



DATE: January 24, 2018

TO: Council Infrastructure Committee

FROM: Interim Director of Public Works

SUBJECT Downtown Parking Management Plan - Recommendations

RECOMMENDATION

That the Committee reviews and provides comments on the Recommended Parking Demand Management Strategies for Downtown Hayward.

SUMMARY

The Downtown parking management plan is based on a study that identifies the existing and near-term parking needs in the Downtown and recommends strategies that maximize the supply and utilization of parking spaces. Following the receipt of feedback from the Committee and approval of Council, a year-long pilot program will be implemented in the study area to evaluate the recommendations.

BACKGROUND

In fall of 2014, BART began the implementation of paid parking at the Hayward BART station. In response, staff, with Council authorization, implemented the following interim parking strategies to mitigate potential impacts to the Downtown parking supply:

- 4-hour parking restrictions were implemented in the City Hall parking structure and in the commercial and residential areas west of the BART station
- 2-hour on-street parking restrictions were implemented within a quarter mile radius of the Downtown Hayward BART station
- Enforcement was enhanced to ensure that time restrictions were being observed

Apart from the implemented interim strategies, long-term, comprehensive parking policies were deemed critical to the growth and development of the Downtown Hayward area. To identify long-term parking management strategies, a consulting firm, CDM Smith (CDM), was selected to work with staff to conduct a focused analysis of parking supply and demand in Downtown Hayward.

CDM was tasked with ensuring existing regulations aligned with current parking demand, and proposing updates to those regulations and strategies to improve parking demand management in the Downtown. Based on this focused study, a detailed set of comprehensive parking management strategies and policies were developed.

The study focused on both peak period occupancy and high demand areas during off-peak periods (See Page 3 of Attachment II). Some key findings include:

- As expected, the midday period (12:00 PM) in the Downtown consistently displayed the highest parking occupancy
- On-street parking occupancy was highest in the Downtown business core area along B Street, A Street, Watkins Street and Main Street with peak occupancies exceeding practical capacity of 85%
- High demand was also observed in the residential areas to the west of the BART station
- Off-street parking facilities, such as the municipal lots and the City Hall Garage, had 49% parking occupancy, indicating that off-street parking was largely available Downtown during weekday peak periods
- During weekends, off-street parking facilities, such as the Cinema Place Garage and Muni Lots in the Downtown core area, exceeded a practical capacity of 85%

Additionally, the upcoming residential and mixed-use projects promise to transform Downtown Hayward into an attractive, vibrant, regional and community center that provides opportunities for commerce, shopping, services, and entertainment. This transformation would increase the need for parking. The purpose of the study was to improve parking convenience for customers, provide viable parking options for employers, and protect on-street parking in residential areas from intrusion by both BART patrons and Downtown Hayward employees.

The study built upon the initial 2015 report that provided an analysis of parking space occupancy and utilization of both on-street and off-street public parking facilities owned and operated by the City in Downtown Hayward and the nearby BART station area. These observations formed the basis for the development of comprehensive long-term strategies and policies. The study also reviewed the best practices in parking management and recommended strategies, such as time restrictions and residential and business parking permits, as tools for demand management.

DISCUSSION

The findings and recommendations of the study are incorporated in Hayward Downtown Area Parking Management Plan (Attachment II). It includes the following components:

1. Parking Time Restrictions

Time restrictions would be used as an efficient parking management policy to shift the parking demand from overutilized on-street facilities to off-street facilities and increase turnover in high demand areas. The following strategies and recommendations were developed for on-street and off-street facilities after extensive analysis of the existing parking behavior throughout the study area (See Page 7 of Attachment II). The recommendations are also developed in a way to provide unrestricted parking to the residents and employees with permits in certain areas. Refer to Section 2 for further information on Residential and Business permits.

On-Street Restrictions

One-Hour parking

One-hour parking restrictions are recommended in the Downtown core area on B Street and Main Street where parking is in high demand.

One-hour time restrictions will increase turnover in the prime locations in the Downtown Hayward commercial area to accommodate short-term customers/visitors. These restrictions would also discourage long-term employee parking and maximize customer parking.

Two-Hour parking with permits that allow unrestricted parking to residents

Two-hour parking restrictions are recommended on the streets surrounding the Downtown Hayward core area along A Street, Watkins Street, C Street, and Montgomery Avenue.

The mixed residential and commercial land uses in this area create a high demand for parking. Two-hour restrictions would discourage long-term employee parking in core areas and incentivize them to use municipal lots where they can park unrestricted with permits. Residents with permits would not be subjected to time restrictions in this area.

Two-Hour parking with permits that allow unrestricted parking to residents and employees

Two-hour parking restrictions are also recommended on B Street and Grand Street west of the BART station.

