CITY COUNCIL MEETING

MAY 14, 2022

DOCUMENTS RECEIVED AFTER PUBLISHED AGENDA

AGENDA

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

LOG

PUBLIC COMMENTS

ITEM #1

WS 22-014

COUNCIL BUDGET WORK SESSION REVIEW PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2023 OPERATING BUDGET AND FIVE-YEAR PLAN RECEIVE AND DICSUSS DEPARMENTAL BUDGET PRESENTATIONS From: SUSAN H. GEHLKE
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2022 2:58 PM
To: List-Mayor-Council <List-Mayor-Council@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Budget work session, File #:WS 22-014

Dear Mayor and Council Members,

On behalf of Hayward Concerned Citizens, I am resubmitting our position paper on the subject of Russell City reparations. A copy of our paper has also been submitted to the Hayward Area Historical Society to add to their collection.

Russell City is a part of the history of this area, just as much as the old Hayward High School was, or other areas that are long gone. However, Russell City was not part of Hayward, Hayward did not destroy it, and Hayward needs to stop trying to make things right. As community members, we feel that it is important that rather than focusing on the needs of the past, we need to focus on the needs of the present which include all vulnerable people in our city, whatever their color or ethnicity, not just a select group which has already received compensation and recognition, many times over.

Sadly, the issue of Russell City has emerged again after nearly 60-years for one reason, and that is because the issue of reparations is a hot topic in the social justice movement. We hope that you will take the time to read our position paper, if you have not already done so, and to attempt to understand our point of view as to why Russell City should not be considered as an issue of financial reparations.

In conclusion, I would like to add that most of you who have dealt with Hayward Concerned Citizens know that we are a pretty reasonable, nice group of people, many of us very long term residents who really care about our community, and want to protect its basic integrity, and so we take the time and make the effort to let you know our positions even though you may not totally agree with us. However, you should also know that on issues of importance, we do not give in to social pressures or social trends, but attempt to consider what is in the best interest of all of our community members.

We thank you for taking time to consider our position, and please note, we are not a group that gives out report cards.

Respectfully,

Susan Gehlke Hayward Concerned Citizens

REVISITING RUSSELL CITY

AFTER MORE THAN 50 YEARS

INTRODUCTION:

On November 17, 2021, the City of Hayward submitted a formal apology for the City's role in racial discrimination and mass displacement of Russell City residents in the 1960's. Following the apology, the City Council held a virtual meeting on January 29, 2022 for priority setting and a developing a strategic road map. Among items discussed was the possible restitution to previous Russell City residents and their dependents.

In an effort to understand the issues surrounding Russell City, a committee made up of Hayward Concerned Citizens, undertook an investigation and study of the underlying factors that led up to the original destruction of Russell City, and the current reemergence of interest in revisiting its demise after nearly 60 years.

In carrying out our study, we want to emphasize that it is not our intent to denigrate or disparage anyone's feelings or memories surrounding their experiences in Russell City. We are, however, currently in a different era of social awareness, where past decisions and historical advances are being viewed through a different lens. Our world evolves, and will continue to evolve. Change is a fact and is ever present in our lives. That being said, the late 50's and early 60's was a tumultuous time of change in our country. The emphasis was on growth and development after the war. Hayward went from a population of 6,777 in 1940 to 72,700 in 1960 and had to transition from a mostly agricultural area to an industrial area to provide jobs for the community. Many of the homes here in Hayward were constructed during that period of time, and much of the acquisition of additional land through annexation also occurred during this period of time. These changes were not just being made in local governments, but it was also a period of growth for private industries, many of which relocated, opened new branches, and displaced employees by insisting that they move to the new area, or lose their jobs.

BACKGROUND

The history of Russell City has been well documented in several texts: Mt. Eden, Cradle of the Salt Industry by John Sandoval (once known as our Hayward Historian); Images of America, Russell City by Maria Ochoa, and Megan Wilkerson's What Ever Happened to Russell City. We will not attempt to repeat all of that information, but want to highlight some points that have been made, as well as cite information gathered from the Hayward Daily Review and Oakland Tribune newspapers from the decade preceding the demise of Russell City. It should also be noted that much of the more recent history was gathered from interviews with a few of the former Russell City inhabitants, most of whom were children or teenagers at the time, or from oral history handed down through generations. As such, we must remain mindful of idyllic softening that may occur through time and nostalgic reminiscence. Surely, many of us who grew up in the 50's will recall the warmth of communities where neighbors knew one another and children played outside until after dark. Most did not have televisions then, and certainly not the Internet or social media. Those factors promoted communal bonds. There are those who believe that Russell City was a part of Hayward. However, in fact, it was an unincorporated part of Alameda County. It's residents, by all accounts, were a strong and resourceful group of people with strong bonds to their community. Their population was mixed, with the majority, 47%, being of Latin origins, 34% African American and the remainder white or mixed ethnicities [Daily Review 2/24/1966]. Its diversity spoke to the affordability and nearness to local jobs in the Bay Area following the war. There was some variability in living conditions in the area, but many of the homes were run down and lacked essential services such as sewer systems and clean running water. Several of the residents endeavored to improve and create a better environment for themselves, however the Uniform Building Code went into effect in 1946 which prohibited building on land without sewer systems in place, so further development was not possible. The residents petitioned Alameda County for clean water systems and sewers. However, the County refused to intervene saying that the low assessed valuation of the land prohibited the expense of bringing it up to code. The situation did not improve during the 50's when the County was experiencing a building boom in housing. They also had pressure from multiple Grand Juries which repeatedly asked them to do something about the "blighted conditions" of Russell City. After several years, and the urging from various entities, the County made the decision to acquire the properties and to ready the land for sale. A Redevelopment Agency was formed to oversee the purchase of land from the owners, and they, along with renters, were paid to move to other available homes in several communities within the County, including Hayward, San Lorenzo, San Leandro, Newark, Fremont, Union City, Oakland and as far out as Livermore. The County then proceeded to clear the land which was then sold to a private developer, Cabot, Cabot and Forbes. Following the sale, the property was annexed to Hayward on August 6, 1968.

