the recommendations included in the Parking Analysis for the Hayward Residential Design Study.

SUMMARY

The Hayward Residential Design Study is a long-range planning project that will result in the development of objective residential standards and zoning amendments to ensure General Plan and Zoning Ordinance consistency. As part of this effort, a Parking Analysis (Attachment II) was conducted by the project team (consultants Mintier Harnish and DKS Associates in collaboration with City staff) to determine if any changes to the City's existing parking regulations for residential development should be considered. Specifically, the Analysis recommends that the City:

- Maintain parking requirements within the Mission Boulevard Code area
- Not increase parking requirements for multi-family developments outside of the Mission Boulevard Code and Downtown Specific Plan Areas
- Develop Transportation Demand Management (TDM) strategies for multi-family developments
- Allow for the unbundling of parking
- Revise parking requirements for single-family dwellings that are abutting a street with no permitted parking on both sides of the street

At this work session, staff is requesting specific feedback from the Council on the following questions related to the Parking Analysis for the Hayward Residential Design Study:

- Which of the recommendations do you think are right for Hayward?
- Do you support the development of TDM requirements or credits for multifamily development?
 - If so, which TDM strategies should be included?

- Are there specific areas of the city, such as Downtown, along Mission Boulevard, and/or around major transit stops where TDM requirements or credits should apply?
- Would you be supportive of differentiating TDM requirements or credits based on project size, location, level of affordability and/or tenure (rental vs. ownership)?
- Are there any other parking design issues (i.e., setbacks, visibility, etc.) that should be addressed as part of the Hayward Residential Design Study?

Following this work session, subsequent work sessions will be scheduled with the Planning Commission and City Council to obtain feedback on the various options for the Objective Standards and Recommendations Report, including any zoning amendments necessary to codify the updated requirements within the Hayward Municipal Code.

BACKGROUND

In 2019, the City of Hayward was awarded an SB2 Planning Grant by the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) for various housing projects, including the Hayward Residential Design Study (previously named the Residential Objective Standards and Zoning Consistency Update). The grant funds allocated to this project cover the development of objective residential standards and zoning amendments to ensure General Plan and Zoning Ordinance consistency.

Over the past several years, the California State legislature adopted numerous housing bills to address the State's Housing Crisis, including Senate Bill (SB) 35, SB 330, and SB 8, which are aimed at streamlining land use entitlements and processes. Streamlining is generally used to limit and define local control and discretion thus providing developers with more certainty in timing and outcomes for residential and mixed-use developments. Specifically, local jurisdictions have limited ability to deny housing projects that meet all objective standards. As defined by State law, "objective standards are those that involve no personal or subjective judgment by a public official and being uniformly verifiable by reference to an external and uniform benchmark or criterion available and knowable by both the development applicant or proponent and the public official." In other words, an objective standard must be written in such a way that anyone reading it would have the same understanding of what the standard requires. Therefore, the Hayward Residential Design Study will focus on updating the City's residential standards to make them "objective" by including measurable and enforceable parameters.

Kickoff Meeting Joint Session. On February 1, 2022,¹ the City Council and Planning Commission held a joint work session to provide initial guidance and feedback on the Hayward Residential Design Study. The Council and Planning Commission provided significant feedback during this session, including that the project should address community parking concerns by evaluating current regulations and identifying strategies to reduce parking necessities (shuttles, bike infrastructure, car-sharing programs, unbundled parking).

¹ Joint Session of City Council and Planning Commission, February 1, 2022:
<https://hayward.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5397460&GUID=B175606F-4591-4D2E-B41A-328BD292B038>

Public Outreach. To date, outreach efforts for the Hayward Residential Design Study have included an online community survey, an online interactive mapping tool, in-person “walkshops” (walking workshops), and various in-person community events. These efforts were promoted through the City’s e-newsletter, social media platforms, Permit Center, libraries, and community-based organizations. The community survey and promotional materials were provided in Spanish, Mandarin, and English.

Through these outreach efforts, staff has gathered both quantitative and qualitative data that will be used to inform the development of objective residential standards and zoning amendments. Key findings from the outreach thus far include a range of community priorities, including managing off-street parking concerns. A full summary and analysis of public outreach to date is available on the City’s website.²

Informational Reports. On October 11, 2022³ and October 27, 2022,⁴ the City Council and Planning Commission respectively, received Informational Reports from staff providing a status update on the Hayward Residential Design Study. The Reports and their attachments provide a detailed overview of community outreach conducted to date, a project vision statement and objectives, and background information related to relevant State legislation, the City’s current regulations for residential development, and best practices from surrounding communities. As these items were included on the meeting agendas as Informational Reports, no discussions were held, or actions taken.