This area constantly attracts BART patrons due to its close proximity to the station. Additionally, this area has mixed residential and commercial land uses. The proposed two-hour restrictions would discourage long-term BART parking. Since the municipal lots are not in accessible distance, residents and employees with permits would not be subjected to on-street time restrictions in this area.

Four-Hour parking with permits that allow unrestricted parking to residents

Four-hour parking restrictions are recommended in the residential area west of Grand Street.

BART patrons heavily impact the residential area west of Grand Street. Four-hour parking restrictions would discourage long-term BART parking. Residents with permits would not be subjected to time restrictions in this area.

Off-Street Restrictions

Four-Hour parking with permits that allow unrestricted parking to employees

Four-hour parking restrictions are recommended in all the municipal lots. Business employees with permits would not be subjected to time restriction in these lots. Also, a limited number of spaces would be reserved for employees in the Cinema Place garage.

Four-hour parking restrictions would simplify the complex time restrictions currently in place at these facilities. Additionally, providing business permits would provide viable parking options for employees and incentivize them to not use high demand on-street parking.

2. Permit Parking Policy

Permit parking programs are effective parking demand management tools that ensure efficient use of the City's limited public parking resources. Because many of the City's on-street parking resources are in high demand, employees, residents, and visitors all compete for the same spaces. Parking permits can be used to manage this demand by directing user groups, such as employees and residents, into the spaces most appropriate for their needs. Two types of permits are proposed: a) residential permits and b) business or employee permits. These strategies were developed after extensive benchmarking and discussions with many cities that have successfully implemented parking permit programs in the Bay Area, such as Oakland, San Francisco, Berkeley, Emeryville, San Leandro, Union City, San Jose, Palo Alto and Sacramento. In all cases, the proposed pricing policies are staff's recommendations. Staff would appreciate the Committee's comments and direction.

Residential Parking Permits

With the continuing growth in and around Downtown Hayward and the high level of parking utilization associated with the BART station, there is a need to consider a Residential Preferential Parking (RPP) permit program. This will protect on-street parking from intrusion by BART patrons and Downtown Hayward employees. The program is designed to discourage residents from using street parking for more than one car per household.

Pricing Policy:

- First permit free, second permit \$150 per year
- Limit of two permits per household
- Guest permits – 5-day limit - \$5.00 per permit

Because the City has taken the initiative to implement this RPP zone, unlike other zones where residents initiate the request, the first permit is proposed to be free of charge. Other Bay Area cities charge anywhere from \$20 to \$160 for second permits. The City's proposed pricing of \$150 for second permits reflects the unique need to balance parking requirements in areas of diverse land use, and to discourage multiple vehicle ownership in Downtown Hayward, which is a transit-oriented zone.

Business Parking Permits

A new Business Parking Permit program is proposed to accommodate Downtown Hayward business employees in off-street parking facilities and designated zones to the west of the BART station. These permits will shift long-term employee parking away from highly utilized on-street parking facilities.

Pricing Policy:

- 0-5 Permits - \$25 per year per permit
- 5-10 Permits - \$40 per year per permit
- 10-20 Permits - \$60 per year per permit
- Limit of 20 permits per business

The proposed permit prices are relatively inexpensive to encourage participation by businesses. The charges increase with the number of employees per business to more equitably distribute permits amongst all Downtown Hayward businesses. The limit of 20 permits is proposed since, currently, out of seventy-one employers in Downtown Hayward, only eleven have more than twenty employees and these employers typically have their own off-street parking. Staff would appreciate the Committee's comments and direction.

3. Enforcement

Enforcement is a necessary component of a successful parking management system. Field observations and analysis of citations indicate that enhanced enforcement efforts aided by new technology and additional staffing would help achieve better levels of parking access for all users.

Technology

A wide range of potential technology applications were reviewed to manage parking resources more efficiently. Purchase and utilization of enforcement vehicles equipped with License Plate Recognition (LPR) equipment would greatly enhance enforcement efforts.

The LPR system aids enforcement by replacing the conventional "chalking" method. It would dramatically improve the efficiency of current enforcement efforts.

Staffing

Currently, parking enforcement efforts citywide are conducted primarily by a single contract employee who is tasked with enforcing the existing eight RPP areas, the Downtown area and the South Hayward BART RPP area. Additionally, the upcoming two major developments near Downtown Hayward (Lincoln Landing and Maple Main) would require expansion of the planned RPP or new RPP zones. Staff recommends adding additional enforcement personnel if the Committee chooses to implement the Downtown RPP and Business Parking Permit programs.