ISSUES:

* Separating an emotional issue from a business decision.

The destruction of Russell City was clearly an emotional issue for some of its residents. They were a close-knit group of people who helped each other out, who fought to keep their community intact and acquire the help they needed to keep their community going. Many other small communities in the 50's also experienced the same sense of closeness, where neighbors knew neighbors and children could play safely outdoors. Those, unfortunately, are bygone eras that have left us with fond memories of better times. The Russell City families are fortunate in that they have been able to continue those close connections by meeting together yearly, an opportunity that many of us have long since lost.

In understanding history, however, we must realize that the 50's and 60's were a period that was dominated by growth and business decisions that were made for the purpose of improving communities for all of its inhabitants. The intention was not to set out to destroy low income properties, although in some cases, that happened. The intention was to improve the community for all of its citizens. Annexation was prevalent then, and in many cases, it improved the services for the residents living there. The Hayward Airport was created through eminent domain of four large properties. Several properties were displaced with the advent of BART, the building of Sunset High School, and the widening of A street. Even the failed Foothill freeway, displaced people as homes were acquired. These occurrences did not happen just in our local area. Similar occurrences were prevalent throughout the country.

* The racial issue

In this era of social justice, we tend to view issues with a different lens than that which was prevalent many years ago. That being said, the destruction of Russell City had repercussions on all races and ethnicities residing there, not merely a select few. This was an issue of poverty, but also of relatives and neighbors locating in an area together which was affordable and accessible to jobs. The residents may have had limited resources, but they viewed themselves as a cohesive group with no racial divides (a condition which would benefit all of us to adopt in today's world). In Megan Wilkinson's book, Mr. Garron said that there were no prejudices in Russell City, that everyone treated each other with respect. (p.80). Reverend Green recalled that there was no racial tension, that everyone got along well with each other. He also stated that too often the Black/Hispanic presence of Russell City is played up while the Whites get overlooked. (p.86)

In 1959, the City of Hayward passed a unanimous resolution affirming that "no person applying to buy, rent or lease quarters in any housing in Hayward constructed with public assistance, either direct or indirect ... shall be subjected to discrimination or segregation because of his race, creed, color, national origin, religious or political opinions, or affiliation. Buster Brooks, a Russell City resident, called the resolution, "a great achievement in eliminating discrimination in housing in our area." [Oakland Tribune, 6/14/1959].

*The issue of the affect on Russell City residents

At this point, we lack any real evidence that people's lives were not improved (for the most part) by being relocated to other communities. In fact, the opposite is most likely true. In this writer's experience, two former Russell City families relocated to my neighborhood. The homes were newly built in 1951 and were small, well built, 3 bedroom homes on a quiet street. Another Russell City family moved into the neighborhood in the 1950's and were my neighbors for many years.

The County oversaw the relocation and made sure that each family was placed in a safe, decent and sanitary home [Daily Review, 3/15/1961). They were also interviewed a year later to find out how they were doing. Megan Wilkinson, in her book, What Ever Happened to Russell City, interviewed a few former residents or children of former residents in 2002. When asked the question about their feelings about the relocation, responses were mixed. Dave Bassard said he thought the change was good for a lot of people. It forced them to re-evaluate their lives and adjust. The transition's effect was dependent on how you looked at the situation, how your attitude was toward the situation. (page74). Reverend Green thought that what happened to Russell City may have been a blessing in disguise. He said no one should live the way they did in Russell City-the buildings and sanitation systems were serious problems. He said that the relocation potentially forced some people to get out of their complacency and evaluate what they could do with their lives. Many people did very well after leaving Russell City. (p.88). Mrs. Tingley said that she felt the move was good for her parents because they were getting old and the ranch was too big for them.

There were also those who felt the move was difficult, mainly for emotional reasons. Mrs. Moreno said that it was hard because she had to make new friends. She felt it was harder on older people because they didn't have a place to feel comfortable anymore, a place where everyone knew them (p.131).

The residents were dispersed to several different locations throughout the County during their relocation, and this may also be a factor in their current status and well-being. However, based on the 2020 census, at least in Hayward, the poverty rate is a mere 8.35%, below the national average. And if we break it down by race or ethnicity, the poverty rate of Blacks was at 9.72%, Whites 9.55% and Hispanics 9.24%. All of those rates are similar to one another. It was also noted that High School graduation rates were slightly higher for Blacks than Whites, and with Blacks only slightly behind Whites for Bachelor's Degrees. These statistics appear to indicate that the gaps in equality are narrowing, and that people, in general, are succeeding in their lives.

*The issue of compensation.

Again, there were mixed responses to the question of whether people were fairly compensated. There were those who felt they were not properly paid for their properties; amounts stated in Megan Wilkinson's book varied widely. A Board appointed Citizen's Committee was formed with recommendations that the board carry out its avowed intention of basing the prices paid for land on a "team of independent appraisers." (Daily Review 11/23/1962) One comment made in 1964 stated that 22 properties had been purchased, all within the appraised value (Daily Review 7/29/64).