Planning Commission Work Session on Parking Analysis. On January 12, 2023, the Planning Commission was scheduled to hold a work session⁵ to discuss the recommendations included in the Hayward Residential Design Study Parking Analysis (Attachment II). Due to a lack of quorum, this item was postponed to February 9, 2023.

Summary of Recent State Legislation. As noted above, the State legislature passed several laws in recent years that reduced parking requirements for certain projects to help remove financial barriers for residential development, including Senate Bill 330 (SB 330) and more recently, Assembly Bill 2097 (AB 2097).

SB 330 prohibits jurisdictions from adopting development standards, including minimum off-street parking requirements, that would effectively reduce the overall residential development potential that is currently allowed. Furthermore, AB 2097 prohibits jurisdictions from imposing any minimum parking requirements for residential, commercial, or other development projects that are located within one-half mile of a major transit stop. The Hayward Amtrak Station, the Hayward BART Station, and the South Hayward BART Station are currently the only qualifying major transit stops within Hayward. However, there

² Project Webpage on City of Hayward Website:

<https://www.hayward-ca.gov/your-government/departments/planning-division/residential-design-study>

³ Informational Report to the City Council, October 11, 2022:

<https://hayward.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5866918&GUID=894C7C53-DC5C-4221-B088-0EBF8B2AEA96>

⁴ Informational Report to the Planning Commission, October 27, 2022:

<https://hayward.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5892998&GUID=7857C30F-1A87-4B4B-9E5E-A8B0339C69FE>

⁵ Planning Commission Work Session, January 12, 2023:

<https://hayward.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5986261&GUID=CF8EBC9A-F6DB-404F-ABCE-2226EBF0621C>

are several bus stops along Mission Boulevard that may qualify in the future if the frequency of bus service increases slightly. Overall, these laws limit the City's ability to increase off-street parking requirements.

Policy Context

Within the Parking Analysis for the Hayward Residential Design Study, the project team evaluated relevant State legislation and the City's current off-street parking requirements to develop recommendations to address residential parking concerns. A summary of existing regulations are described below and detailed in Attachment II.

Summary of Current Off-Street Parking Requirements. Current residential parking requirements are determined by the City's Off-Street Parking Regulations, Mission Boulevard Code, and Downtown Specific Plan. The project team determined that the City's parking requirements are generally consistent with or higher than comparable rates in the Institute of Transportation Engineer's (ITE) Parking Generation Manual. The minimum and maximum number of required parking spaces are summarized in Table 1 below.

Table 1: City of Hayward Residential Parking Regulations

Use	Number of Required Parking Spaces
Single-Family Dwellings	
Single-Family Dwellings	2 Covered per Dwelling Unit
Single-Family Dwellings that are abutting a street with no permitted parking on both sides of the street	2 Covered <u>AND</u> 2 Uncovered per Dwelling Unit (spaces cannot block the covered spaces)
Single-Family Dwellings built prior to March 24, 1959	1 Covered per Dwelling Unit
Multi-Family Dwellings	
Studios	1 Covered <u>AND</u> 0.5 Uncovered Per Dwelling Unit
One-Bedrooms	1 Covered <u>AND</u> 0.7 Uncovered Per Dwelling Unit
Two or More Bedrooms	1 Covered <u>AND</u> 1.10 Uncovered Per Dwelling Unit
Mission Boulevard Code	
All Residential Developments	No Parking Minimums, A Maximum of 1 Per Dwelling Unit within ½ Mile of BART Station and A Maximum of 2 Per Dwelling Unit Elsewhere
Downtown Specific Plan	
All Residential Developments	1 Per Dwelling Unit, No Parking Maximums

The Off-Street Parking Regulations also contain methods for residential developments to reduce their overall parking requirement. These include credit for senior citizen housing and housing for people with disabilities, credit for two-wheel parking spaces, credit for off-site parking, and allowing tandem parking for single-family dwellings. However, the City does not currently have any requirements or credits for Transportation Demand Management (TDM) strategies for residential developments.

Infill Housing Report. In December 2019, the Council of Infill Builders released their report on efforts to accelerate and accommodate infill housing in the City of Hayward and presented this

report to the City Council on January 14, 2020⁶. The Report recommends that the City develop optimal parking policies to encourage market-driven supply that boosts walkability, biking, and transit usage. Excess parking supply and requirements add to project costs and can reduce the walkability and transit-friendly nature of downtowns and commercial corridors. Ongoing operation and maintenance of parking structures can also be costly for rental properties. At the same time, it was noted that lenders are reluctant to finance new projects in Hayward without sufficient on-site parking. As a result, the report recommends the City consider parking policies that allow the market to determine supply while providing options to reduce the demand for on-site, decentralized parking that can increase project costs. The Mission Boulevard Code update relied on this information to support no parking minimum within the Code Area.