Finances

A detailed financial analysis of the existing parking administration costs, citation revenues, and enforcement expenditures was conducted to understand current revenues and costs. The historic information on parking revenues and expenses, proposed staffing plan, and enforcement requirements were used to create a five-year projection of the Parking Management Program budget:

- The analysis of current parking administration, citation processing, and enforcement data showed a net revenue loss of \$(47,495) for FY 2017-18;
- The purchase of a LPR equipped enforcement vehicle is projected to increase citation revenues in FY 2018-19;
- Due to the capital expenditure requirements, a net revenue loss of \$38,571 is initially projected;
- The proposed addition of a second enforcement position would increase net revenues to \$141,000 per year in FY 2019-20; and
- A positive net revenue impact is projected after the addition of second enforcement personnel and LPR equipped vehicle as follows: \$61,281 for FY 2019-20; \$203,293 for FY 2020-21; and \$267,141 for FY 2021-22 was projected

4. Wayfinding

A coordinated wayfinding system, better directional signage, and signs identifying parking lots and structures would improve the use of the off-street parking. Ideally, this program would be implemented when the Downtown Hayward parking restrictions and the RPP and Business Parking Permit programs begin.

STRATEGIC INITIATIVES

This agenda item supports the Complete Streets Strategic Initiative. The purpose of the Complete Streets initiative is to build streets that are safe, comfortable, and convenient for everyone regardless of age or ability, including motorists, pedestrians, bicyclists and public transportation riders. This item supports the following goals and objectives:

Goal 2: Provide complete Streets that balance the diverse needs of users of the public right-of-way.

Objective 1: Increase walking, biking, transit usage, carpooling, and other sustainable modes of transportation by designing and retrofitting streets to accommodate all modes.

FISCAL IMPACT

The City currently receives revenue from parking citations, RPP permit sales, and income from the South Hayward BART Station JPA parking. The Maintenance Services Department is responsible for the administration and enforcement of these programs. The Finance Department, Transportation Division of Public Works, and Police Department also have certain areas of responsibility.

Over the five-year period beginning 2019, there would be an estimated capital expense of \$200,000, which includes Downtown Hayward RPP implementation costs (\$25,000), two LPR equipped vehicles (\$80,000 per one LPR equipped vehicle) and a Wayfinding Signage program (\$15,000).

As proposed, the RPP implementation, wayfinding signage installation, and purchase of one LPR vehicle with related technology would occur in FY 2018-19. Staff recommends adding a second LPR equipped vehicle in FY 2019-20.

The table on Page 10 of Attachment II shows both the historic revenues/costs of the parking program, a five-year projection based on the purchase of the LPR vehicle, equipment in FY 2017-18, and the addition of a second enforcement person in FY 2019-20.

PUBLIC CONTACT

Staff presented results of the preliminary parking analysis to the Council Economic Development Committee (CEDC) on April 6, 2015. The CEDC commented on the need to balance the needs of Downtown Hayward merchants, employees, and patrons, while providing flexibility to meet parking needs. Included in those suggestions was the possibility of unbundling parking requirements from new developments, a strategy where parking is sold or rented separately and results in efficient and fair usage of limited parking supply. Additional suggestions centered around enacting stricter parking limits for heavily impacted areas where parking demand is high, such as B & Main Streets, and increasing the parking supply in Downtown Hayward.

In October 2016, staff solicited comments from visitors to the Downtown Hayward area via survey; 134 surveys were completed. To complement this effort, a more detailed survey was posted on-line on the City's website, Facebook page, the social network Nextdoor, and disseminated via e-mail. Approximately 840 on-line surveys were submitted. The key element of this outreach was to work with residents and business owners to identify critical issues and gauge their reaction to the potential new pricing and parking management strategies. Residents and employees expressed interest in permit parking that would allow them to park on-street or in municipal lots without time restrictions.

During the summer of 2017, staff also conducted interviews of merchants in the Downtown Hayward area and residents in and around the Hayward BART station. In the interviews, merchants reiterated the need for providing long-term employee parking and short-term customer parking. The residents reiterated interest in on-street permit parking.

NEXT STEPS

Following receipt of feedback by Committee, staff will finalize the recommendations in a final Downtown Hayward parking management report for Council's consideration.

Staff recommends that a year-long pilot program be implemented in the study area. After the pilot program, the impacts of the proposed recommendations will be evaluated and brought before Council for further consideration to determine whether to:

- Sunset the program and adopt potential alternative management strategies; and/or
- Extend the program indefinitely by adopting into City code

Staff will present the recommendations to the Chamber's Government Relations Committee (GRC) on Monday, February 5, 2018.

Prepared by: Fred Kelley, Transportation Manager

Recommended by: Alex Ameri, Interim Director of Public Works

Approved by:



Kelly McDoo, City Manager