Marvin Casalina, the individual who was hired to handle the buying of Russell City properties, was interviewed in an Oakland Tribune article. He stated that "many people have a misconception of the value of their property and that is almost always on the high side." He also pointed out that with all of the public agencies he had represented, he did not recall a single one which had attempted to obtain the property for less than fair market value. He stated that the amount to be paid for the property was generally determined by the agency, usually on the basis of at least two independent appraisals where he, Casalina, was retained. (Oakland Tribune 11/7/1965)

*Hayward's part in the demise of Russell City

Evidence clearly shows that Hayward <u>was not</u> the responsible party in the destruction of Russell City, although its problems were well known to Hayward. As far back as the 1940's, Russell City residents were seeking to get clean water from Hayward, but to no avail. The problem was that Hayward's water pipelines only came within 2000 feet of Russell City, and the residents of Russell City could not afford to make the necessary connections to extend the pipeline. In 1949, Hayward offered to bring water to Russell City if Alameda County would pay ½ the cost. [Daily Review 9/14/1949]. The residents of Russell City even wrote to the Governor, Earl Warren, seeking his support in urging the County to pay its share, but the County did not.

Early in 1960, Russell City was said to have posed a headache for officials of the County and an assortment of other public agencies. The Mayor of Hayward felt that Hayward had a moral obligation to take the problem on, and urged the County to do something.

Later on, in 1960, at a Hayward City Council meeting, the issue of Russell City again emerged. Mayor Dettenreider wanted to appoint a committee focused on the "interest in the welfare of these people, the welfare of the people of the city of Hayward, and the welfare of the people of the County." [Daily Review 8/23/1960].

It was not until 1961 that the County, after urging from Hayward, multiple Grand Juries, and other entities, finally approved a Federal Urban Renewal Project. The object was to "transform Russell City into a thriving industrial park and to relocate residents in homes that were decent, safe, and sanitary". [Daily Review 3/15/1961]. Under the act, families were eligible to purchase homes costing up to \$10,000 on a 40-year-mortgage. At that time, it was noted that 212 residents were on welfare, and rents were approximately \$15 a month on substandard housing. Hayward was not working in tandem with the County on the redevelopment, because "the Urban Renewal Administration would not look with favor on a joint exercise of powers by Hayward and Alameda County as a Renewal Agency. It wants to look to one jurisdiction for responsibility. [Bangt Torssell, representative of the Federal Housing and Homes Finance Agency; Daily Review 3/15/1961]

The County hired Harold Davis to oversee the redevelopment project and Attorney Marvin Casalina handled the buying of properties from Russell City residents. Each resident received a stipend for moving expenses (up to \$200) and relocation to a suitable home within several cities within the County. Out of 186 families that were relocated, 86 went to Hayward, 38 to East Oakland, and 28 to North Oakland. The reminder was spread throughout the County, in Castro Valley, Fremont, Livermore, Newark, San Leandro, San Lorenzo and Union City.

To sum up, Russell City was unincorporated land owned by Alameda County, not Hayward. The County was the entity that purchased the properties, that relocated residents, and then sold the property to a private industrial firm, Cabot, Cabot and Forbes. It was not until August of 1968 that the area was annexed to Hayward.

*The issue of reparations:

The City of Hayward offered an apology in November of 2021 for the part that they may have played in the destruction of Russell City and for "institutional racism". In this era of social justice, it should be noted that in rereading the City's apology, they clearly left out the White families who resided there, and it would appear to suggest that there is still a racial bias in our community. The City of Hayward has also certainly honored the people of Russell City in numerous ways over the years. There is a yearly Russell City Blues celebration funded by the City, a mural depicting Russell City stands in the downtown area, a \$15,000 plaque is being placed in Heritage Park, and there are a series of historical signs erected in a pocket park in the Industrial Area where Russell City once stood. How many of us who have lived or grown up in a treasured Hayward neighborhood have been honored in such a way? In our viewpoint, Hayward has been experiencing a tremendous amount of guilt for something that they are not guilty of. No amount of giving can undo past history. As previously stated, we live in an era of social justice, but social justice should not be a term relegated to just one race or one people. If we are to live together as a community, we must learn to consider all people as part of that community. All of us as citizens experience the repercussions of decisions made in years past. People deserve equal and fair opportunities to better their lives, but all of us will have different outcomes, many of which are beyond our control.

On the issue of Russell City, there is no evidence that Hayward is responsible for, or that it should continue its guilt plagued efforts to make it up to, Russell City residents. The citizens of Russell City were properly reimbursed for their properties, had their moving expenses paid for, and were given

additional help in locating and obtaining new and better homes. These people are and will continue to be the resilient, hard working people that they are, and will continue to embrace their old community and its connections.

CONCLUSIONS:

It is our belief that history is a teacher. We cannot change it, but our job is to learn from it. The demise of Russell City was clearly an issue that touched people is an emotional way. It came about during a period of growth in Alameda County, and became a project of the County's Redevelopment Agency. However, as a physical reality, the lives of many of the residents were improved as they were fully compensated for their land, offered good property purchase options and were helped to find new, safer and more sanitary homes throughout the County.

In dealing with the present issue of reparations, we hope that the City will clearly consider the statements being made here, and will not fall prey to unreasonable expectations of anyone, especially those who are not from nor have ever resided in Russell City. It has been more than 50 years since the events of Russell City took place, and now it has reemerged as a current event. Being that the City was not responsible for what happened, and that the City has gone above and beyond in honoring the Russell City community, along with the fact that Russell City citizens were already compensated by the County many years ago, we are strongly opposed to any direct financial reparations being made by the City of Hayward.

Respectfully submitted,

Members of Hayward Concerned Citizens,

Susan Gehlke, Linda Cardott, Claire Dugan, Donna Whitmore

From: TJ
Sent: Friday, May 13, 2022 12:29 PM
To: List-Mayor-Council <List-Mayor-Council@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Hayward City Council 5/14/22 Budget Work Session, Agenda item #1, File# WS-22-014

Dear Mayor and City Council:

While you are in the process of deciding next year's budget, I wanted to share my thoughts about a current project the city is funding: The Hayward People's Budget.