DISCUSSION

Over the past year, the City's project team has been working to develop a suite of recommendations to address residential parking concerns expressed by stakeholders as well as support the development of high-quality, accessible, and attractive housing. The recommendations, which are summarized below, are based on analysis of State legislation, the City's current off-street parking regulations, and best practices from other communities. Additional details for each recommendation are provided in Attachment II.

- **Maintain parking requirements within the Mission Boulevard Code area.** Given current State legislation (AB 2097, SB330) and an upcoming AC Transit network redesign, current parking requirements within the Mission Boulevard Code should be maintained. State legislation severely limits the City's ability to increase parking minimums, especially along Mission Boulevard.
- **Do not increase parking requirements for multi-family developments outside of the Mission Boulevard Code and Downtown Specific Plan Areas.** Given that the parking requirements for multi-family dwellings outside the Mission Boulevard Code and Downtown Specific Plan Areas are generally higher than the ITE Manual rates, current parking requirements should not be increased. Staff should monitor the parking supply and occupancy of recent multi-family dwellings to determine if a reduction from current standards is needed.
- **Develop Transportation Demand Management (TDM) strategies for multi-family developments.** Current regulations do not have any requirements, nor do they provide credits for TDM strategies employed in multi-family developments. The City should consider allowing for a reduction in off-street parking supply in multi-family residential developments under certain conditions, such as a site's proximity to transit, the provision of active transportation amenities (bike parking, scooter share, etc.), a car-share program, the provision of subsidized transit passes, and other options that reduce car ownership.
- **Allow for the unbundling of parking.** Unbundling parking is the act of separating out the cost of parking from the cost of living, by charging separately for parking. Current

⁶ Work Session with the City Council, January 14, 2020:
<https://hayward.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4288614&GUID=8884B223-5825-443E-AEB7-561FE7CECC64&Options=&Search=>

regulations do not allow for unbundling parking without specific conditions of project approval that state otherwise.

- **Revise parking requirements for single-family dwellings that are abutting a street with no permitted parking on both sides of the street.** To maintain the supply of parking in single-family neighborhoods with constrained roadway conditions, and support residential development, staff recommends allowing driveway spaces to satisfy the uncovered parking space requirements for single-family dwellings that are abutting a street with no permitted parking on both sides of the street.

As previously indicated in this report, staff is requesting specific feedback from the Council on the following questions related to the Parking Analysis for the Hayward Residential Design Study:

- Which of the recommendations do you think are right for Hayward?
- Do you support the development of TDM requirements or credits for multifamily development?
 - If so, which TDM strategies should be included?
 - Are there specific areas of the city, such as Downtown, along Mission Boulevard, and/or around major transit stops where TDM requirements or credits should apply?
 - Would you be supportive of differentiating TDM requirements or credits based on project size, location, level of affordability and/or tenure?
- Are there any other parking design issues (i.e., setbacks, visibility, etc.) that should be addressed as part of the Hayward Residential Design Study?

STRATEGIC ROADMAP

This agenda item supports the Strategic Priority of Preserve, Protect and Produce Housing for All. Specifically, this item relates to the implementation of the following project (s):

Project 4, Part 4d:	Implement housing incentives and production work plan in accordance to state housing limits; Develop an Overlay Zoning District to allow RS zoned properties (single family residential) to develop into a variety of housing types at densities permitted under the applicable General Plan designation.
---------------------	---

FISCAL IMPACT

Mintier Harnish's approved contract and associated budget, including contingency, is \$234,910, and will be paid through the HCD SB2 Planning Grant awarded in 2019. There is no additional fiscal impact associated with the parking analysis for the Residential Design Study.

NEXT STEPS

By early spring, staff anticipates presenting the Objective Standards and Recommendations Report to both the Planning Commission and City Council to highlight the various options tied to the adoption of new residential development standards. Using the feedback received from decision makers at these work sessions, as well as the additional feedback from the public, staff will present the updated draft of proposed objective standards with related zoning amendments by early summer.

Prepared by: Taylor Richard, Assistant Planner
Elizabeth Blanton, AICP, Senior Planner

Recommended by: Sara Buizer, AICP, Acting Development Services Director

Approved by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kelly McAdoo', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Kelly McAdoo, City Manager