First of all, the timing seems poorly conceived. In what appears to be an effort to appease the demands representing a small minority, the city used covid relief money, which could have helped our emergency responders, small businesses, community non-profits, mentally challenged, and unhoused individuals in desperate need in the wake of the past two tumultuous years. There are some items as well on the Strategic Roadmap that are labeled as "needs funding". Could the People's Budget funds have been better appropriated to those projects?

Secondly, there were so many great and practical ideas for projects that were submitted online by residents, clearly liked by those in their sectors, but were weeded out by the delegates due to not fitting criteria or budget. I truly hope the city has kept a database of the ideas from the hearts and minds of their collective community for future reference and possible implementation.

Third, Chabot College students were allowed to submit project ideas to consider. Whether or not Chabot is in a shared sector, the students themselves may not all be Hayward residents or reside in that particular sector. So the rules were "bent" to include them in the allotted budget for that sector. Does this mean that church congregations, Cal State East Bay, etc. should be allowed the same opportunity?

The traditional goal of participatory budgeting is for local residents to discuss their collective needs and decide what projects to fund. The emphasis here is on NEEDS, not whims. NEEDS require more money than what was allotted to this project. The majority of people in Hayward don't want parties, outdoor movie nights, community gardens, etc. They want and need safety improvements in the form of better lighting, repaired

sidewalks, traffic signals, crosswalks, speed bumps, and crime reduction efforts; none of which were allowed in this exercise.

I realize the intended goal is to bring community together, but if you have studied local social media you'll note that what unites communities are shared common concerns. The Patrick Avenue traffic calming project united a community. The Abode Housing project on Depot Road united a community. They were not supportive of these implemented ideas, but they rallied together out of shared concern as a result.

As I heard a couple of council members remark at recent meetings, there is a lot of presumption and misinformation among our Hayward residents. They need to be better informed of what's happening in our city. I feel the City Hall To You virtual and in-person pop-up events were a positive means of getting the word across and I hope to see more of this in the future. It prompts neighbors to start a conversation and update their neighbors. That is where you will accomplish the goal of connecting community.

Respectfully submitted, TJ HAYWARD CONCERNED CITIZENS

#	MCC	QUESTIONS / COMMENTS	STAFF RESPONSE	DEPARTMENT
1	Márquez	Pg 6 - Comment: Org chart for Public Works and Utilities is unsustainable	 It is not clear if the comment relates to the Department's size, the number of divisions, and the scope of responsibilities, or if it relates to the number of vacancies and the difficulties to recruit for certain positions especially in supervisory and management ranks. Regarding the size, the Department is made up of divisions that logically belong together and work synergistically to move the goals and directions of the City Council and to implement the infrastructure needs of the City and related services. It's also interesting to note that the Department today is about two-thirds the number of divisions and staff that has been in the past decades. At one time Public Works used to have well over 200 staff and included a number of disparate divisions such as Building Inspection, Streets, Landscape Maintenance, Fleet, and Facilities. In mid-1990s first Building Inspections was move out and joined the newly formed Community & Economic Development Department. Later on Fleet and Facilities divisions were moved to Finance. In mid-2000s Streets Maintenance and Landscape Maintenance division were moved out of Public Works as currently configured brings together divisions that add value to each other and work interactively. If the comment relates to the current and on-going vacancies in the Department, staff agree that such a high level of vacancies, particularly in the management ranks, is not sustainable. 	PW&U
			However, the root cause of the long-term vacancies, and the inability to attract qualified candidates is not related to the size or complexities of the Department but to the market realities, especially after the start of the pandemic over two years ago. City	

			Manager's Office, HR, and PW&U are working on plans to address some of these issues and reduce the number of vacancies.	
2	Márquez	Pg 33 - Please add that Measure A was renewed by voters in June of 2016 as Measure D	Acknowledged, and will incorporate in the Adopted budget document.	Finance
3	Márquez	Pg 34 - Date for Measure C is incorrect it was passed in 2014	Acknowledged, and will incorporate in the Adopted budget document.	Finance
4	Márquez	When will TOT increase be actualized?	Adjustment of the TOT rate up to the voter approved ceiling of 12% is at the discretion of Council. If Council would like staff to recommend a new rate, we can put some work into what we feel is most appropriate for the market. Please let us know if that is Council's desire.	Finance
5	Márquez	Pg 37 - Status of filling existing vacancies	HR is working diligently in filling current vacancies. We are working with departments directly and exploring hiring incentives for hard to fill positions, reviewing minimum qualifications to possibly broaden the pool of candidates, mapping our processes in order to pinpoint the bottle necks. Proposed structures and staffing models will come as a proposal from our department.	Human Resources
6	Márquez	Why are our reserves being held at 23% when our policy is 20%?	Council's Reserve Policy sets a minimum goal of no less than two months of city operating costs or at least 20% of budget General Fund operating expenses. It is not inappropriate for the City to maintain a reserve above the policy minimum. Maintaining a bit more than the 20% will assist in maintaining compliance with the policy should the City have expenditures higher or revenues lower than anticipated requiring a use of reserves to balance the year.	Finance
7	Márquez	Pg 39 - Please explain RPTTF pass thru and annual	Redevelopment Property Tax Trust Fund was created and is administered by the county auditor-controller to hold property tax revenues related to each former redevelopment agency for the benefit of the holders of former redevelopment agency enforceable obligations. The City receives annual remittances from the County for administration of the former RDA/Successor Agency.	Finance
8	Márquez	Pg 41 - Please explain RPTTF 350,000 for Economic Dev Fund	The RPTTF is accounted for the in the General Fund. The General Fund includes a transfer of \$350,000 in Economic Development	Finance

			Fund each fiscal year to support economic development efforts, such as the distribution of small business grants.	
9	Márquez	Pg 42 - Please define UAL, it's defined later in the document but not on this page.	Acknowledged, and will incorporate in the Adopted budget document. The definition of UAL will also be added to the document Glossary.	Finance
10	Márquez	Pg 44 - When will Council discuss spending the additional funds Measure C is bringing in over 10 million?	Staff is presenting the Council Budget and Finance Committee (June 2022) with potential options for consideration of future programming of Measure C funding. Committee option recommendations will be explored by staff and presented to the full Council for consideration at a future Council meeting at which time the remaining members of Council will also be able to provide input.	Finance
11	Márquez	Pg 46 - What's the plan to bring down accrued leave balance of 7.45 million?	The table below provides a historical overview of the accrued leave balance over the last 10 years. As shown, the accrued leave balance has come down by \$2.0 million over the prior fiscal year. The FY 2021 accrued leave balance is in line with pre-pandemic levels and consistent with a city our size. Additionally, each labor group includes vacation/leave caps which employees have property rights to, to assist in managing accrued leave balances.	Finance

				Unfunded	Change from	
				Liability	Prior Year	
			FY 2010	\$9,250,970	\$1,773,756	
			FY 2011	\$10,497,994	\$1,247,024	
			FY 2012		\$203,575	
				\$10,701,569		
			FY 2013	\$8,589,354	(\$2,112,215)	
			FY 2014	\$7,230,041	(\$1,359,313)	
			FY 2015	\$7,104,541	(\$125,500)	
			FY 2016	\$7,660,340	\$555,799	
			FY 2017	\$7,894,439	\$234,099	
			FY 2018	\$7,913,945	\$19,506	
			FY 2019	\$8,347,418	\$433,473	
			FY 2020	\$9,511,174	\$1,163,756	
			FY 2021	\$7,452,742	(\$2,058,432)	
12	Márquez	Pg 55 - What's transfer for cost allocation at	The transfer in	of \$2,458,000 is an	n allocation of costs for central	Finance
		\$2,458M		•	ey, etc.) to operating	
					use and other factors. The	
					osts from departments that	
			•	• •	rating departments that conduct	
				•	ary to serve the community. The	
					present (a) incurred for a	
			-	· ·	ing more than one cost gnable to the cost objectives	
			•		fort disproportionate to the	
					ect costs," as used herein, applies	
					the central service	
			departments.			
13	Márquez	Pg 59 - VLF Swap what is this?		ense Fee is a tax in	nposed by the State on the	Finance
					Fees are collected and	
				-	d cities. The word "swap" should	
			be removed fro	om the revenue tak	ole.	

14	Márquez	Pg 60 - Photo red light, Is this outstanding fees?	While the City no longer has photo red light cameras, the City	Finance
			continues to receive revenue from past photo red light camera	
			violations. No new citations have been issued for several years.	
			This revenue is a portion of red-light fines that the City receives	
			from the Judicial Council of California and the Superior Court of	
			California.	
15	Márquez	Pg 86 - What's the status of reaching 15% hybrid or	Staff will provide a response as part of the department	Maintenance
		electric vehicles?	presentation. Once the final vehicles ordered in FY22 arrive, the	Services
			Fleet EV/hybrid make-up will be 16%. Once vehicle-production	
			and availability normalize post-pandemic, staff plans to	
			recommend an increased EV/hybrid goal.	
16	Márquez	Pg 92 - ISF 1 position what is the position?	The proposed FY 2023 Operating Budget includes the proposed	Finance / Human
			addition of 1.0 FTE HR Analyst (2-yr Limited Term) specifically to	Resources
			do work associated with implementation of the City's Safety Gap	
			Analysis.	
17	Márquez	Pg 128 - The .5 Senior Secretary in Economic Dev is	Yes, 1.0 FTE Senior Secretary is allocated between Economic	Finance / CMO
		that also shared with Comm/Media	Development (0.5 FTE) and Comm/Media (0.5 FTE).	
18	Márquez	Pg 132 - What is Principal Retirement at \$2,070,000	The \$2,070,000 is the principal payment for the 2016 RDA Tax	Finance / CMO
			Allocation Bonds. The RDA Tax Allocation Bonds funded projects	
			including improvements to public parking in the downtown area,	
			and expansion of public areas. "Principal Retirement" should be	
			changed to "Principal Payment", and will be updated for FY 2023	
			Adopted Operating Budget.	
19	Márquez	Pg 160 - Have we recruited for a check planner?	The ask is not related to any vacant positions that we would need	Development
			to recruit to fill. The ask is to augment the plan check and	Services
			inspection services budget for which we have existing open	
			contracts that extend through 2024. Additional details will be	
			provided as part of the presentation. The outside plan check and	
			inspection services contracts allow the City to expand and	
			contract with demands for service related to development	
			activity.	
20	Márquez	Pg 172 - Are the \$245,000 in bank fees associated	That is correct. The \$245,000 is related to the increase in online	Finance/ PW&U
		with paying water bill online?	payment of utility bills. \$170,000 is proposed to be added to the	

25	Halliday	Faro should be added to Sister City list.	Acknowledged, and will incorporate in the Adopted budget document.	Finance
			A column can be added for ease of use; however, this will make it very small on the page to fit within the margins.	
			entirety). The rates were fixed at the time of issuance and are not tied to an index or subject to fluctuations in the market. This is a very nuanced response and staff can discuss live.	
24	Márquez	Pg 275 Can the debt loans with a variable be refinanced for a fix rate and please add a column with the total annual debt payments?	The Measure C debt, while the interest rates vary for the debt issuance (the debt is issued as 20 separate annual serial bonds, meaning each year one of the series matures and is paid off in its	Finance
23	Márquez	Pg 243 - What's the status of my request to offer hiring incentives for dispatch and other hard to fill positions?	The Human Resources Department is working with the Police Department. Staff is be prepared to bring recommendations to City Council before the end of June for hiring incentives for the communications center. Staff will also work with the Public Works Department to develop a plan for hard to fill positions.	Human Resources
22	Márquez	Pg 208 - Have we secured funding to finish strategic plan process, also noting letter of support received by Library Commission Chair Anika Patterson?	The FY 2023 operating budget will include \$75K for a comprehensive strategic plan for the Library.	Library
21	Márquez	Pg 185 - Please elaborate on \$100,000 for annual health screens and EMS Director Services. Congrats on bringing OT time cost down substantially!!	Staff will provide a response as part of the department presentation.	Fire
			Fund 605 bank fees account and \$75,000 is proposed to be added to the Fund 610 bank fees account which is a total of \$245,000. This \$245,000 is intended to cover approximately 6 months of new fees associated with online payments and other miscellaneous related expenses with our new bill payment vendor, Invoice Cloud. The other half of this first year's expenses will be funded by CIP Project. It is important to note that a significant reason the increase is needed is due to the fact that the \$3.95 credit card transaction fee is being eliminated, so that revenue will no longer be offsetting this expense.	

26	6 Halliday What are the policy options for use of the excess RPTT revenue?		 Under the Real Property Transfer Tax – Threshold for Recurring & One-time Revenue – It is recommended that Council establish a baseline threshold of \$10.3 million to be used to fund reoccurring City operations. Transfer Tax revenues received in excess of this amount should be considered one-time revenues and used in accordance with the City's policy on the Use of One-Time Revenue for One-Time Expenditures. The One-Time Use Policy states that If the General Fund reserves are at or above the level required by policy one-time revenues will be designated for the uses noted below with the following guidelines: 			Finance
				% 50% 50%	Designation 95% would be allocated to fund the City's unfunded liabilities 5% would be allocated to build General Fund Reserves 70% would be programmed for capital infrastructure needs 20% would be appropriated for emerging needs 10% or up to \$1M would be appropriated for economic development needs	
27	Halliday	What is the difference between RPTT and Property Transfer Tax?	one	and t	al Property Transfer Tax) and Property Transfer Tax are he same. The FY 2023 Adopted Budget will be updated tent reference throughout the document.	Finance
28	Halliday	Why is there a FY 23 decrease of in Emergency Facilities tax?	Histo	orical	orrection from an administrative error in FY 2022. and future projected Emergency Facilities Tax averages \$1.8 and \$2.1 million/annually.	Finance
29	Halliday	Why is there a decrease of 16.92% in OPEB liability contribution?	liabi FY 20 Acco	lity, a 022, t ording	cy continues to fully fund the OPEB ARC, the long-term and ARC decreases each fiscal year. For the first time in the City fully funded the OPEB ARC (total of \$7.9 million). g to the City's actuary the OPEB ARC for FY 2023 budget 2 million.	Finance

30	Halliday	Why are we funded at 207% of Workers Comp when recommended amount is 80%?	Several years ago, the Workers' Compensation Fund was severely underfunded. In an effort to improve funding levels, an additional percentage was applied on top of the standard rate. This should have been adjusted in a previous fiscal year, but was discovered by staff as part of analysis after the proposed budget was produced. As a result of this methodology, the Workers' Compensation Fund is over funded by 200%. Since the City has achieved funding level above the recommended 80 percent, analysis of methodology will be compared with the funding strategies outlined in the actuary. It is anticipated that staff will reduce the Worker's Compensation rates, resulting in a significant reduction in contributions from all City operating funds to adjust to a more appropriate funding balance level.	Finance
31	Halliday	What progress is being made on the city business license tax revision?	Staff has done some initial work, but has prioritized other efforts until Council decides to pursue the ballot measure to update the ordinance and change tax rates.	Finance
32	Halliday	Why is there a large reduction in working capital from Facilities Management?	These need to be adjusted. There is a double counting of some expenses, most notably debt service, in the working capital calculation. These will be updated for adoption.	Finance / Maintenance Services
33	Halliday	Describe the need for four additional positions in HR.	In October 2021, the Human Resources Department engaged in a comprehensive organizational study that would culminate in the development of the department's 5-year strategic plan. The study will be finalized by August 2022, but staffing structure recommendations were received in early April. Other systemic, procedural, and strategy recommendation will be finalized by August. The recommendations take into consideration comprehensive research of comparable Cities and Cities known to have highly functioning Human Resources teams, industry best practices, employee feedback, and how to best support the City's Strategic Roadmap.	Human Resources

	The City of Hayward maintains an FTE count of approximately 915. The current Human Resource to employee ratio is approximately 1.3. This is well below the industry average/median (SHRM 2017 Benchmarking Report) of 2.6 and 1.58 respectively. Historically, Human Resources has been viewed as an ancillary function as the funding/staffing levels suggest.	
	Adequate funding for Human Resource staff supports execution of the City-wide mission by providing the foundation for overall organizational health and welfare. It enables staff to proactively address the challenges we face, one of them being recruitment and retention.	
	According to the preliminary study, it recommends an organizational structure that provides for 18 directly funded FTE and one program-funded FTE, for HR-to-employee ratio of approximately 1.9. Conceptually, this structure allows for cost controls to be realized by providing sufficient staff to mitigate risk proactively, performing work at the lowest manageable level, and concentrating staff in areas which will produce cost savings in other areas of the organization.	
	The preliminary study also recommends an organizational structure that allows for operational best practices, such as organizational continuity and cross-training, manageable span of control, career growth, development, retention, and succession planning.	
	HR department proposes a phased in approach in order to achieve the optimal staffing levels described in the preliminary study. We propose prioritizing hiring for positions that would help support priorities of the first and second years of the strategic plan which will focus on recruitment, retention,	

			employee/leadership development, organizational development, and safety/compliance	
34	Halliday	Where will funds for the Russell City historical review and recommendations come from?	Fund 405 in the Proposed FY 2023-2032 CIP includes \$150,000 intended for use on this effort.	Finance
35	Halliday	How much total is allocated and from what accounts for arts, events and cultural activities?	The current budget for Arts and Music is \$82,000 and is allocated out of the General Fund. The proposal is to increase the General Fund allocation to Arts and Music by \$50,000, for a total of \$132,000, which creates capacity to more fully fund the Arts & Music requests. Additionally, \$100,000 is being requested out of the General Fund to support special events. Therefore, the total general fund request for Arts & Music and Cultural Events is \$150,000.	CMO / Community Services
36	Lamnin	I thought we also had active sister cities with Portugal and Mexico?	Staff will review and update to include all active sister cities for the FY 2023 Adopted Budget.	Finance
37	Lamnin	What's causing the anticipated drop in Emergency Facilities Tax?	This is a correction from an administrative error in FY 2022. Historical and future projected Emergency Facilities Tax is approximately \$1.8 million/annually.	Finance
38	Lamnin	Is our use of vacant positions in HPD temporarily to fund the innovation approaches reflected in the salary savings calculation?	Yes.	Finance
39	Lamnin	The OPEB contribution seems to be decreasing by 16.92%, yet we are fully funding the ARC? Would you please clarify? (page 41, Table 5)	As the City continues to fully fund the OPEB ARC, the long-term liability, and ARC decreases each fiscal year. For the first time in FY 2022, the City fully funded the OPEB ARC (total of \$7.9 million). According to the City's actuary the OPEB ARC for FY 2023 budget totals \$7.2 million.	Finance
40	Lamnin	Is our worker's comp funded at 207.0 %?	Several years ago, the Workers' Compensation Fund was severely underfunded. In an effort to improve funding levels, an additional percentage was applied on top of the standard rate. This should have been adjusted in a previous fiscal year, but was discovered by staff as part of analysis after the proposed budget was	Finance

			produced. As a result of this methodology, the Workers' Compensation Fund is over funded by 200%.	
			Since the City has achieved funding level above the recommended 80 percent, analysis of methodology will be compared with the funding strategies outline in the actuary. It is anticipated that staff will reduce the Worker's Compensation rates, resulting in a significant reduction in contributions from all City operating funds to adjust to a more appropriate funding balance level.	
41	Lamnin	When is Skywest anticipated to come back to Council and Airport Committee?	The Skywest property is a standing item on the agenda for each CAC meeting and will be next discussed during the CAC meeting on June 24. The project is anticipated to be presented to Council in the fall of 2023, when rezoning of the property is submitted for consideration of approval.	CMO / PW&U
42	Lamnin	For Internal Service Funds that are anticipated to be in deficit for working capital, is there a reserve that is coving those amounts? (Ex: Facilities Management, Fleet Management, IT)	These need to be adjusted. There is a double counting of some expenses, most notably debt service, in the working capital calculation. These will be updated for adoption.	Maintenance Services / Finance
43	Lamnin	Many Departments did not include FY22 accomplishments and/or FY23 goals, are these anticipated in the final version?	No, beginning in the FY 2022 budget document we did away with individual department goals and accomplishments and incorporated them into the Strategic Roadmap section, which starts on page 14 of the proposed budget document.	Finance
44	Lamnin	Page 129, is it possible to change the Community Services paragraph to end withtransportation for residents who are seniors and/or have disabilities.	Staff will review and consider adjusting as part of the FY 2023 Adopted Budget.	CMO / Community Services
45	Lamnin	Page 130, Does the Redevelopment Successor Agency administer Rent Review and HOME?	This is an error, as the Redevelopment Successor Agency does not administer the Rent Review and HOME programs. The last sentence under this Redevelopment Successor Agency will be removed for the FY 2023 Adopted Budget.	Finance / CMO
46	Lamnin	Would you please clarify the decreases in the Housing Authority and Affordable Housing Monitoring fund? Page 131	The Housing Authority Fund Revenue primarily consists of monthly payments on first-time homebuyer loans. Many of these loans have been paid off resulting in a reduction of ongoing anticipated revenue. Additionally, years with higher revenue collection result from prepayment of the loan. The Affordable	CMO / Housing

			Housing Monitoring Fund revenue primarily consist of payment of administrative fees associated with the Multifamily Housing Revenue Bond. The FY 2021 revenue collected includes payment of administrative fees due in FY 2020 that were delayed due to COVID-19. The FY 2022 and proposed FY 2023 budget are consistent with amounts receivable under current Multifamily Housing Revenue Bond Regulatory Agreements.	
47	Lamnin	Is the increase in bank fees for utility payment implementation an ongoing fee? If so, does this technology have a benefit that offsets the cost? (page 172)	That is correct. The \$245,000 is related to the increase in online payment of utility bills. \$170,000 is proposed to be added to the Fund 605 bank fees account and \$75,000 is proposed to be added to the Fund 610 bank fees account which is a total of \$245,000. This \$245,000 is intended to cover approximately 6 months of new fees associated with online payments and other miscellaneous related expenses with our new bill payment vendor, Invoice Cloud. The other half of this first year's expenses will be funded by CIP Project. It is important to note that a significant reason the increase is needed is due to the fact that the \$3.95 credit card transaction fee is being eliminated, so that revenue will no longer be offsetting this expense.	Finance/ PW&U
48	Lamnin	Has there been any exploration of 'buying back' bags of trash from encampments to encourage clean up by the people living there?	Staff has engaged in conversations with San Jose on their "Cash for Trash" pilot program. Replicating this program in Hayward was not highlighted as a priority project through the Let's House Hayward! community engagement and planning process. As the Let's House Hayward! plan is implemented and revisited, staff can explore replicating this program further.	Maintenance Services
49	Lamnin	Is there the opportunity to utilize Downtown Streets Team to assist with Parking garage security? And/or, is there any logic to placing City vehicles in areas and during times that have been problematic?	Staff will engage with DST on this idea. There is 24/7 contract security in the Watkins garage, this began in early 2021. In 2019, staff deployed a Hayward Police patrol car in the garage as a visual crime deterrent, unfortunately, it was vandalized each time it was left overnight.	Maintenance Services

50	Lamnin	In the Police Dept. org chart, where does mental health sit?	The work on mental health calls/cases rest In YFSB and District Command. Both units are now under the newly named Community Services Division on the PD org chart.	Police
51	Lamnin	Is it possible to add in language into the HPD mission statement regarding building on the strength of the community?	HPD has contracted with a consultant to develop a new strategic plan, which will involve a new vision and mission statement. The suggestion will be taken into consideration during this process.	Police
52	Lamnin	Has there been any impact (positive or negative) regarding not having an operating Narcotics Unit?	Significant Negative Impact: With record overdoses from fentanyl in this country, the city of Hayward is not exempt. Without a narcotic unit, we are unable to proactively investigate the sources of illegal drugs and narcotics flowing into the city. We have seen an increase in commercial burglaries which stem from illegal marijuana grow operations. These operations are targeted by heavily armed criminals. A recent burglary occurred within eye sight of city hall. Video captured armed suspects attempting to burglarize an illegal marijuana grow. The absence of a narcotic unit has had a significant negative impact on criminal intelligence. Criminal intelligence is often cultivated by narcotic detectives through their investigations. Intelligence and information is not only related to the distribution and sale of illegal drug and narcotics, but often related to homicides, robberies, human trafficking, and illegal firearms. Lastly, the physical and emotional toll is immeasurable. Sex trafficking, domestic violence, and child abuse to name a few, are often associated with illegal drugs and narcotics.	Police
53	Lamnin	Is the public safety innovation team and/or Mayor's group exploring the Codac centers approach used in Rhode Island?	Additional information requested.	CMO/Police
54	Lamnin	How does AB 481 affect the CIP process for HPD?	The only affect will be the cyclical equipment replacement schedule. (Rifles, robot, etc.)	PW&U/Police
55	Lamnin	Are there updates needed to the Recycled Water section of page 258?	The text will be edited to read "The initial phase of the project, including construction of a treatment facility, storage tank, pump	PW&U

	station, and over eight miles of distribution pipeline, as well as	
	customer connections to the new recycled water system, have all	
	been completed and deliveries to customers started in March	
	2022"	

From: Zachariah Oquenda
Sent: Saturday, May 14, 2022 12:53 PM
To: CityClerk <CityClerk@hayward-ca.gov>; List-Mayor-Council <List-Mayor-Council@hayward-ca.gov>
Subject: Re: 5/14/22 Special City Council Meeting

CAUTION:This is an external email. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor and City Council,

I wanted to leave some public comments about some of the items in the 5/14 Council Special Work Session on the budget.

HEART Program

I'm grateful to see all the hard work implementing the Police Innovation Workshop's recommended policies on MIHU, MET, and Community Resource Officers. I fully support increasing investments in our dispatch center to better support our efforts in non-violent mental health and crisis response. I'd be curious to learn more about whether there is any future intended spending on expanding our HEART program. Will that money similarly come from officer vacancy savings from HPD? All around so proud of Hayward staff for their work!

Fentanyl

I wanted to speak to some implied misinformation from communications by the Chief around fentanyl dangers for law enforcement. You cannot overdose from simple exposure to any form of fentanyl, including inhalation of trace dust particles or skin contact. To overdose on fentanyl, you must ingest it or inject it. There's an ongoing fiction about such exposure risks to law enforcement that is dangerous both because it gives police more justification for their militarization and because it leads judges to hand out harsher prison sentences to those arrested with fentanyl because it supposedly puts police at such high risk. Here's an <u>article</u> that goes into more detail if you are curious to learn more about these myths perpetuated by law enforcement, including in <u>alleged incidents</u> in Alameda County which defy common sense. I know two friends who have overdosed and died on fentanyl, and I serve clients whose lives have been destroyed in the criminal justice system because of similar misinformation surrounding their fentanyl use. So getting the facts right on this topic is essential.

CARE Court

Finally, to address the Mayor's question about the CARE Court proposal by the Governor's office, the City Council should consider passing a resolution taking a position on SB 1338. The CARE Court connects a person with schizophrenia spectrum or other psychotic disorders who lack medical decision-making capacity with a court-ordered Care Plan for up to 12 months, with the possibility to extend it for an additional 12 months. The framework provides individuals with a clinically appropriate, community-based set of services and supports that are culturally and linguistically competent. This includes short-term stabilization medications, wellness and recovery supports, and connection to social services and a housing plan. Housing is an important component—finding stability and staying connected to treatment, even with the proper support, is next to impossible while living outdoors, in a tent or a vehicle. It is an evidence-based alternative to more restrictive conservatorship or incarceration.

As always, I sincerely appreciate your time and consideration of my comments. Have a good weekend.

Thanks, Zachariah

Zachariah Oquenda, Esq., M.P.P. he/him/his Planning Commissioner, Hayward Planning Commission Community Advisor, Hayward Community Advisory Panel to the Chief of Police